

**REPORT OF HPC ON THE AKADEMIS AND OTHER INSTITUTIONS
UNDER THE MINISTRY OF CULTURE**

MAY, 2014

Contents

Chapter	Page
1. A Preamble	2
2. Introduction	4
3. The Ministry Of Culture	10
4. The Three Akademies: Common Issues	22
5. Sangeet Natak Akademi	38
6. Sahitya Akademi	47
7. Lalit Kala Akademi	58
8. National School of Drama	69
9. National Galleries Of Modern Art	79
10. Zonal Cultural Centres	85
11. Indira Gandhi National Centre for the Arts	87
12. Centre for Cultural Resources and Training	92
13. Conclusions: The Larger Canvas	96
14. Recommendations	99

1. A PREAMBLE

A nation's culture resides in the hearts and in the soul of its people: Mahatma Gandhi

- 1.1 All peoples, all nations, have their own cultures. What distinguishes nations is not their economic strength – that can be compared on an international measurement of per capita income calibrated through purchasing power parity – or their social development – that too can be estimated through international scales of comparison such as the Human Development Index. These are only hierarchical differences. But in its culture, each nation is unique. That is what makes each nation equal. In a vast land like ours, our subcultures are equally distinguished from one another; our many-splendoured plurality is a blessing that we must learn to nurture. One just cannot compare one way of life with another; there indeed lies the significance of a culture. It is our diversity that makes it essential, that as a nation we pay heed to our cultural values, our cultural expressions, to our heritage and, at the same time, to our future.
- 1.2 If India were to seek its place in the comity of nations only on economic performance, it would be a serious error. The social conditions for a better world must include an intention and an ability, a desire and a capacity, to move beyond literacy to learning, from health to well being, from comfort to happiness, from prosperity to self-actualization. If we are to produce, as a nation, only what we need for our economic sufficiency, but stagnate culturally, we would be a nation of ordinary men and women. Culture is our sense of values and our way of life. It is our leap of faith into the future, as an enlightened nation. A serious fear of mediocrity must haunt us, for it is easy to slip into that state; it takes courage and effort to strive for excellence.
- 1.3 The culture of a people is amorphous; it is reflected in every aspect of their lives. It ranges from the habits of daily living to the highest expressions of human creativity. Plato is believed to have said, many centuries ago, “The soul takes nothing with her to the next world but her education and her culture.” We need to rise above the everyday, and seek what is beyond our grasp. It is in this direction that the State must lead its people. The need to be a cultured people is manifest; that the State must play its role as a catalyst is axiomatic.
- 1.4 Cultural aspirations, we must emphasise, cannot be delinked from social and economic development. The person who would listen to a classical music concert on an empty stomach would be a very rare person indeed. But in our process of social development, and the direction we take in that process, we must tread the lonely path towards setting the spirit free.

1.5 No culture has survived without patronage. In the past, such support came from royalty and the nobility. In modern society, it must come from the Government of the day. But is the State machinery able to appreciate the nuances of creativity, and to encourage, and harmonise, the many voices of human endeavour? The representatives of Government often believe that theirs is the power and the right to receive obeisance. On the other hand, our ambassadors of culture are sometimes so uncultured in their ways; some of them do not know the difference between self-actualisation and self-aggrandisement. In public positions, they must realise that they are answerable to the public, to the ordinary citizen; they are responsible for the honest utilisation of the tax payer's money. How does one then find a balance, in practical ways, between benign patronage and excessive control, between creativity and accountability, between a stolid bureaucracy and cultural freedom? Our effort will be to explore this treacherous dichotomy and propose some meeting ground.

2. INTRODUCTION

Politics is repetition. It is not change. Change is something beyond what we call politics. Change is the essence politics is supposed to be the means to bring into being: Kate Millett

2.1 Our High Powered Committee (HPC) was set up by the Ministry of Culture, Government of India, through an Office Memorandum No.8/69/2013-Akademis dated the 15th January, 2014. It was pursuant to a recommendation of the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport, Tourism and Culture in its 201st Report, presented to the Chairman, Rajya Sabha and the Speaker, Lok Sabha, on 17th October, 2013.

2.2 The Memorandum is reproduced here:

No.8/69/2013-Akademis
Government of India
Ministry of Culture

Shastri Bhavan, New Delhi
Dated the 15th January, 2014

OFFICE MEMORANDUM

Subject: Constitution of High Powered Committee (HPC) to comprehensively review the constitution as well as working of Akademies/Institutions.

As recommended by the Department-related Parliamentary Standing Committee on Transport, Tourism & Culture in its 201st Report on functioning of National Akademies and other cultural Institutions, it has been decided by the Government to constitute a High Powered Committee (HPC) to examine the issues related to the mandate, composition etc. of the cultural organizations viz. National School of Drama(NSD), Centre for Cultural Resources & Training (CCRT), Lalit Kala Akademi, Sahitya Akademi, Sangeet Natak Akademi, National Gallery of Modern Art(NGMA), Indira Gandhi National Centre of Arts(IGNCA) and Zonal Cultural Centres(ZCCs) etc. and suggest measures to monitor their performance. The composition of the Committee is as under:-

1.	Shri Abhijit Sengupta	Chairman
2.	Shri O.P.Jain	Member
3.	Shri Ratan Thiyam	Member

4.	Dr. Namwar Singh	Member
5.	Shri Sanjeev Bhargava	Member
6.	Dr. Sushma Yadav	Member
7.	Shri K.K.Mittal, Addl. Secretary, MoC	Member Secretary

The Committee may co-opt any other member, if so considered by the Committee.

TERMS OF REFERENCE

- i. To comprehensively review the constitution as well as working of these organizations.
- ii. To lay down roadmap for synergy amongst these cultural organizations under MoC and to avoid duplication in their activities.
- iii. To examine and make recommendations about management problems, lack of clarity of vision and policies, unclear distribution of authority, powers and responsibility, transparency, eliticism, accountability, coordination and strategy in these organizations.
- iv. Any other issue as may be entrusted to it by the Government.

Meetings

The committee shall meet as and when convened by the Chairman. The date and venue will be decided by the Chairman. The Committee will give its recommendations within a period of three months.

TA/DA/Honorarium

Non-Official Members will be entitled to TA/DA/Honorarium as per extant rules. Expenditure on TA/DA/Honorarium of Non-official members attending the meeting of the committee will be met by the Ministry of Culture and that of the official members by their respective offices.

(Sanjiv Mittal)
Joint Secretary (A)

- 2.3 As we were given only three months' time by the Government to write our Report, we were compelled to seek a very short extension of three weeks. We have concentrated on the most significant aspects of the functioning of these institutions, and have stressed on those changes in structure and processes which

maximise the efficient and transparent functioning of these organisations in a modern, people-friendly environment.

2.4 We are fortunate to have before us a broad adumbration of what ails our cultural administration as indicated by the Department-related Parliamentary Committee. That Committee wanted an HPC to go into the ills of our cultural administration. We also have the wisdom of three previous Reports, which have gone into the functioning of various institutions of the Ministry of Culture, especially the three Akademis. These are the reports of the:

- i. Bhabha Committee: set up by Order dated 3 March, 1964; Report submitted on 22 October, 1964;
- ii. Khosla Committee: set up by Resolution dated 19 February, 1970; Report submitted on 31 July 1972;
- iii. Haksar Committee: set up by Resolution dated 24 March, 1988; Report submitted in July 1990.

2.5 We have delved into these studies and owe a debt of gratitude to them. The recommendations of each of these Committees are at *Annexure I, II and III*. It is unfortunate that the efforts of previous HPCs do not seem to have been reflected in any significant changes in the bureaucratic systems and the style of functioning of our institutions. As we wrestled with the formalisation of our recommendations, there was a feeling that it has all been said before.

2.6 Why have there been so many Committees, so many recommendations and so little change? Similar recommendations seem to find place in each Report, the sameness is all. We had requested the Ministry of Culture for details of the action taken on each Report. The Ministry has provided us with a statement which indicates the action taken on the Haksar Committee's recommendations as in 2011 (*Annexure IV*). But in any case, many of the recommendations of that time would require a revisit today. In view of the paucity of time, we have not been able to go back in administrative history and confirm if each and every change proposed in the last three reports have been addressed by the Ministry of Culture and its institutions. What is most crucial today is that the MOC accepts that it is stuck in antediluvian systems and that change is inevitable. Indeed, it must guide that change assiduously, else the bureaucratic control centre would be 'out of sync' with the outside environment. The Ministry of Culture must be assisted in, not dissuaded from, bringing about change by the Department of Personnel and the Department of Expenditure, without whom nothing significant can be achieved in this regard. We have tried to look at possible change with a sense of the imperative. There is indeed the need for political and administrative will to bring about change; the sustenance of the hearts and minds of the people must go beyond politics into the realm of statesmanship and good governance.

- 2.7 There is a sea change in our country, outside Government, in our lifestyles, in our attitudes as a community and in our work culture. Even between the last study, by the Haksar Committee, and ours, there has been a time lag of about a quarter of a century. These 25 years have brought enormous changes to our cultural mores. The ICE – Information, Communication, Entertainment - sector as we know it today, for example, had not quite been born at the time of the Haksar Committee. The concept of cultural industries almost did not exist. Rising middle class incomes, the internet and social media, and cutting edge technological progress have allowed new expenditure on leisure, and on new creative pursuits. Our attitudes are changing, India is young. According to the 2011 Census, 58% of Indians are below the age of 30 years. Their expectations and aspirations are very different from those a generation ago. But the core, the basic structure, of Indian cultural administration has remained unchanged, quite unaffected by the transformation of the world around it. There is certainly a need for a major overhaul.
- 2.8 Our Committee held 14 meetings and met not only officials and administrators from the various institutions covered by the mandate given to us, but also eminent practitioners and experts in various creative arts. The persons who interacted with us personally or wrote to us are listed at *Appendix I*. Their views and advice has been of immense value to us in formulating our recommendations. The list of officials who have met us, or have assisted us, is at *Appendix II*. We also sought the views of the public through the website of the Ministry of Culture and received some measure of response.
- 2.9 Our Committee held two meetings at Bangalore, during which it interacted with eminent persons of the city. In an attempt to gauge the public view, we met members of the public who gave us a glimpse into their expectations from the institutions of the Ministry of Culture. The list of these persons is at *Appendix III*. We also visited three institutions of the Ministry in that city. What we learnt is described later in this Report.
- 2.10 The Committee was given the freedom to co-opt other members, if required. This was deliberated by us, but it was felt that, given the limited time available, we might spend much of that time in selecting and inviting additional members. In addition, the Ministry advised us, after the election schedule was announced and the Model Code of Conduct came into effect, that appointing new members would not thereafter be possible. In any case, the real issues before our Committee pertained to the structure of, and administrative improvements to, the various institutions and to the management of the arts. And in that respect, our Committee was well represented. We have, as mentioned, interacted with a number of experts

and exponents of the arts; we believe we have caught the essence of their felt needs.

2.11 It also bears repetition that, given the time available to us, we have concentrated on what we feel are the most essential changes required. As we have observed, the recommendations of past Committees have been more exemplified in their rejection than in their implementation. We can do no better than quote from the Khosla Committee's Report, which refers to this very problem. It says, with examples of the action taken, rather not taken, on the Bhabha Committee's Report – "We found that many of the recommendations were not considered acceptable, either because the change suggested was not expected to improve matters or because the change would have necessitated an amendment of the existing Constitution, a measure to which the Government was averse. Some of the less important suggestions were accepted, but these did not yield any appreciable benefits." (*Annexure V*).

2.12 Our Report is intended to touch at the basic issues of structure and processes in the institutions we have been asked to cover. We have tried to cut at decades of status quo through the prism of a new, young India. The old order changeth, yielding place to new. We are aware of the fact that many reports of the Government of India, across many Ministries, that have proposed administrative change, have not been acted on. Why should ours be different? We would like to posit three reasons. First, if the Government wishes to experiment with change in administrative systems, a small Ministry like Culture could be a starting point. Second, many of the changes we propose are not entirely new, they revisit the conditions that existed fifty years ago; it is since then that rigidity has set in. And, third, this Ministry is one whose very mandate should require it to interact with the young, with creative, independent minds; it has to be a catalyst for new beginnings.

2.13 To close this Introduction, we must refer to two administrative issues pertaining to the setting up of our Committee. The Ministry would do well to appreciate the time it takes to prepare a considered Report of this nature and provide the assistance it requires right from the start, without the Committee having to repeatedly ask for that support. We had initial difficulties in obtaining the facilities required to work.

2.14 The second related aspect is that we are uncertain of the implications and the significance of ours being a 'High Powered Committee'. Our Committee was set up through an OM of the Ministry, not by a Resolution of the Government, as has been the practice in the past. The Ministry does not seem to be aware of any difference. Our Member-Secretary was only "part time" and had other onerous duties to perform. If it were not for the internet and the laptop, two modern

technological marvels, we could not have completed our task. The Ministry should not set up High Powered Committees without understanding the administrative responsibilities involved, and before working out the modalities of its functioning. The Haksar Committee had also referred to this problem and had made a recommendation in this regard. (para 1.12). Indeed, our Committee has looked at some of the rigidities in the administrative processes of Government as a matter of some concern, as our report will indicate.

2.15 We are acutely conscious of the fact, as we finalise our Report, that we are working through days of electoral battle. The new Government will be sworn in a few weeks' time. Irrespective of the political set up, we hope that our Report will help improve the functioning of the Ministry and its many Institutions. Our Committee was set up because of Parliamentary oversight. We hope that the same oversight will enable our recommendations to be acted upon.

3. THE MINISTRY OF CULTURE

Once we are destined to live out our lives in the prison of our minds, our one duty is to furnish it well.: Peter Ustinov

- 3.1 Though the intention of the Ministry in setting up this Committee was to consider the working of the three Akademis and various other institutions, we feel that it is necessary on our part to first comment on certain aspects of the working of the Ministry itself, as the functioning of the institutions is directly related to the functioning of the Ministry and to the interaction between them. We feel that the institutions cannot function well if there are inherent flaws in the functioning of the parent body, and so we need to propose a few changes in the Ministry. This, to our mind, is essential.
- 3.2 Equally significantly, our meetings in Bangalore gave us an understanding of the deep hiatus that seems to exist between Delhi and Bangalore. As we were unable, for lack of time, to travel to other parts of our country, we chose to visit Bangalore because three major institutions of the MOC have “branches” in Bangalore, the NGMA, NSD and the IGNCA. The impression we came away with is that there is absolutely no understanding of, or attention to, the needs of the institutions far away from Delhi, and that the supervision of the Ministry of Culture towards the better functioning of these institutions has been negligible. What is true of Bangalore would be true of similar institutions in other cities as well.
- 3.3 The administration of ‘culture’ is indeed very complex, but a necessity. The Khosla Committee, in the early 1970s, delved into details of cultural administration in various countries – France, Italy, Japan, Great Britain, the United States of America, the then USSR, the then Czechoslovakia. It was of the view that their study “amply demonstrate(d) the importance of the State’s responsibility in the preservation, development and stimulation of cultural values... a policy of *laissez faire* in the domain of culture is fraught with danger.” We did not have the luxury of time to look at the present structure globally, but a couple of brief observations may be made.
- 3.4 Most European countries spend about 1 to 1.5 % of their public expenditure on culture (*Annexure VI*). While public expenditure in some of these relatively affluent countries may not appear high, the quantum of private expenditure in culture is fairly substantial. It is generally accepted that higher income levels allow higher allocations for leisure and personal satisfaction activities. In 2005, among OECD countries, the percentage of household expenditure on recreation and

culture ranged from 7.7% in the UK, 6.9% in Australia and 6.4% in the USA to 4.1% in Italy, 3.1% in Ireland and 2% (2004 data) in Mexico. (*Annexure VII*)

3.5 What constitutes expenditure on culture varies – some countries include sports, television and films, which in India belong to the realm of other Ministries. But, as long as the average Indian is unable to spare household income for cultural activities, Government has to provide the facilities for cultural activity; it has to both encourage the creative effort and provide the infrastructure for the purpose.

3.6 At *Annexure VIII* is the data for six years of expenditure, 2009-10 to 2014-15 of the Government of India on what could be termed leisure activities. The allocation for Culture has ranged from 0.12% in 2009-10 to 0.13% in 2014-15. If we add the budgets for the Ministries of I and B and Sports, we reach the grand level of 0.68% of the total Government budget in 2009-10, which has declined to 0.38% in 2014-15. This is indeed an unfortunate situation. As a country moving towards a place at the international high table, our public spend on culture, and on other related activities, must be substantially increased, and the capacity must be created in our system to absorb it.

3.7 A tiny statistic will indicate the vast difference that exists in the ‘appreciation’ of culture in Europe and in India. In 2009, in Paris, the Musee d’Orsay had 3533858 visitors. The National Gallery of Modern Art in New Delhi, with its new galleries, had a grand total of 55, 589 footfalls in 2009-10, and fewer than 4 lakh visitors in the last 5 years. This, however, may be an unfair comparison for two reasons. First, the Orsay is one of the greatest art museums in the world. It receives visitors from around the world. Secondly, much of our visual arts culture would not be captured by definition by the NGMA which begins with the 1850s. Our traditional folk and tribal art, for example, are not part of modern gallery displays. But, when we consider our visual arts administration, this only highlights a limitation in our approach. It is essential that we look afresh at what ails the showcasing of our cultural wealth.

3.8 Why do we need a Ministry to oversee the administration of culture? We need it for three fundamental reasons:

- i. It has to work as a point of coordination for cultural expression, and a catalyst for the dissemination of that expression through the encouragement and sponsorship of multifarious artistic activity;
- ii. It has to guide the people towards higher expressions of the arts, and enable us to differentiate between mediocrity and excellence;
- iii. It has to protect our heritage, both tangible and intangible, through research and documentation, and at the same time prepare us for new pursuits in the creative world.

3.9 But does it have the capacity to do so? The MOC, as it is set up today can perhaps cater to the first of the three responsibilities mentioned above, but not the other two. Even in the first task, it tends to be a controller rather than a facilitator. The difficulties that the Ministry faces can be broadly defined, again in three ways:

1. The MOC is not like most other Ministries which pursue social and economic development. It deals, very directly, with the intelligentsia, with creative talent at its best, and looks after very ‘non-bureaucratic’ activities. Its role is to help realise the true potential of all citizens, to push them towards a “better furnished mind”. It must itself be equipped to do this.
2. The Ministry handles a far larger number of activities than it apparently needs to. We believe it finds it difficult to provide quality decision making, both because of the sheer number of institutions it ‘controls’ and because its work involves, as we have just said, rather intangible matters.
3. There is a lack of flexibility in financial and administrative matters that we have noticed in the functioning of many institutions under the MOC. Since the ‘value’ of cultural expression cannot be judged in Governmental financial terms, there is a need to find a certain flexibility in their functioning, without compromising the basic norms of financial propriety.

The Quality of Manpower

3.10 The first of these aspects is the most difficult to resolve. It relates to the nature of the staff which looks after the cultural administration of our country. The staff structure of the MOC (*Annexure IX (a) and (b)*) indicates that, among decision making staff, there are 18 positions of the rank of Deputy Secretary and above, though 3 of these posts are vacant. Even then, it is a large increase from the position just five years back when there were only 12 senior officers (*Annexure IX (c)*). The work distribution of the Joint Secretaries of the MOC is at *Annexure IX (d)*. The percentage of clerical staff presently working is about 60% of the total strength of 149 officials in place. There is also a sanctioned strength of 67 posts in Group D of which 39 are filled. We believe that, by and large, the clerical workforce is not attuned to look at their work in the Ministry as anything but files and papers, with no creative ideals and little artistic or aesthetic sensitivity.

3.11 The quality of staff is no different in the MOC than, to take examples at random, the Ministries of Home Affairs, Agriculture or Commerce. But those

Ministries are actually well equipped with a support system of experts. The MHA has senior police officers in the Ministry and have the constant support of intelligence agencies. The Ministry of Agriculture uses the services of agricultural experts as Advisors and Commissioners in the Ministry. The Ministry of Commerce has the services of officers of the Indian Trade Service. The Ministry of Culture has none of these. It instead behaves as if it knows best for its institutions.

3.12 It was not always this way. Significant support was available to the Ministry in the not too distant past from Advisors who aided the very process of setting up institutions. We need expertise today in the Ministry.

3.13 The Mani Shankar Aiyar Committee, which went into the functioning of the Zonal Cultural Centres, had proposed that a specialized Central Service, called 'Indian Culture & Heritage Service', be constituted for manning all cultural posts in ZCCs and various other organizations under the MOC. The MOC did not accept that. We agree with that decision. We believe that such a cadre could again lead to entrenched, vested interests, and finding the best people for such a service would be constrained by the usual problems of eligibility criteria for appointments, inflexible job responsibilities, and over-structured service conditions.

3.14 However a flexible approach could be possible. Till very recently, the formal study of cultural administration, of the performing arts and the professional choice of managing the arts was very rare among young people; today there are many bright people who have put aside lucrative professions to work in a world of cultural action, out of their love for the arts. Their knowledge and passion is second to none, and their numbers are growing. There are a few such young people now working on contract in institutions like the National Museum and the National Gallery of Modern Art. It is a pleasure to see their sense of commitment and responsiveness to work. Our Committee would recommend that a pool of 50 positions be created in the MOC, of which some could work in the Ministry itself and some in the various institutions under the Ministry. This culture administration pool, to improve the management of cultural institutions would be filled by contract appointments of up to 5 years, extendable by another 5. During this period, many might leave, but new persons would join, and those who prefer to stay on for the entire period, might find place in regular or further contractual positions in the institutions under the Ministry.

3.15 Many of these positions should be outside Delhi, to be placed in the seven ZCCs, the NGMA Bangalore and Mumbai, the NSDs outside Delhi as and when set up (to help with managerial work and programmatic support if qualified), IGNCAs Bangalore, the Museums outside Delhi and such organisations.

- 3.16 But a pool of young people can do wonders only if they are guided in their work. In the past, the then Ministry of Education had Advisors. We need to strengthen the capacity of the Akademis and other institutions and reduce the role of the MOC in their functioning, and so we may not require what might become parallel centres of power in full time Advisors. But as and when the Ministry requires specialised, external advice on any matter, there should be a panel of experts from whom on payment of a fee, such advice could be sought. This could be in the nature of a sitting fee paid for a meeting or a fee for written advice. The MOC may work out details of such a panel, which should cover all aspects of the arts and ensure region-wise expertise.
- 3.17 Our next recommendation in this regard is that all the staff of the Ministry should undergo at least a one week programme designed by experts to make them alive to our cultural milieu. The programme should include a brief introduction to art and aesthetics, to the performing arts, to the variety in our cultural ethos, and to the requirements of cultural administration. The trainees must understand the expectations that creative artistes would have of the Ministry, appreciate our own tangible and intangible heritage, and be introduced to global cultural trends. Such a course every two years should cover all officials of the MOC, including officers.
- 3.18 Sometimes, officers who are posted to the Ministry are novices at the management of culture. It is different from what they have ever handled before. At times, they have the experience, perhaps at the State level, but they might come without a national perspective. For any newcomer to the Ministry, a brief should be made available about the work of the Ministry, including fundamentals of cultural theory and appreciation of the arts. What is expected of a catalyst and not a controller must be explained to the newcomer.

Grantmaking

- 3.19 The second aspect is the nature of work that the MOC handles. We feel that some of it does not fall within the realm of the Ministry's legitimate policy work. The Bhabha Committee had recommended as follows:
- “The Committee has also gone very carefully into the question of payment of grants to the institutions by the Akademis and has come to the conclusion that the work of releasing grants to institutions should be taken over from the Akademis by the Ministry of Education (now Culture), which is better equipped to ensure that proper accounts are maintained and due check is exercised in their utilization “(Chapter II, paragraph 11).
- 3.20 The grants sanctioning process of the MOC is flawed in many ways. An example is of the fellowships (2011-12) for which applications were called for in

2012. For 177 senior and 200 junior fellowships, 3365 applications were received and 1245 persons were called for interviews in August 2013, more than a year later (*Annexure X*). The grantees list has been announced in October 2013. Clearly the list of grantees for 2011-12 should have been finalised in 2010-11, before the start of the year, and not three years later in 2013-14.

3.21 We feel that the MOC does not have the capacity to run a programme of this nature. But then do the Akademis have that capacity? The Akademis too are handicapped by their own deficiencies. The MOC should set up a group of experts to assess the programme and help the MOC in positioning the programme correctly. It would have to remove inefficiencies in the procedure and the release of funds. It should also ensure that the experts' panels truly reflect the best experts in the country, especially in new proficiencies. Age should not be the criterion here, but expertise. We must emphasise that all grantees lists for fellowships should be finalised before the year of the grant begins. We also recommend that the Ministry sets up an enquiry as to why grantees for 2011-12 were finalised more than two years late. If this is not done, where would be accountability in the Ministry?

3.22 Another problem is that, often, the first instalment of a grant is sanctioned and disbursed. But the second or subsequent instalments never seem to arrive. This causes great hardship to the grantee institution or the individual. We understand that the Ministry has to be cautious and seek documentation of proper utilisation of the earlier amount. But the causes for delay cannot be hidden away in the file of the section. In today's day and age, we expect that a public information system must allow the beneficiary – and others – to know where a proposal stands, what is the next step to be taken and by whom and why there has been a delay, if any. The institution which handles this work in future must publicly announce details of disbursement. All the necessary information should be available on the net.

Span of Control and Delegation of Powers

3.23 Another issue is of the capacity of the Ministry to look after so many institutions. The MOC is a small Ministry, with 6 Divisions (the term is not commonly used there), but has 46 institutions in its care. That is an enormous responsibility, and in terms of its workload, it should be noted that the amount of paper work connected with a small constituent would be about the same as with a major institution. The work of the Ministry is such that, though much of the work is mundane and rather routine, there is enough of it to prevent qualitative work. The officials are also required to attend meetings of the various bodies, and these institutions often need to consider the convenience of the JS concerned for fixing meetings.

- 3.24 The 46 various institutions under the MOC are autonomous, attached or subordinate. The difference between these kinds of offices is briefly explained at *Annexure XI*. Of these, 3 are attached offices, 8 subordinate and 35 are autonomous (*Annexure XII*). The reasoning behind this differentiation in the Ministry is not easy to understand, especially when we try to differentiate between attached and subordinate. The entire range of attached and subordinate offices of the Ministry will need to be reviewed to decide on the optimum and appropriate form of delegation and autonomy.
- 3.25 We also understand that proposals from attached offices are further examined in the MOC. The very purpose of an attached office, which is only an extension of the Ministry for all practical purposes, is lost if a junior official in the Ministry were to scrutinise the proposals of the attached offices and sit in judgement over senior officers. This practice must be stopped as it only delays decision making and adds to the work of the Ministry. Obviously, a major issue may require clarity, and greater examination, but a meeting to clear doubts would be better than a duplicate file movement.
- 3.26 The MOC deals with intellectual, aesthetic, creativity related issues, which cannot be handled the way most other Ministries are run. The Ministry should set out an MOU with each institution before the start of the new financial year, for the forthcoming year, and give all relevant administrative powers. We recommend that a group of outside experts and officials from the relevant institution should finalise the delegation of administrative powers for all institutions of the Ministry by the end of 2014, and begin a system of MOUs from 2015-16. Needless to say, these MOUs must be ready before the end of 2014-15.
- 3.27 In many financial matters, these institutions have to come to the MOC for relatively minor decisions. The Ministry of Finance has laid down in 2010 that autonomous bodies of the Government are to be covered by the General Financial Rules, except to the extent the bylaws of an autonomous body provides for separate Financial Rules which have been approved by the Government. The OM no. 1(37)/2010-EII (A) dated 2nd November, 2010, of the Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure (*Annexure XIII*), should be used for creating separate, independent financial rules for all the 35 autonomous institutions, including many directly of relevance to our Report. Our Committee recommends that the bylaws of each autonomous body should be examined to enable the creation of a set of Financial Rules for each body relevant to its purpose, and its work.
- 3.28 The major institutions under the Ministry require the Finance Advisor of the Ministry to be Finance Advisor for each of them. The Finance Committees of many of the Institutions have to meet under his/her chairpersonship, and even if a deputy is asked to attend to this, the sheer number of meetings annually is difficult

to keep count of. Very often, the institutions have to keep matters pending because the FA or the Deputy FA is unable to give time for these statutory meetings. We would strongly recommend that the number of officers at the level of Deputy Secretary in the Internal Financial Division of the MOC is raised from 1 to at least 3. Necessary staff must, of course, be provided.

Coordination and Policy Issues

3.29 There is little to show in the Ministry that it fosters cooperation amongst its many institutions. The direction the Ministry would take, over the coming year, should be discussed amongst all the agencies which are responsible for the administration of culture. We believe that a special effort must be made by the MOC towards fostering a sense of purpose and camaraderie amongst all the institutions that have any role to play in the functioning of the Ministry.

3.30 The Ministry should hold an annual meeting, spread over two days, to be chaired by the Secretary himself/herself, before the finalisation of the budget for any financial year to (a) prepare a national calendar of major programmes for the forthcoming year, to ensure synergy and to prevent a clash/duplication of events, (b) ensure appropriate funding in the coming year, and (c) foster coordination and cooperation among all its institutions.

The Headless Beasts

3.31 One of the most exasperating aspects of the working of the MOC is the fact that it runs its institutions without providing the required leadership for these organisations. Presently, as many as 17 institutions, including some covered by our Committee's mandate, do not have a regular Head or CEO (*Annexure XIV*). This covers over a third of the total number of the institutions of the Ministry. Some have been vacant for many years, some of them even over a decade. This is a sorry state of affairs. This has happened because the Ministry is apparently unable to find suitable persons for the job. The problem with this is that the recruitment rules have been prepared without sufficient thought to the eligibility criteria. Searching for 'specialists' to fit exact criteria is next to impossible; in any case, at the top of the pyramid, one requires leadership qualities and administrative skills more than technical expertise.

3.32 Over the years, we have tied ourselves up into bureaucratic knots. First, we have a structured academic hierarchy which at times stymies brilliance. Tagore himself could not have taught in India had he to follow the UGC rules and regulations. Secondly, we have strict expectations of specialisation. Increasingly abroad, institutions are managed by managers, who are first a good administrator and then a specialist in the area. The best way to pick the best person for the job is

to keep the required area of expertise very wide. If we can expect in our present system that generalist bureaucrats should ease into the role of cultural administrators, why can we not have managers to head strategic positions in the institutions? Even then, increasingly, a number of young people are studying management abroad and specialising in cultural matters. We need to do a complete overhaul of our recruitment rules.

3.33 The first Heads of many institutions of culture were foreigners. Hermann Goetz, a well known German art historian was the first curator of NGMA. Dr. Grace Morley, who had been Director of the San Francisco Museum of Modern Art for 23 years, was the first Director of the National Museum in 1960. If it could happen then, why can it not now? We can have foreign coaches in sports, why not foreigners as experts, if necessary, in the MOC. Rigidity in the system can be overcome if there is the will to do so. Between the Department of Personnel and the Department of Expenditure, there has to be the foresight to see the vision of the future.

3.34 Our Committee recommends that a small group, under a senior officer, be set up to study closely all the recruitment rules and propose easing of restrictive requirements. This should be taken up as a special drive and fundamental changes brought about. In a year's time, these posts should be filled, either from within the organisation or from the field, possibly on contract. The MOC should try to obtain the services of suitable State Civil Officers on deputation, especially where the institutions are located in a particular State.

A Public Face

3.35 The MOC essentially has to deal with persons who deal with the creative arts. It has to deal with eminent artists, applicants for grants, scholars and academics from across the country. They are often not sure of the person to contact, or how to best communicate with the Ministry. Our Committee has been informed during its interactions that the public often has to make a number of phone calls to reach the right person, and emails are rarely replied to. At times, there is a language barrier. We believe the Ministry would do well to have a "pointsperson" to whom the public could turn to for assistance. The Ministry should create a post at the level of Deputy Secretary and designate that officer as the public relations and information officer. There is already an officer of the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting who covers a number of Ministries, and plays the role of information officer, but only as the intermediary between the media and the Ministry. We expect the new officer to be the link between the public and the Ministry, and indeed some manner of ombudsman covering all the institutions under the MOC. He/she will not be a vigilance officer, but a facilitator.

Placing this officer in the office of the Secretary MOC will vest him/her with a certain authority and enable him/her direct access to the Secretary if required.

Academic and Analytical Work

3.36 There is also a tendency in the Ministry to summon the officials of the institution concerned at each and every step as it has neither the capacity and the confidence nor, therefore, the will, to analyse or even maintain data on these bodies. The Ministry would do well to have another officer of the rank of Deputy Secretary to be Research Officer in the Ministry, who would be the focal point of data management (not that the basic responsibility for data management of each division should be handed over to him/her).

3.37 For the better management of the institutions under the Ministry it is essential to have a constant review of the activities of those institutions. The Research Officer should also be a point of coordination in the Ministry and work in cooperation with the other officers to ensure continuity of the review process.

Indian Institutes of Art and Culture

3.38 Our capacity in the management of cultural expressions and, more directly, the administration of cultural institutions is woefully inadequate. We need to provide support for training, education and capacity building in all facets of the creative arts. There is virtually no formal learning programme in India today for cultural administration. The management of museums, art galleries, performance spaces, has a significant managerial content apart from the knowledge, skills and interest in these arts.

3.39 At the same time, the various performing and visual art forms that are centre-stage today must be provided ample opportunity for their continuing articulation. Government funds, in a limited way, various private schools of dance and music. However, this is neither sufficient, nor are any quality standards prescribed or maintained. In the sphere of the performing arts, to preserve our cultural heritage in its different traditions, there is an essential need to preserve and foster those folk, tribal and community cultural traditions which are in danger of extinction on account of social change, technological innovation and market forces. At the same time, there is a heightened need to provide space to all forms of classical dance and music, and offer scope for their continued development.

3.40 In the present system, eminent artistes often struggle to set up their own schools of music or dance. Those who do not have business or managerial acumen often end up in difficult circumstances. This could be avoided if Government were to set up centres where the best exponents of music, dance, theatre and the fine arts could pass on their expertise to the best, talented students in the country.

3.41 It is therefore necessary to set up institutes of excellence in the management of cultural institutions and in the field of the performing and visual arts. Over 50 years ago the first IIT was set up, and nearly 50 since the first IIM. They have been publicly funded, but with an autonomous status which has given them a certain flexibility in the organization and academic independence. The same approach could be considered in the area of the creative arts. Just as there are IIMs and IITs for management and technology studies, there could be Indian Institutes of Arts and Culture.

3.42 Our Committee recommends that the Government must set up Indian Institutes of Art and Culture. These IIACs should have two components. First it must have an academic stream for the management of art and culture, including art administration, and the management of cultural institutions. Secondly, they should have all major art forms in one campus. There could be specialization in each IIAC, depending on the region covered and the expertise at the Centre. These should be headed by eminent persons in the field of cultural and art administration, and in the performing and visual arts

Budgetary and other Financial Matters

3.43 The budget and the actual expenditure of the MOC over a 15 year period from 1999-2000 to 2013-14 is at *Annexure XV*. The scheme-wise allocation and expenditure of the MOC for 5 years from 2009-10 is at *Annexure XVI*. The details of expenditure by the various institutions under our consideration over the same 5 year period are at *Annexure XVII (a) to (h)*. But allocations mean little as the final releases tend to be less than the budget. In most years, there has been a shortfall, the highest being in 2005-06 when only 77.54 % of the budget was spent. In 2013-14, there was a reduction in expenditure of 18.39%. There are two possible reasons for such shortfalls. One is that the institutions of the MOC may not have the capacity to spend wisely and well. But the other is that there is rigidity in the funding process. The releases are slow in coming, flexibility in programming is non-existing and any attempt at reappropriating funds from one area to another requires Parliamentary approval. It makes it imperative then, for the organisations to plan well ahead.

3.44 The lack of smooth funding especially affects individuals and small organisations. All beneficiary oriented projects must have the awardees finalised by all institutions six months before the new financial year, so that they can be budgeted for.

3.45 The budget is not merely a means to fund expenditure. It is also a way to indicate the direction a Ministry takes and the emphasis it provides to its different areas of work. It is a policy document that explains as much as it can hide. The growth of funding of the institutions which our Committee is mandated to study is

given at *Annexure XVIII*. Why do some organisations under the MOC have higher growth than others, why are some of them in relative stagnation? The MOC must take stock of the growth rates and funding pattern and analyse whether that pattern is appropriate or not.

- 3.46 Two other issues, on the expenditure side, need emphasis. In both these matters, the Finance Advisor and his office must take a supportive and not a negative approach. The first is the acute need for the better maintenance of many of the buildings that house the institutions we are examining. We would recommend that adequate funds are provided for the maintenance of infrastructure in the cultural institutions.
- 3.47 The second is the need to strengthen the capacities of our institutions. We will need to obtain outside expertise, and the MOC will have to offer decent salaries to the experts. As the cliché goes, if you pay peanuts, you will get monkeys. The best experts need to be respected, and paid remuneration and given other facilities at the level of Joint Secretaries. And it is essential to entrust even contractual appointees with financial powers. This is often objected to on the specious and rather antediluvian grounds that they could misappropriate funds but Government would have no control over them. For one, the misappropriation of funds can happen with regular, permanent employees. Second, the long arm of the law can catch criminals if there is a will to do so. Third, the persons to be appointed should be of such eminence that the likelihood of their indulging in financial misdemeanours should be very low. And fourth, if the Ministry needs the support of experts, it needs to support them with adequate powers. Our mental block in appointing experts on contract should not lead to our missing the woods for the trees.
- 3.48 Our Committee would like to reiterate that the structural and systemic changes to the MOC that we have recommended should go a long way to improve the efficiency and the capacity of the Ministry. They are the first changes required before we can expect any revolution in the institutions which we will now turn to.

4. THE THREE AKADEMIS: COMMON ISSUES

*Where tireless striving stretches its arms towards perfection,
Where the clear stream of reason has not lost its way
Into the dreary desert sand of dead habit,
Where the mind is led forward by thee
Into ever-widening thought and action
Into that heaven of freedom, my Father, let my country awake.
: Rabindranath Tagore*

- 4.1 The three Akademis, which are the most important of the autonomous institutions under the MOC, were set up soon after independence, the Sangeet Natak Akademi by a Resolution dated 31 May, 1952, the Sahitya Akademi by a Resolution dated 15 December, 1952 and the Lalit Kala Akademi by a Resolution dated 7 October, 1953. At the inauguration of the LKA, the then Minister for Education, Maulana Abul Kalam Azad, said, “In a democratic regime, the arts can derive their sustenance only from the people, and the State as the organized manifestation of the people’s will, must therefore, undertake [the]...maintenance and development[of the arts] as one of [its] first responsibilities.” How has that intention been translated in action?
- 4.2 The three Akademis have done yeoman’s service over the past sixty years, and yet, they have received as many brickbats as bouquets about their work. There have been voices in support of the existing autonomy of the Akademis, and equally, demands for change. Somewhere along the way, the enthusiasm and hope with which they were started seem to have been dampened. The Department-related Parliamentary Committee in its 201st Report has said, in no uncertain terms, “These Akademis are always mired in one controversy or the other. Our Founding-Fathers gave them autonomy to keep the politics away from culture but today politics seems to have crept into them from the back door.” Why have our Akademis been covered over by the dreary desert sand of dead habit?
- 4.3 Our Committee notes that the earlier three High Powered Committees have all noticed the need for change in the functioning of these bodies, but many of these recommendations have not been implemented. Today, even the most significant one for our purpose, that is the Haksar Committee, is already 25 years into the past. The Haksar Committee report is a remarkable document, written with great sagacity and perspicacity. And yet, why was it not implemented? We can only attribute it to the behemoth of Government not having the intention to shake up a system. Today, our Committee feels that the Akademis seem to be in a time warp, that they have not been able to shake off their stagnant mindset and embrace the modernity of the 21st century.

- 4.4 We therefore need to look at many of these issues afresh, in the context of (a) the Constitution and structure, (b) the activities, and (c) the impediments to the proper functioning, of these three bodies. Of these, (a) and (c) are directly related and therefore considered together in this Chapter. The activities of the three bodies, being largely independent of each other's work, have been considered under the relevant Chapters for the three Akademis.
- 4.5 Our effort at looking at the constituents of the three Akademis would be with a view to (a) improve the composition of the membership, (b) simplify and make more transparent the decision making process. Is it necessary to have a common Constitution, as far as possible? Certainly, in their activities the Akademis are different and so their Constitutions and membership would be different. Our Committee believes that while the principles should be the same, there would be differences in the detailing.
- 4.6 There are certain basic concerns. How far has autonomy led to internal politicking and bickering? How far would a restructuring of the Akademis create the other danger, that of political control by the political leadership that runs the Government of the day? Given the autonomous position that the Akademis do broadly enjoy, why have their mandates not been reflected upon, and refreshed, even though two generations have passed since they were set up? Is it because they are too 'ancient' to understand that there are new areas of creative work, which technology and inventiveness have produced? Or is it merely governmental apathy? Or is it unnecessary Government intervention? These are some of the issues our Committee has tried to address.
- 4.7 How far must Government intervene? Is it because of bureaucratic indifference or the lack of time and capacity that the Government does not positively assist in running these institutions? However much a section of the 'culture class' may criticise the Government of intervention in the affairs of autonomous bodies, there is equally the opposite view that the Government does not do enough. A senior architect from Bangalore wrote on email, "We need to review the pre-conditions that we use as starting points. In sixty six years we have learnt that self regulation (whether in politics or in architecture) does not work. We do need some dynamic regulatory framework but not prescriptive dogmas. While critiquing (to find a more mindful and meaningful way ahead), we have to examine the intent, look past the appearances and delve deep."

Constitution and Structure of the Akademis

- 4.8 We shall examine here some common aspects of the three Akademis through a consideration of their present Constitutions which are reproduced at *Annexure XIX, XX and XXI*.

Mandate and Intent

- 4.9 The aims and objects of the three Akademis are spelt out in detail in the Constitutions. The Constitutions have been amended from time to time, in keeping with the needs of the day. It has not been possible for us to locate the documents for each round of changes and it may also not be required for our purposes. But we would recommend that for the sake of research and academic interest, a set of all the changes made from time to time and the papers related to those actions should be located and archived in each Akademi.
- 4.10 The Resolutions setting up the Akademis are naturally a broad statement of intent. But a renewal of their focus is required. We believe that, in modern management terms, a vision statement followed by a mission statement would be useful to bring clarity to the role of each Akademi in today's context.
- 4.11 We give an example of the loss of focus. An Akademi is intended for academic work. In all the three Akademis, research is intended to be an important area of activity. The Lalit Kala Akademi has its first mandate as "To encourage and promote study and research in the fields of creative arts such as painting, sculpture and graphics etc." The second intention behind the setting up of the Sangeet Natak Akademi is "to promote research in the fields of Indian music, dance and drama and for this purpose, to establish a library and museum, etc." Unexpectedly for the Sahitya Akademi, research comes in sixth place, "to promote research in Indian languages and literature." The Lalit Kala Akademi does no research, the Sangeet Natak only a little, and the Sahitya Akademi, despite the presence of Universities in the GC, does not do much research work.
- 4.12 The activities proposed to be engaged in by each Akademi are wide ranging. Besides, the nature of the arts have changed, new activities have emerged. We propose that the list of activities of each Akademi should be reviewed, prioritised and reoriented.

General Council

- 4.13 The process of selecting/electing the General Council or the main body of each Akademi is different, as is their size.
- i. The SNA has a General Council of up to 68 persons, of whom 9 are nominated by Government. These cover the Chairman, the FA, the representatives of the MOC and the Ministry of I and B, and five persons. There are also the representatives of the other two Akademis, the NSD and the ICCR. It has an Executive Board of 16 persons, including the Chairman and Vice Chairman. The

Constitution does not include, in the list of members of the Akademi, the position of Vice-Chairman in the GC, because he has to be elected, after the GC is set up and from within it, to be part of the Executive Board.

- ii. The SA has a General Council of up to 99 persons, of whom the FA is one, while 5 members are nominated by the Government and 4 are representatives of the other two Akademis, the ICCR and the Raja Ram Mohan Roy Library Foundation. There is an Executive Board of 15 persons including the President. The written Constitution of the SA does not have a position of a Vice-President in the GC, but in the EC.
- iii. The LKA has a General Council of up to 67 persons, which includes 5 Government officers and 8 who are appointed in an ex-officio capacity. The Executive Board has 15 persons, including a Chairman and a Vice-Chairman, who are both in the GC and in the EC.

Term of the General Council

4.14 What should be the term of the GC and therefore the term of the Chairperson? Five years has always been the term for the GC and therefore of the Chairperson, the Vice Chairperson and all Committees. Attachment to an institution tends to create a jostling for position. In the corporate sector in India, there is a debate about the true independence of independent directors on the board of a company if he/she has been a director for too long. In the cultural sphere, would truly eminent creative persons wish to wield authority and officialdom for long or would they prefer to return to their creative effort? We have considered this issue in some detail. We believe that 3 years is an efficient term of office. It reduces apathy, allows a larger participation of the intended constituents and brings new ideas to the fore regularly. It would, in our Akademis, allow young voices to be heard early. Are there not enough persons competent to be on the GC of an Akademi? In a country of about 1.3 billion people, if we do not give an opportunity to a larger participation, we might be accused of elitism. Our Committee is of the view that the term of the GC should be reduced from 5 years to 3 years. Thus the term of office of all non-official office bearers would also be 3 years.

4.15 The Our Committee further recommends that no person should be member of the GC or any internal Committee/Board in any of the three Akademis for more than 2 terms, that is, beyond 6 years. These two terms shall not be consecutive terms. This would reduce the scope of anyone getting entrenched in the institution and bring fresh thought and energy into the Akademi regularly. This would be the limit for membership of all the Akademis together.

The States in the Akademis

4.16 When the Akademis were created, India was in the process of nation building. The need for the unification of India and the importance of the States is expressed in the composition of these institutions. Needless to say, each one is different. The constituent body of the Sangeet Natak Akademi includes the following direct representation of the States:

One eminent person in the field of performing arts nominated by each of the States and Union Territories enumerated in the Constitution of India in consultation with the State Akademis or equivalent institutions.

The Sahitya Akademi provides for:

One person from each of the States/ Union Territories enumerated in the Constitution of India, as nominated by the outgoing General Council from a panel of a maximum of three names recommended by the State/ UT Akademis and where there are no State/UT Akademis or where there are more than one State/UT Akademi, by the State Government/UT administration.

The Lalit Kala Akademi has the following representation:

In rotation from one of the three groups A,B and C below (a list is given), for a term of five years, one member to be nominated by the State Akademi which is concerned with visual art from each State and Union territory from the group. In States or Union territories where there is no State Akademi concerned with Visual Art, one member to be nominated by each of the State Governments or Union Territory Administrations in the group.

4.17 Today the Central Akademis have no role to play in the State Akademis. Indeed, many States do not have equivalent Akademis at all. There are, for example, only 10 State Sahitya Akademis. Why and how, then, should the States be represented in the Central Akademis? Is it better to have the best representing the arts from across the country. Should a very tiny State have the same 'vote' as a larger one, as in the case of national ambitions in international bodies?

4.18 We believe that even more than before the States have a role in our togetherness. Without the participation of the States, we do not form a nation. Delhi alone is not India. The MOC and the Akademis must carry the rest of the country with them; treat them not as subordinate but as equal partners. As levels of education and creative aspirations and opportunities increase, there will be a larger and better constituent capable of participating in the processes of the Central Akademis. There should be no display of elitism, though that may require making some adjustments. On the other hand, the Centre offers a degree of capacity which the States do not exhibit and which the States, by participating in the Central

processes, may absorb. We believe that the States must actively participate in rebuilding our national bodies into institutions of excellence and in that process be touched themselves by that excellence. We seek this balance in our recommendations.

4.19 Our Committee recommends that each State and UT should send a recommendation of three names in alphabetical order for membership in the GC of each Central Akademi. These should be persons of eminence in their respective areas of academic or creative work, and not bureaucrats or political personages. Of these three, one would be selected as a member of the relevant Central Akademi by a Committee of three which would comprise the Chairperson of the Akademi, the Joint Secretary (Akademis) and an expert nominated by the Chairperson. This would give the Government a say, but would not make its view mandatory. It would also reduce the politics of nomination at the State level.

4.20 We would also recommend that at least one out of three names proposed by the States should be of age lower than 45 years and at least one of those three should be a woman. As the final selection is made by the Committee, it should select judiciously to ensure that at least 25% of the members are below the age of 45 years, and of the total, at least 33% are women.

4.21 This list of members would be finalised before the new term begins for the Akademi. Indeed all names, including that of other members, as per the individual Constitutions, should be in place before the new term and not during the term.

The Chairperson/President of the Akademis

4.22 The Chairperson/President of any of our prestigious Akademis has to be a person of high eminence and stature, whose position in the chair would enhance the dignity of the chair. As the Haksar Committee has said, “the person and the position should add prestige to each other” (paragraph 3.25). It is necessary that the selection of the Chairperson receives wide, public acclaim. That selection, therefore, must be through a transparent selection process, as objective as is possible.

4.23 The Chairpersons/Presidents of the Akademis are chosen in different ways. We quote from the respective Constitutions.

a. Sangeet Natak Akademi:

The Chairman shall be appointed by the President of India and shall hold office for a term of five years.

b.Sahitya Akademi:

The President shall be elected by the new General Council from a panel of a maximum of three persons to be forwarded by the Executive Board. The Executive Board shall select the panel from the names forwarded by the outgoing General Council. The President shall continue in office until the election of the new President by the new General Council at its first meeting.

c.Lalit Kala Akademi:

Six months prior to the date when the term of the Chairman is to come to an end or as soon as it otherwise becomes necessary to select a new chairman, the General Council of the Akademi shall nominate a member of the search committee which will consist of three members and submit the name to the President of India. The other two names shall be nominated by the President of India out of which one shall be a past Chairman of the Akademi, if available. The search committee shall draw up a panel of three names in alphabetical order and submit it to the President of India who shall appoint one of the three names in the panel as the Chairman or the Akademi.

4.24 Thus the three systems range from total independence of choice in the case of the Sahitya Akademi to the complete stamp of Government in the case of the SNA. As the Haksar Committee has said, “While the elective process has the advantage of establishing a democratic practice, the method of nomination by Government has the advantage of facilitating dispassionate evaluation” (paragraph 3.31).

4.25 The Khosla Committee had recommended that the Chairman of each Akademi should be appointed by the President of India out of a panel of three names selected by the General Council of the Akademi (para 6.11 and 7.56) The Haksar Committee proposed the appointment of the Chairperson/President by Government from a panel proposed by a search committee (paragraph 3.32).

4.26 Our Committee agrees with this view that the selection of the Chairman of an Akademi must be from a panel proposed by a search committee. Therefore, a procedure somewhat similar to what is now followed by the LKA should be established for all the three Akademis, but with a difference. A search-cum-nomination committee of three eminent persons should be constituted in the following manner. Only one member of the search committee should be nominated by the Government. One should be a person nominated by the outgoing Chairperson. The third should be an eminent person, not necessarily an artiste himself/herself, but one associated with the arts, to be nominated by the GC. The Government must ensure that at least one out the three in the search committee is a woman. This search committee must be set up one year ahead of the date of

retirement of the incumbent Chairperson/President. The search committee should propose three names in alphabetical order, from whom the President of India may make a final selection. The Chairperson/President would take charge co-terminus with the new General Council every three years.

4.27 We note that two eminent Committees in the past have recommended a common procedure for the three Akademis. But they continue to remain different. The Ministry, in the need for simplification of procedures, must insist on the change in the selection procedure of the Chairpersons.

4.28 What should be the term of office of the Chairperson? In the case of the Lalit Kala Akademi, the Chairman has a limit of two consecutive terms. In the case of the SNA, the rule is more specific - "The Chairman shall ... hold office for a term of five years." The Sahitya Akademi's rule reads - "The President shall continue in office until the election of the new President by the General Council at its first meeting (emphasis added)." In the infancy of the Sahitya Akademi, Jawaharlal Nehru was President for 10 years, and Suniti Kumar Chatterji for 8 years till his death. We believe that the times are different now. If, in a large and culturally rich nation like ours, we cannot find new persons to be at the helm of affairs of an Akademi, it would speak volumes of a lack of capacity.

4.29 We have proposed a drastic change in the term of the GC itself. The Chairperson's term has to coincide with that of the GC. We believe that the term of any President/Chairperson should ordinarily be limited to one term of three years. However, a Chairperson may be given a second term. This should not be a continuous term but part of a fresh selection. The maximum number of years a person can be Chairperson shall be restricted to six years, comprising two terms of three years each.

4.30 The LKA has an age limit of 70 years for the Chairperson. The other two do not have any such limitation. Is there any advantage to an age restriction? In a country which is young, there certainly should be no perceived disadvantage to an age limit. No doubt, the Chairperson would be one of high eminence, and age should not be a hurdle in choosing the best. But can we not find, in our land, any other equally eminent person? Besides, in the set up we envisage, the Chairman would have a more active role in the administration of the Akademi. It is perhaps possible to stave off any desire to be entrenched in the offices of Akademi through an age restriction. We are of the view that the Chairperson and all office bearers, all Heads of Committees of any Akademi should not be above the age of 70 years.

4.31 We note also difficulties regarding the use of the term President for the Sahitya Akademi and Chairman of the other two. First, in today's world of gender equality, and despite the provisions of the General Clauses Act, 1897, which states

that “words importing the masculine gender shall be taken to include female”, we need to replace the term Chairman throughout each Constitution with the term Chairperson. Second, and more important, is the awkwardness that is evident even in this Report of using the two terms, Chairman and President, in parallel and often with a backward slash to include both terms. Sometimes a whole phrase or even a sentence has to be added to include both terms. The difficulty arose because the Sahitya Akademi, in its first General Council meeting, modified the Constitution to amend the term Chairman to President. That the SA did not take into cognisance the possible impact of this change on others outside the Akademi is evident, but that change in the Constitution by a body of some of the great luminaries of the literary world, has left difficulties in attempting a felicitous turn of phrase. The Bhabha Committee in 1964 had recommended that the Heads of all the three Akademis should be Presidents (Chapter III, 2, ii). But in today’s world, Chairperson would be the better term and the change required in only one Akademi. Our Committee recommends that all the three Akademis be headed by Chairpersons, and that term be adopted for all three of them.

The Vice Chairman/Vice President

4.32 The position of the Vice Chairperson has sometimes been an impediment to the smooth functioning of the Akademis. At times, the Vice Chairperson, if from Delhi, actually runs the show in the absence of the Chairperson. Given that between them, the Chairperson and the Secretary should be able, indeed expected to, look after the administration of the Akademi, we do not appreciate the position of power of the Vice Chairperson. There are two advantages to the position of the Vice Chairperson. One is that he/she can act formally as the Chairperson if that position is vacant. Second, he/she can be the head of various Committees and Advisory Bodies. With regard to the first, the Chairpersonship could, if required, easily be given to someone on a temporary basis from among those in the Executive Board. In the case of a temporary absence from headquarters, the internet, modern phone systems and other technological advances today improve the decision-making capacity of the Chairperson. As for the second aspect, we believe that it is better to have different experts from among the Executive Board, or even from the larger Council to chair the various committees/expert groups. Sometimes, the Vice Chairperson is actually senior in age to the Chairperson and has his/her own perception of his/her relative importance. The concentration of a fair degree of power in the hands of the Vice Chairperson can actually lead to the creation of an additional centre of power.

4.33 We recommend that the position of Vice Chairperson should be abolished in the three Akademis. Where the Vice Chairperson heads any internal committee of an Akademi, that should now be headed by one or the other elected member of the Executive Board, depending on his/her area of expertise.

4.34 It would be required of the Chairperson, though, if he/she is not from Delhi, to spend more time in the headquarters. We recommend therefore that housing and other facilities are suitably provided to the Chairperson.

Secretary of the Akademi

4.35 The role of the Secretary is crucial to the correct functioning of the Akademi. He/she has to be a person of eminence himself/herself capable of having a presence both with the officials of the Ministry and with the members of the Akademi. He must also command the respect of the public who deal with the Akademi. In fact, the abolition of the post of Vice Chairman would require the Secretary to play a larger role in the affairs of the Akademi. Unfortunately, in the recent past the functioning of some Secretaries has left much to be desired.

4.36 Why have the Akademis come to such a pass? There is obviously no 'control' over the activities of the Secretary who is free to do his own bidding. The person is entrenched in the institution, knows the rules and regulations to use them to his advantage and is free to get involved in the politics of the Akademi. If the Secretary is a person who has dreamt of a big career for himself/herself, but is not an eminent person in his/her own right, we can have the misuse of a very important office by one unfit to hold it.

4.37 The three Akademis have had many scholars and persons of eminence and artistic excellence as Secretary. And yet, they have been considered subordinate to even middle level officers of the Ministry. Our Committee notes that the Akademis are the association of the finest creative minds of the country and should express the highest thinking in the arts and aesthetics. In recent years, the Government has modified the procedures for the recruitment of heads of certain institutions under the MOC, such as the National Museum, the ASI and the National Archives. These are all positions at the level of Additional Secretaries to Government. The IGNCA, a much more niche institution than the Akademis, has a person of the rank of Secretary to Government as the Member Secretary.

4.38 Our Committee believes that the Secretary of an Akademi should be given a status of a full Professor of a University, with a fixed salary at the higher end of the Professor's grade, covering all entitlement of a Professor in the UGC system. A special allowance in the nature of an increase in emoluments may be considered at the end of each year. The equation of the Secretary with the Ministry may change, but we believe this would be for the better. The Secretary must not be entrenched in the Akademi as he/she should not build a personal stake in the organisation. Therefore the Secretary must be appointed on contract basis for a period of 3 years, extendable by one term of 3 years.

- 4.39 The selection of the Secretary must be made from a list of eight to ten persons prepared through an advertisement-cum-search-cum-interview process where the selection committee must consist of the Chairperson of the Akademi, the Secretary of the MOC and three eminent experts of whom two would be nominated by the Chairperson and one by the MOC. The Secretary could be selected on deputation from a University or an institution of excellence, if a suitable candidate is available. The advantage of having a person on deputation from academia would be the emphasis that could be placed on academic work in the institution.
- 4.40 The tenure of the Secretary would be subject to a review of his/her performance after the second year, by an external Committee to be set up by the Chairperson of the Akademi in consultation with the MOC. After the review, if the Committee finds, for reasons to be recorded in writing, that the work of the Secretary has been outstanding, the Akademi may extend the term by up to another 3 years, which would also be subject to review.
- 4.41 The MOC must formulate fresh rules of recruitment in this regard very early and should go through the process of appointing a Secretary in the next one year. The present incumbents may be permitted to apply in case they otherwise fulfil the revised rules.
- 4.42 The Secretary, as we have said, must be a person of eminence. At the same time, he/she must preferably have some expertise in administration. To bridge any gap between outside eminence and internal management, one of the Deputy Secretaries of the Akademi should be made, by a process of selection from among the Deputy Secretaries of the Akademi, a Joint Secretary, at a pay scale of a Director in Government. The Joint Secretary would be entitled to be the Secretary provided he/she attains distinction through academic, professional or creative work and is otherwise eligible. Besides, he/she must give up the service benefits in his/her existing capacity to become the Secretary on contract and will not be entitled to return to any position in the Akademi.

Executive Board

- 4.43 The composition of the Executive Boards of the 3 Akademis as per the three Constitutions is different in each Akademi. The LKA has 15, including 6 officials and nominees, the SNA 16 including 5 officials and nominees, and the SA as many as 29, including 5 officials and nominees and one each representing the 24 recognised languages. Is this logical? The Khosla Committee had preferred a very small Board for each Akademi, comprising the Chairperson/President, the Vice-Chairperson/Vice-President, the Financial Advisor, one representative of MOC

and five persons elected by the GC. (para 6.8, page 148). The Haksar Committee had proposed that, other than the officials, the LKA could have 9 members elected out of various categories, (para 5.89); there was no specific proposal regarding the size of the Executive Board of the SNA or the SA, which at that time had 22 representatives of languages on the EB.

4.44 The SA additionally allows the President to invite, at his discretion, to any meeting of the Executive Board a member of the GC in the interest of encouraging languages other than (the recognised languages). Are such invitees required in the name of language, when all the 24 languages are already covered? When there are Language Advisory Boards, is the inclusion of all languages in the executive a matter of necessity or of accommodation? And yet, we find that the Advisory Board meetings of the SA, with its large membership, are well attended.

4.45 Is there any advantage to a common pattern and size? It is no doubt a matter of managerial convenience as with the SA, so that there is no choosing to be done. There is a requirement of efficiency. Having considered the whole picture, and in view of many other changes we are proposing to the system, we feel that one more change may not be particularly useful at this stage.

4.46 With the abolition of the post of Vice Chairperson, if any occasion arises when the Chairperson is not able to perform his/her functions temporarily, the Executive Board may select a temporary Chairperson for a period up to one month on their own, or in consultation with Government, if for a longer period.

Finance Committees

4.47 We do not wish to comment, for the same reason, on the composition of the three Finance Committees. The Financial Advisor should be the Joint Secretary would be. However, in the case of the SA, the Vice-Chairperson chairs the Finance Committee. Since we have recommended the abolition of the posts of Vice-Chairperson, the FA in any case has to be the Chairperson of the Committee.

4.48 The only area of activity where all the three Akademis converge is in the responsibilities of the Finance Committee. The Rule is the same for all the 3 Akademis - "The Finance Committee shall consider the budget estimates of the Akademi, make recommendations thereon to the Executive Board and prescribe the total limits of expenditure within a financial year." This is a budget side activity, not an expenditure side responsibility. The Finance Committee does not, according to this phrasing, have the powers to examine new expenditure or give advice in the course of the year on any new financial matters that may be brought before it for consideration. A better turn of phrase is required to give the Committee its true and complete role.

Financial Matters

4.49 All three Akademis have expressed before our Committee a need for more funds, but more importantly a better flow of funds. The latter problem arises out of a peculiar budgetary problem, which is that a Vote on Account does not allow more than a small percentage of the annual funds to be released at the start of the year. This is further reduced by the amount held over at the start of the financial year by the institutions. But the 'unspent balance', as it is termed, is caused by the late release of funds at the end of the year, in March, a Catch-22 situation. This, we feel, is only a means to control, even crunch, spending.

4.50 Since the Akademis are autonomous institutions with the Financial Advisor as their Finance Officer, it makes no sense to make deductions like this. True, an amount meant for a purpose cannot be held on to indefinitely. But, sometimes, schemes and new projects do take time to mature as programmes and there may be a genuine time lag between the release of funds and its spending. We are of the view that the amount could be allowed to be retained for up to one year from the date of release, after which it would have to be returned if not spent.

4.51 The funds provided to the Akademis over the years have not increased to any degree commensurate with the desired extent of their activities. Given that the Akademis should be the moving force behind the efforts of Government to encourage the arts, we feel that the amount is minuscule in comparison to the cultural aspirations and the creative needs of the people. There has to be substantial increase in their funding.

4.52 The Khosla Committee and the Haksar Committee had both recommended the setting up of a fund to assist the Akademis. That did not happen. In 1997, the National Culture Fund was created but its funds have gone very largely to assist the tangible heritage of the country, and there is no synergy with the three Akademis.

4.53 If the MOC is unable to provide more funds, one way is to tap into the surplus funds of public sector organisations. The Companies Act 2013, (Act 18 of 2013) provides the basis for Corporate Social Responsibility (CSR). Section 135, which pertains to CSR, applies to companies with a net worth of Rs 500 crore or more, an annual turnover of Rs 1,000 crore or more or a net profit of Rs 5 crore or more. Our Committee recommends that each Akademi sets up a fund into which amounts received as CSR support are placed.

A Matter of Excellence

4.54 The Akademis were set up in the hope that creative excellence would be encouraged. And that the academic standards expected of an Akademi would be

maintained. It is very easy to slip into mediocrity and, as we have indicated earlier, we must fight to prevent that from happening. Every two years a performance/management audit should be done by reputed institutions of the activities of the Akademi. For maintaining quality in academic work, a peer review system may be appropriate. The Akademis will need to display their capacity for self-introspection, if they are to remain truly independent, and hold their heads high.

Synergy and Coordination Issues

- 4.55 There are two aspects of synergy and coordination that are relevant to the three Akademis. First is among themselves, and the second is the need for synergy with other institutions. In both aspects, much can be done.
- 4.56 Coordination of infrastructure is the starting point for any attempt at synergy. Rabindra Bhavan, which houses the three Akademis, suffers from two deficiencies, one a lack of space, and the other, a lack of proper management of the infrastructure. The Bhavan cannot be expanded easily. The debate about modernising and redoing existing spaces will always remain, and the Rabindra Bhavan is no exception. The MOC cannot be indifferent to the felt needs of its most important institutions. Space has to be found for the expansion or even the relocation of the main offices of the three Akademis. Our Committee is of the view that the time has come for a renewed thrust in the activities of the Akademis and there is a need for more space for each Akademi. We believe that out of the vast empty spaces held by the IGNCA a part could be offered for a joint development of facilities by the three Akademis to create a new cultural area which would include a cluster of facilities for the three Akademis. One would be a library run by the SA, one an exhibition-cum-storage area managed by the LKA and the third a performance space for the SNA.
- 4.57 The management of the Rabindra Bhavan is supposed to be done by a committee including the three Akademis. This was suggested as far back as 1964 by the Bhabha Committee. In reality, though, there is little coordination. The whole building looks shabby and congested. The day to day maintenance of the entire Rabindra Bhavan must be handed over to a specialised housekeeping organisation who would be paid from a common fund to be created for this purpose.
- 4.58 At the programmatic level, synergy must be in academic collaboration. We believe the three Akademis could jointly support inter-disciplinary studies. They should hold joint workshops and discussions in areas of common theoretical importance.

4.59 The other aspect is synergy with other institutions. An important requirement is the vertical flow of activity between the Akademis and the ZCCs. The Akademis must reach out to the grassroots level by working with the ZCCs. There is an evident upward movement of expertise from the larger urban centres to Delhi. The composition of the membership of the GC and the Executive Board indicates this. The 'creative class' as such elite has been termed, naturally moves towards urban centres which, first of all, provide certain facilities and then, certain privileges. It is necessary for the Akademis to shed their metropolitan outlook and reach out to smaller towns and even rural areas.

4.60 The support for tribal and folk forms must not be a token one. There has been criticism of the lack of structural balance and in programmatic effort by the Akademis. This would be reduced if issues of equity are addressed through the use of the ZCCs to reach out to a larger non-metropolitan, non-sophisticate audience. From the culture pool of young men and women to be appointed by the MOC contractually, one should be placed in each ZCC to liaise with the Akademis.

A Common Library

4.61 The library of the Sahitya Akademi, started in 1956, is too small to cater to the growing output of the publishing industry. Even the Akademi's own books are not always to be found. The space required fifty years ago and today are not comparable, and yet, it remains an extremely insufficient space. Obviously, apart from funds, the actual space available determines the acquisition of books. The other two Akademis also require space for their collection and for an increasing need of reference material.

4.62 We recommend that a common Library of Culture be set up covering all the three Akademis and the National School of Drama. This could be housed in the space proposed to be provided at the IGNCA. It should become, soon, a library second only to the National Library. Each institution should retain a small segment of its collection in its own premises.

4.63 The MOC should set up a group to supervise the creation of this new library. It should assess the needs of space, staffing and other requirements and have it set up over the next three years. The group should meet under the Chairmanship of the JS in charge of libraries and comprise eminent librarians to advise and assist in the process.

Rewriting of the Constitutions

4.64 The changes we have contemplated require a comprehensive rewriting of the Constitutions of the three Akademis. Other changes are also recommended in the

relevant chapters for each Akademi. We note that the three Constitutions are differently constructed. The language of the Constitution of the LKA is particularly verbose and complex. We recommend that a working group be set up, chaired by a senior officer of the MOC, with the three Secretaries of the Akademis, experts in the arts and at least one legal expert to draw up the new Constitutions. Thereafter the Government will have to use its overarching powers to direct the Akademis to adopt these changes. Is this an acceptable way of dealing with change? Can and should the Government interfere so vehemently? We believe it can, and should if the need arises. We do believe that the need exists today.

5. SANGEET NATAK AKADEMI

“India's precious heritage of music, drama and dance is one which we must cherish and develop. We must do so not only for our own sake but also as our contribution to the cultural heritage of mankind. Nowhere is it truer than in the field of art that to sustain means to create. : Maulana Abul Kalam Azad.

Set up of the Akademi

- 5.1 The Sangeet Natak Akademi was the first of the three Akademis set up by the Government of India. It was set up by Resolution no. F. 6-5/51- G2 (A) dated 31 May, 1952, and formally inaugurated by the President of India on 28 January 1953. In 1961 it was reconstituted as a Society under the Societies Registration Act, 1860 (as amended in 1957). The Jawaharlal Nehru Manipur Dance Academy, set up in Imphal by the Government of India in 1954, became a constituent of the Akademi in 1957. The Kathak Kendra, the National Institute of Kathak, set up in New Delhi in 1964, is also part of the Akademi. The Sattriya Kendra was set up in Guwahati in 2001. On the other hand, the National School of Drama which had been set up in 1959, separated from the SNA in 1975.
- 5.2 The Akademi's Memorandum of Association, in traditional Governmental style, lists as its object as many as 27 activities. Of these 15 are aims which are the true purpose for which the Akademi was started. Many of these aims and objectives need to be reviewed. For example, the very first aim of the SNA is to co-ordinate the activities of regional or State Academies of music, dance and drama. Since State Academies do not fall under the jurisdiction of the Centre, the coordination of the activities of these bodies is not quite possible. In any case, it does not happen. Some of the aims, for example those with regard to theatre – and there are six that pertain to theatre - do not seem to have been sufficiently followed in action. Folk music is mentioned along with various others such as martial music, and will require emphasis. There are new areas of activity that may need nurturing. Its lack of academic bias is apparent. It would be useful, therefore, for the Akademi to review its aims and objects.
- 5.3 Clarity of purpose in an institution like the Akademi is essential. And after six decades, it is time to take stock and look ahead. Over the years the SNA has tended to become more a platform for the encouragement of performance rather than a centre for academic excellence. We recommend that a vision statement be prepared to provide afresh the raison d'être for the existence of the Akademi. That statement must be followed by a mission statement, which would indicate the activities it would involve itself in.

The General Council

5.4 The SNA's GC, which has a total of 68 persons, includes a membership of 5 persons nominated by the Government of India (Clause 4. iii). These are not officials, for there is a separate set of nominations which covers Government officers. We believe this category should be for eminent men and women, with preference for academic stature, because they must represent the intellectual and academic scholarship that an Akademi must encourage. There is need for clarity in this regard.

Chairperson

5.5 The selection of the Chairperson is most simply dealt with, among all three Akademis, in the Constitution of the SNA– it has a Chairman to be appointed by the President of India. It cannot be a whimsical proposal of the MOC to the President. There has to be a well laid out process, and known to all. Though we have proposed a common system for all three Akademis in the previous chapter, a further mention is required here. The SNA has four significant wings to its activities, music, dance, theatre and folk forms. We would not like to compartmentalise the selection of the Chairperson according to any category. Instead, we would hope that eminence which would transcend in all these spheres is recognised in selecting the Chairperson.

Vice Chairman

5.6 The SNA has a curious construct of there being no Vice Chairman shown under Clause 4 of the Memorandum of Association. This is presumably because the Vice Chairman has to be elected from among its GC members. We have in the previous Chapter expressed our dissatisfaction with an alternate centre of power that the position of Vice Chairperson can create in an Akademi. We repeat here that the position of Vice Chairperson be abolished.

Other Members

5.7 Under Clause 4 iv of the Constitution of the Akademi, one eminent person in the field of performing arts is nominated by each of the States and Union Territories enumerated in the Constitution of India in consultation with the State Akademies or equivalent institutions. The Akademi recognises 22 State Akademis (*Annexure XXII*). Of these three are in one State, Madhya Pradesh. Obviously many States do not have a body to consult and one State would have three to consult. In such cases, the consultation of 'equivalent institutions' as laid down in the Constitution will come into operation. The SNA should obtain a list of three names as indicated in Chapter 4 from each State, without formally insisting on

consultation with the State Akademis. The final selection should be made as proposed in Chapter 4.

The Executive Board

5.8 As per the Constitution of the Akademi, the general superintendence, direction and control of the affairs of the Akademi shall be vested in the Executive Board of the Akademi which shall be the Governing Body of the Akademi. Unfortunately, there is a perceptible regional bias in the selection of Members for this body. In the 1999-2004, the Executive Board, which consisted of 18 members, had 3 from the South, of whom one is largely based in Delhi. The North-East was well represented, with four including the then Chairperson (whose address was Delhi/Mumbai), from that region. Not unexpectedly, Delhi was represented, including the officials, by 8 persons.

5.9 In 2004-2009, of 18 members, again 7 were from Delhi, including the Chairman and Secretary, and 2 officers. The spread was better, with 4 from the South, including the Vice-Chairperson, one from Mumbai, one Kolkata, one Jaipur, one Bhubaneshwar, two Ahmedabad and one Shillong. For 2009-14, however, there were as many as 10 out of 15 from Delhi. Including the Chairperson, 3 were from Chennai, one from Mumbai and one from Chandigarh. How will the Akademi move out into the rest of India? Our Committee recommends that over and above the official nominees, not more than three to four persons shall be from Delhi. We also believe that conscious effort must be made to bring on board eminent persons from States which are rarely, if ever, represented.

5.10 We use the term 'States' with deliberation. The impression we gain from the study of the composition of the GC and the Executive Board is that there is a high concentration of experts from two or three of the larger metropolises, mainly Delhi. These same persons are on various committees, advisory bodies, and expert groups. As Maulana Abul Kalam Azad had pointed out, the arts can derive their sustenance only from the people; the sustenance of the Akademi through a very limited segment of the people would create a hiatus between the 'haves' and 'have nots' of cultural wealth.

Other Aspects of the Constitution

5.11 The larger aspects of the Constitution of all three Akademis have been considered in the previous Chapter. A few aspects of the SNA's Constitution require our consideration here. The quorum for the GC is only 10. This is about 15% of the membership and a very low number. Indeed, for a meeting which is held once in a year, one should expect a larger turnout, otherwise what is the contribution of all these members except to say that they are members of the

Akademi? If there is a lack of quorum at the convening of the meeting, the meeting may adjourned for a while and the adjourned meeting held with the members assembled. We would recommend that the quorum should be fixed at 40% for the Committees and 25% for the GC.

- 5.12 In the expectation of a re-writing of the Constitution, we would recommend a minor change here. It is best that the location of the Registered Office, as written down, is not restricted to Rabindra Bhavan but to the National Capital Region.

Advisory Committees

- 5.13 The Akademi has 8 Advisory Committees (*Annexure XXIII*). These were set up in 2009 by the Executive Board under Rule 11.iv of the Rules and Regulations by which such Standing Committees can be set up. This, we believe, is a step in the right direction. And yet, a view has been expressed that there is an insufficient representation from the South in these Advisory bodies. This should not be a matter of concern in some of the Committees, but the position regarding some does reflect an imbalance.

- 5.14 The most relevant Committees for our purpose here are those for Music, Dance and Theatre. In the Committee on Music, 3 out of 12 are from the South. The Committee on Dance, out of 9, has two from the South and two others from the South who are actually Delhi based. The Committee on Theatre has 2 out of 13 from the South. All the members are eminent, and there is no doubt about their capacity. And yet, there is a feeling that the South, which boasts of major traditions in the performing arts, does not have sufficient representation. In our country, merit and not regionalism must be paramount. It would be awkward to suggest regional quotas and we would not agree to any. But the thought is equally unacceptable that there is insufficient merit and capacity the farther we go from Delhi. If unavailable, then that capacity must be created. We recommend that greater representation must be given to eminent persons outside Delhi. The Akademi must be alert to this requirement.

Programming and Programmes

- 5.15 The Sangeet Natak Akademi holds on to the traditional Governmental approach to programming. It uses the age old system of schemes, because of the budgeting system, but seems unable through these schemes to assess the spread and impact of its effort. The Akademi does not evaluate the proportion of the budget it spends on the four areas of its activity - music, dance and theatre and folk forms - and on its spatial distribution. While we understand its need to follow the Government budgeting procedures, we would recommend that using modern management techniques, the SNA should undertake a discipline-wise impact

assessment to ensure balance between its 4 main areas of activity and its equitable geographical spread.

- 5.16 The Akademi's schematic expenditure over 5 years indicates three trends. First, the expenditure on schemes is an insufficient part of the total funds. Second, there is from year to year a sudden uneven allocation of funds for performance. This is because of special programmes and celebrations. Third, the expenditure on performance based programmes is much higher than on academic work. The expenditure on academic work as a percentage of the total expenditure has been coming down. We feel that the academic aspect of the mandate of SNA must not be lost sight of. Instead, it must be strengthened.

Lack of Academic Emphasis

- 5.17 Our interaction with artistes has repeatedly brought up the view that academic and research activity does not seem to be of importance to the SNA. It is relatively easy to manage a performance, but difficult to enter a theoretical construct of that performance. Performance Studies and Dance Studies are new academic disciplines in some of our Universities. The SNA must be aware of an increasing gap between practitioners of the performing arts and the theoreticians, and must set up a platform for debate, discussion and analysis.

- 5.18 SNA must hold regular workshops on theoretical aspects of the performing arts. It must begin a regular programme on performing arts appreciation for the public. At a more serious academic level, courses on critical writing on dance, music and theatre must be started. The archives must be opened up for scholars who should be encouraged to use these archives. The SNA must be a vehicle for seeking a larger space in the media for cultural activities.

- 5.19 We would also suggest that the SNA works out a long term academic programme at the university level for providing scholarships to students. Overall, the SNA's relationship with academia must be strengthened.

Stipends and Grants

- 5.20 Delays in the release of funds cause hardship for young scholars and performers. The slow disbursement of grants, whether deliberate or not, whether a matter of indifference or not, removes the very financial security that the grant was supposed to provide. We understand that funds are often released by the MOC very late. At times schemes are announced and only partly funded. We feel that under no circumstances should there be any delay in the release of grants.

5.21 For project related grants, the SNA's scheme does not specify a timeline for application. This is understandable as they may be short term proposals. That scheme allows projects from 2 months to 2 years. There are various types of grants. All grantees must be placed on the website of the SNA with all relevant details to enable the public to judge the transparency of the process. This will also enable better management of funds.

Synergy with ZCCs

5.22 The Akademi must find a way towards greater coordination with the seven Zonal Cultural Centres. This would be essential for greater synergy and to avoid duplication of effort. The Akademi should have performances not only in Delhi or important urban centres, but also in smaller towns using the ZCCs in each region. On its part, it can assist the ZCCs with training support, academic enrichment and quality programming.

5.23 The reverse is also true. While classical forms tend to build expertise in metropolises, but should travel to small towns and rural areas, the place for traditional, folk, tribal and rural forms must not remain entirely rural. The SNA must scout for talent through the ZCCs and raise that talent to the national level.

Music, Dance, Theatre and Traditional Forms

5.24 There is a recommendation of the Department-related Parliamentary Committee in its 201st Report that there should be a separate Akademi for Tribal and Folk Arts (para 67). The Mani Shankar Aiyar Committee to study the working of the ZCCs has also recommended such an Akademi. We have considered this in some detail. If the SNA and the other institutions were to leave all work pertaining to the encouragement of the folk arts to a new Akademi, the mainstreaming of our rich heritage might receive a setback. If the SNA, for example, gave up its awards for traditional forms, it would become an elitist institution, something we feel we ought to discourage. The SNA's cooperative work with the ZCCs must receive a boost, especially in documentation and in research on folk forms of dance, music and theatre, and in mainstreaming these forms.

5.25 Public impression, even if incorrect, is that the Akademi tends to support the classical forms of music and dance and that folk forms are comparatively neglected. From the schematic presentation of expenditure we do not notice any bias. It is true that there is a need to bring into the limelight our traditional forms of dance and music. At the same time music and dance is moving into new areas, into experimentation and new creative expressions. We would recommend that equitable emphasis should be provided by the SNA to all forms of dance, music and theatre.

5.26 We would like to make special reference here to the variety of music that exists in India. The emphasis in the Akademi has been on the classical forms, Hindustani and Carnatic. But, as we have noted, the work on other traditional systems is limited. Baul is an intangible heritage of UNESCO, but inscribed by Bangladesh, when this form of song and music is equally popular in West Bengal and some other parts of eastern India. It seems to find no place in the scheme of things of the SNA. Is 'new tradition' an oxymoron? Rabindra Sangeet, which did not exist 150 years ago, is such an influence today among Bengalis. Is it now traditional? It is certainly not folk or tribal. Perhaps a better researched listing and grouping of forms may be required. Perhaps too much of categorisation is the problem.

5.27 Western music, especially classical and chamber music, has a fairly large following in India. It has been part of the curriculum in many schools for decades, both before and after Independence. The Northeast of India, particularly, has a very strong cultural affinity towards western dance and music. Various schools of music in our cities provide for the teaching of western music. School choirs exist, as do the military bands, but there is no recognition of the role of western music in our culture. We should not blot out all influences of Western music; they are a part of our recent explorations in music. As a niche area, western music receives no encouragement from Government. We recommend that the funding programme of the SNA carries a small component for western music and carefully selected academies may be financially supported.

Awards

5.28 The SNA awards are given in five areas of the performing arts – music, dance, theatre, other traditional /folk/ tribal/ dance/ music/ theatre and puppetry, and contribution / scholarship in the performing arts. There are 8 awards each in the first four categories and 1 in the last one (*Annexure XXIV*) There are potential imbalances and awkwardness in the categorisation. For the 8 awards in music, there are six 'categories'. In dance, for the 8 awards, there are 11 'categories'. In theatre, there is no award for dramaturgy or for children's theatre. In folk forms, the 8 awards are for two categories, both awkwardly defined - 1. Other Traditional / Folk / Tribal/ Music/ Dance and Theatre not covered under the earlier groups (6 awards), and 2. Puppetry /Mime/Allied Arts of Traditional Forms e.g. Instrument making and Mask making etc (2 awards). These may require redefinition.

5.29 In each of the three groups of Music, Dance and Theatre, there is a sub-category of 'other major traditions'. But other forms not covered under Music, Dance and Theatre has also 6 awards. There are difficulties in differentiating between 'other major traditions' and 'other traditional' forms. We would

recommend that an elaborate list in each of 'other major traditions' is prepared on a permanent basis. If an addition has to be made, it may be done by the Executive Board.

- 5.30 There are two possible ways of selecting awardees. One is that the number of awardees is increased. The other is that categories are abolished. If categories are removed, some specialisations may not receive recognition. We do realise that some forms are very well known while in some forms, artistes toil away without any recognition. On the other hand, quota in excellence is a contradiction in terms. But how does one decide? It is a fact that much depends on impression, on recommendation even if validly done, on public image. We recommend that a small group be set up by the SNA to recommend a complete overhaul of the awards process and a simplification of the regulations.
- 5.31 One other aspect of the awards process is that the award is a one-time recognition and does not seem to lead to any sustained improvement in the performance schedule of an artist. In the case of its young awardees, the SNA would do well to provide a series of performances for them at the ZCC level over a year after their award. It would be a boost for fledgling careers.

Auditoria and Performance Spaces

- 5.32 It is unfortunate that the premier institution of music and dance in India has no significant performance space of its own. This is symbolic of our lack of infrastructure for creative expression. The SNA has under its charge in Delhi, the Rabindra Rangashala, an open-air performance space. But this is on the edge of the ridge and we understand that no construction on the site is permitted. In any case, an open space can be used only for certain kinds of performances, it has its limitations. The 3 small open air spaces of Meghdoot in the Rabindra Bhavan complex are fit only for small performances. On the other hand, there is the Siri Fort Auditorium in Delhi, which is under the control of the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting (Directorate of Film Festivals) and maintained by the Central Public Works Department. The annual International Film Festival of India is now held in Goa and so the Siri Fort auditorium complex is primarily a space for the performing arts. Our Committee recommends that the auditorium complex should come under the charge of the SNA. Apart from the main large auditorium, there are two smaller performing spaces in the complex which can be used effectively for lecture-demonstrations of dance and music.
- 5.33 Apart from this, the SNA would do well to locate new performance spaces or land for new spaces. It is necessary that the SNA urgently creates for its use at least one significant performance area. The Akademi must create a National

Centre for the Performing Arts under its auspices, which would include its National Museum of Performing Arts. And it must be an activist for cultural spaces that are friendly to the differently abled.

Staffing

5.34 The cost of staff of the SNA was Rs 3.79 crores in 2012-13, about 11% of the total expenditure of the SNA in that year, which is reasonable (*Annexure XXV*). The percentage of regular Group D staff in the total cost of salaries is about 6%. There may be other contractual staff whose details we do not have. Nevertheless, we appreciate the fact that, unlike in many other public organisations, there is no imbalance in favour of staffing at the junior levels. We do not believe that there should be an intellectual hiatus between groups of people. But for that our education policy must go beyond literacy towards erudition. Within its own realm of activity, the Akademi must have regular in-service training programmes for its staff, not merely in Government procedures, but in the appreciation of the performing arts.

5.35 At the senior level, the Akademi has 9 Deputy Secretaries. Apart from one each for Administration and Finance, there are programmatic DSs for music, dance and theatre, and one each for publications, documentation and coordination and library and information. There are also Directors for the Kathak Kendra, the JNMDA. The DS for coordination should be placed in charge of academic coordination and be re-designated suitably.

6. THE SAHITYA AKADEMI

*No great literature can be produced unless men have the courage to be lonely in their minds, to be free in their thoughts and to express whatever occurs to them. :
Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan.*

Set up of the Akademi

6.1 The Sahitya Akademi was set up by Resolution No. F. 6-4/51 G. 2. (A) dated 15 December, 1952 of the Government of India, and formally inaugurated on 12 March 1954. Its first Council, nominated by the Government, included a galaxy of eminent litterateurs - Jawaharlal Nehru, Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan, C. Rajagopalachari, Maulana Abul Kalam Azad, K.M. Munshi, K. M. Panikkar, D. V. Gundappa, Humayun Kabir, Suniti Kumar Chatterjee, Vallathol Narayana Menon, Masti Venkatesh Iyengar, Mahadevi Varma, Zakir Hussain, Ram Dhari Singh Dinakar, Nilmani Phukan, Rajsekhar Bose and others. We mention these names here to indicate that the Government had the vision to consider the best in nomination, and even the Prime Minister and the Education Minister could be a members of the GC. That is hardly possible today. We can do no better than quote Nehru, “As President of the Akademi, I may tell you quite frankly I would not like the Prime Minister to interfere with my work”. The independence sought for by the Akademi at the start of its existence is evident even today.

6.2 There is today some concern that the Akademi needs greater transparency in its functioning, and that view comes from some senior writers and awardees themselves. There is a tendency we discern in the Akademi of stating that all is well with it. But nothing is perfect; we only can aim towards it. It surely cannot be that no change is required forever, the natural process of aging requires refurbishing, and we hope the Akademi will see its position in that light.

General Council

6.3 The General Council has a very large membership of up to 99 persons. There are mainly five categories of members – those nominated by the Government and ex-officio members, representatives of universities, the language representatives, representatives of States and eminent persons specially selected.

The States in the Akademi

6.4 The provision in the Constitution of the Akademi, under Clause 10.iv, which requires the States' representation to be based on the recommendation of the State Akademis needs reconsideration. The provision is as follows:

One person from each of the States/ Union Territories enumerated in the Constitution of India, as nominated by the outgoing General Council from a panel of a maximum of three names recommended by the State/ UT Akademis and where there are no State/UT Akademis or where there are more than one State/UT Akademi, by the State Government/UT administration.

6.5 We note that there are only 10 State Akademis extant today (*Annexure XXVI*). Thus from 25 other States and UTs, the nomination is made by the State Government. Therefore to receive recommendations from State Akademis is not quite feasible. We reiterate here our recommendation from the common Chapter on the Akademis. We recommend that each State and UT should send a recommendation of three names in alphabetical order for the GC, of which one would be selected by a Committee as laid down in Chapter 4.

6.6 The same rule also states that the nominees shall be eminent persons in the field of letters and not necessarily functionaries of the Government or the Union Territory administration. We believe that the nominees should not be officials or politicians unless they are themselves persons of stature in literature.

The Universities in the Akademi

6.7 This Akademi includes in its membership a certain number of Universities. The number of these Universities has grown from perhaps 19 at the time of Independence to 659 at the start of 2014. Of these, 45 are Central Universities, 312 are State Universities, 129 are deemed Universities and 173 are private Universities. A few of these do not seem to have a valid status, but the numbers remain enormous. In 1955 there were 14 Universities represented in the Akademi, and from 1956 there have been 20. The stagnation over 60 years of the number implies either that many Universities can never be members. At the time of reconstituting the General Council in the year 2012-2013, there were around 180 Universities in India who have Post Graduate Department in Humanities. The Akademi invited recommendations from all these Universities and selected 20 representatives from different State Universities. But that is not what the Constitution states; it does not refer to Masters in Humanities as a baseline qualification. To have 20 Universities selected out of 180 is itself a Herculean task and does not stand to reason today. There is no clarity on the reasons for choosing one University and not another. Clearly there would be an element of bias in this category of selection. Universities have a role in only one Akademi and not the other two. Their contribution to the Akademi seems nebulous. We feel, in today's

world, it is best to remove this category of membership altogether from the GC of the Sahitya Akademi. The numbers would be more manageable and less amenable to any indirect interference. We appreciate that education and culture are inseparable, as the Department-related Parliamentary Committee has noted, but we feel that the role of academicians need not be through the GC, but expressed in other ways which we shall suggest later in this chapter.

Chairperson/President

6.8 The term 'Chairman' was changed to 'President' in 1954, in one of the first decisions of the Akademi. We do not feel that change must happen for the sake of change, but there is some awkwardness in the continued use of the term in today's world. In modern corporate terminology, the Chairperson is the head of an organisation. On the other hand, the President of the Akademi must not be referred to in the same breath as our first citizen. And, as we have mentioned earlier, the dual terminology of Chairperson and President when referring to the three Heads of the Akademis together is awkward. In Hindi, the term used is 'Adhyaksha' which translates to Chairperson. We recommend that, in the process of rewriting the Constitution of the Akademi, the term President should be substituted by Chairperson.

Vice President

6.9 The position of the Vice President should be abolished. The Vice President presently is the Chairperson of the Finance Committee. In the other two Akademis, the Finance Advisor is the Chairperson of the Finance Committee; that should be the system in the SA too. In the absence of the Chairperson, the procedures proposed for a substitute in Chapter 4 of this Report shall stand.

Headquarters of the Akademi

6.10 The Constitution of the Akademi allows it to shift its headquarters out of Delhi, if supported by three-fourths of the whole number of members of the General Council. We appreciate the flexibility this provides, but we would still be perturbed by the possible impact of a change if it were to be made some day. For reasons of better coordination with Government and with the other two Akademis, and despite the possibilities of Delhi-centricity which we have referred to elsewhere in this report, we feel it would be best if the headquarters of the Akademi is located in the National Capital Region.

Quorum

- 6.11 We would recommend that the quorum for meetings of all Committees should be fixed at 40%, and at 25% for the meetings of the GC.

Understanding Policy

- 6.12 The Akademi must distinguish between policy and administrative issues. The website of the Akademi, to which we shall refer again later, has a page that mentions policy. That page includes the following – travel grants, publication and pricing policy and selection procedures for awards. Clearly, only one of these three matters falls into the realm of policy, one is merely a scheme and the third, a process.
- 6.13 The Akademi, in traditional Governmental style, has powers and functions. Happily, the functions are not laid down in an over-elaborate manner and that augurs well for simplicity. But clarity of purpose in an important institution like the Akademi is required. We would recommend that a vision statement be prepared to bring clarity to the reasons for the existence of the Akademi. That statement must be followed by a mission statement, which would enable the Akademi to adequately define its activities.

Language Advisory Boards

- 6.14 The Haksar Committee has gone to great detail in studying the role of the Language Advisory Boards of the Akademi. As pointed out by the Haksar Committee, the Language Advisory Boards are very important but have no position in the Akademi's Constitution. The Executive Board has one member representing each language and that member is the convenor of the Language Advisory Board. The work of the Language Advisory Boards is not in any manner 'supervised' by the Executive Board, as no other member of the Executive Board would understand the language or the literature of that language. We can do no better than quote from the Haksar Committee's Report.

It is not surprising that the dominant part which the Convenor plays in selecting the majority of members in the Language Advisory Board often gives rise to fears about undue concentration of power and self-perpetuation. We have not undertaken a detailed investigation to see whether there is any justification for such apprehensions; but the mere fact that they are expressed by many distinguished persons, including some who are themselves members of the Akademi's General Council, is a matter of serious concern.

- 6.15 Our Committee would not like to recommend any sweeping changes to a system that has by and large worked well. And yet, issues remain. The Haksar Committee had felt that the process of eliciting suggestions for nomination to the

Advisory Board must be more broad based. All the members of the GC associated with a particular language should be consulted in the selection of the Advisory Board. That Committee proposed that suggestions from the State Akademis and relevant literary associations may initially also be called for. Though this is otherwise a good suggestion, we feel it may take a long time to receive suggestions, and process them. In other words, it may reduce the efficiency of the process.

6.16 What we propose is that the concentration of power that the Haksar Committee refers to is diminished. We do not find that any formal assessment has been made by the SA about the role and usefulness of the language Boards. We recommend that the Akademi should set up an external assessment of the contribution of these Boards over the years in the functioning of the Akademi and their contribution towards the development of the language.

6.17 The role of the Advisory Boards in the selection process of the Akademi awards needs to be reviewed. We believe that the very direct role of the Advisory Board members in the judging process must be changed to one where it is truly only advisory. They must not be party to any perceived predilection towards an author or his/her books.

The Award Process

6.18 Many men of eminence have felt that the Akademi should not at all give awards. But the opposite view has held over the years. These awards have been prestigious, and all the more therefore, have at times led to criticism of the nature of the selection process and the quality of the final choice. There have been some major controversies in the past. And some decisions of recent times also have raised eyebrows. It is not the intention of our Committee to be judgemental, but the selection process could bear examination.

6.19 In its attempt to be correct, the SA has shown excessive confidentiality in the process of selection of awards; no one seems to know which books have been selected for the long list to be read, and why. The process is extremely complex.

6.20 The present selection procedure is given at *Annexure XXVII*. It is a detailed and somewhat convoluted process in which the Language Advisory Boards have a very prominent, almost intrusive, role. The procedure briefly is that for each language, an expert prepares a “ground list”, which is sent to all members of the Language Advisory Board, who are then entitled to recommend two titles, of which neither may be in the first list and a new list is prepared. Thereafter each of ten referees, members of the Preliminary Panel set up by the President with the advice of the Advisory Board, sends his/her nomination of two books. These titles

may be selected either out of the list sent to the referee or by the referee on his/her own. From this final list of 20 books, a jury of three decides on the winner.

6.21 There are too many steps and intricacies in the selection process, and a certain degree of ad hocism. The ground list is presently prepared by a single expert and to have another expert seems to require the special dispensation of the President. In any case two are required for Sanskrit; if so, why not for the other languages? One person cannot be an expert on all the books in the language. He/she cannot have read all the books that he/she lists, and hearsay, or publicity, is not the correct way to begin the selection process. Then the list, shortened by the Advisory Board, may not, in theory, contain any book from that ground list. As the rules stand, each member of the Advisory Board may propose both the titles from the ground list, or one title from the ground list and one of his own or both the titles of his own. Thus, the entire shortlist may be made up of suggestions of the Advisory Board, and may include none from the expert's list.

Proposed Selection Process for Book Awards

6.22 We believe that this process needs to be simplified. In modern times, the international practice is to receive books from publishers and to make a shortlist out of a long list of books submitted. We believe that this practice should be followed by the SA. There should be a limit of 6 books to be submitted by a publishing house. From this, a Panel of 10 expert referees to be nominated by the Chairperson on the advice of the Advisory Board may prepare a long list of up to 50 books. Books not submitted but felt to be significant by the Panel may be added, a maximum of one book per expert. The same Panel of 10 referees must then share the reading of the books and recommend one book each. Any book recommended for the long list by a member of the Panel shall not be read by him/her at this stage, but by someone else. Out of the 10 books now in a shortlist, the referees must each read all the books, and use a grading system to recommend a final short list of 6 books in confidence to a group of 3 judges whose names should be decided by the Chairperson, from a panel of names proposed by the Advisory Board. We note that in many languages the long list may not contain 50 books and the reading load may then be adjusted suitably.

6.23 The process would therefore be a mix of openness and confidentiality where required. Neither the office, nor the Advisory Board should have the final shortlist of books. The names of the judges should remain confidential till the announcement is made of the winner. It is quite possible that the judges would know one or more of the shortlisted writers personally. They must make a declaration of that equation and if anyone is related to a candidate, he/she should be asked to withdraw. A mere acquaintanceship should not disqualify the judge, but the fact should be recorded by the Secretary of the Akademi internally.

6.24 The names of the Panel of experts should be made known, because there they can do little to influence the final decision. On the other hand, a bad selection of a short list of 10 would do harm to their own reputation in the public eye. Once the award is announced, as is now done, the list of books in the short list of 6 books must also be announced. At this stage, the original long list must also be made known. The names of the judges must also be announced and their brief reasons for selecting the winner. There is public perception that goes either way – one may be criticised for lack of transparency or for wrong choice. But transparency would reduce complacency and the scope of error.

Yuva Puraskar and Bal Sahitya Puraskar

6.25 The Bal Sahitya Puraskar for children’s literature is in its 5th year. It is, for the first five years, meant for a lifetime’s work or for a single work. The award follows the process of creating a “ground list”. The Yuva Puraskar is for authors below the age of 35. Its Preliminary Panel receives recommendations from the Language Advisory Board members and then the Jury process takes over. We believe that in both these awards, nominations from publishers should be the starting point of the selection process. The same process proposed for the main awards should be followed here too.

Awards for Literary Criticism and Non-Fiction

6.26 We have stated earlier that the Universities should cease to be members of the GC. But the removal of the Universities from the GC must be compensated by academic support. The quality of academic work in many of our Universities is generally believed to have deteriorated over the past few decades. We would like the SA to become a supporter of not just creative work, but also of critical academic appreciation of creative work. Once in a while, a work of criticism does get the Akademi award, but these are few and far between. We would recommend that an additional award be instituted in all the languages for the best work of literary criticism. The work must not be for the editor of a set of articles by a motley group of academics, but for a single work of criticism by a single author. This single work may include a collection of essays by the same author. Non-fiction is becoming an important genre of writing nowadays. A work of non-fiction, such as a study of any subject written in a literary style, could also be considered for the same award.

Poetry and Drama

6.27 In the 5 year since 2009, of all the awards in all the languages, only one seems to have gone to a playwright, in Punjabi. Poetry is propped up mainly because of Sanskrit and Urdu, both languages with a strong emphasis in poetry

and, unexpectedly, Bodo. In these three languages awards have given in the five years to 4 poets each. While it is not our intention to comment here on the process, it would merit some attention. There does not seem to be much recognition given to these areas of literature. The Akademi, in its own publication programme has brought out a few books of poetry and drama but greater encouragement is required for these genres. The process of awards and the ultimate winners indicates a strong bias towards fiction. A balance is required between all genres of writing and the Sahitya Akademi should be a catalyst for these neglected genres.

- 6.28 The work of the Language Advisory Boards should be judged not so much by their contribution to the secretive award selection process, but by their effort to popularise the literature of that language. Poets, novelists and short fiction writers must be offered readings from their own works and play readings should be held. Young authors, particularly, should be encouraged to read from their work. Tier II and Tier III towns must be covered in a special effort to popularise literature.

Translations

- 6.29 The Akademi has four Centres for translations at Ahmedabad, Delhi, Bangalore and Shantiniketan. The first of these was established in 1996 in Bangalore, and the others over the next few years. The total number of books translated by the Akademi is a meagre number considering the large volume of publications in each language. The demand today for translations is increasing. We would recommend that a draft list be prepared for the medium term, which would be a list of books to be translated and the languages into which they would be translated. This list should be made public, asking for suggestions.

- 6.30 There is a need for greater coordination and emphasis on the work of translations. The officer who looks after translations does so along with his main work of looking after publications and other items of work. We recommend that a person may be appointed on contract and placed solely in charge of coordinating all translation work.

Transparency and a Public Face

- 6.31 The website of an organisation indicates how transparent the organisation is, how forthcoming in providing information. It is surely not intentional that it is not easy to obtain certain basic details about the activities of the Akademi, and the outcomes of these activities. The Akademi has a Facebook page with over 11000 visitors and a large Twitter handle of over 2500. Its website received 144004 visitors in 2013, a fairly large number. And yet, the website, which is managed inhouse, is so constructed that sufficient emphasis has not been placed on providing easy access to relevant information.

- 6.32 The drop down menu on the website of the Akademi provides for ‘Authors’. Are these authors who have been published by the Akademi or those awarded by the Akademi or well known authors in every language? The search leads us to a page with a search for authors, according to the letters of the English alphabet. But a name typed in the space for the search or a click on a letter leads to an “invalid inputs drives error” message. Another example is of a search for the list of award winners of the Akademi; after another search through the drop down menu, access is denied. The website of the Akademi does not seem to list its award winners. The Akademi needs to become more technologically skilled, and aware of the need for better dissemination of information. The entire system should be overhauled. We recommend that the SA gives its website to a professional agency for maintenance and updating.
- 6.33 How does the Akademi review its own working? We find that the Akademi feels that all is well with its functioning. Self-satisfaction is worrisome. We recommend that every two years a performance audit is done by reputed institutions of the activities of the Akademi.

Library

- 6.34 We have already commented on the acute lack of space in the Akademi’s library. In 2003, there were 1,25,000 books and it was felt to be ‘choked’ even then. In 2013, the number was approximately 1,70,000. The library has a membership of about 10,000, about 100 persons visit the library every day and on an average, 150 books are issued daily. We repeat here that the Library of Culture, common to all three Akademis, must be set up urgently, and the MOC must take a leading role in coordinating this. We also recommend that, even before the Library of Culture is set up, the SA should find space to temporarily expand its library.
- 6.35 We also note that in this age of the internet, it is essential for the library to go online. To begin with, a list of all the books in the library must be placed online. Renewal of books could also be brought online in due course. A separate section on that register of books, must list all the books published by the Akademi.
- 6.36 The Akademi also has libraries at its Regional Offices, Kolkata, Bangalore and Mumbai. The Kolkata library has around 27,000 books, Bangalore has 28,000 books and the newly established Mumbai library has around 9000 books. We have not been able to ascertain the physical condition in these regional libraries, but would recommend that they also go online to enable searches and renewals without the member having to come to the library.

Publications and Sales

6.37 The Akademi has had a long history of publications and the number of books published is very large, approximately 6000 books. The maximum number is in Hindi, followed by English. Many of these are translations, especially from regional languages into English. They are nowadays well brought out, and cover some drama and poetry, two areas that private publishers rarely touch. And yet, the programme has some inherent problems. Very few persons have actually read books brought out by the SA. The reason for this lies in the very effort to make them available. The books are priced low with the intention that the average reader would be able to afford it. But this discourages most booksellers and distributors as their margin is very low. Therefore, the books of SA are found largely in the Akademi's own counters, and at book fairs where the Akademi participates.

6.38 Our Committee is of the opinion that the Akademi publications must be more easily and widely available. If the cost of a book is kept too low, as is done by the Akademi as a matter of policy, it loses its value for the distributor and the bookseller. The pricing policy should be such that there are adequate returns for the author, distributor and the bookseller. We have also recommended later that the expenditure of the Akademi on publicity, which could include higher subsidies for sales, should be increased.

6.39 Another sales effort must be through online sales. For one, there are important online booksellers today and there should be a special effort to have them sell the Akademi's books. Besides, the Akademi itself must sell its books online.

6.40 There is no specialisation in the Akademi for marketing. The traditional approaches must be replaced by a robust effort. We note that the Federation of Indian Publishers is represented on the GC of the Akademi. We believe that the Federation should be active in improving the sales of the Akademi's books. We would hope that using modern sales techniques, the Akademi's publication and sales programme is brought to such a position that we notice books with the famous SA logo in every bookstore.

Intellectual Property

6.41 Our Committee notes that there is no special capacity in the Akademi with regard to intellectual property matters. In the new age of copyright issues, it is essential that the Akademi has either in-house expertise or has access to legal expertise in copyright matters. Facilitation should be provided to access such advice, at a small cost, to any author who wishes to avail of the facility. Certainly, the Akademi has a role both towards the author and the publisher in a dispute, but we feel that the support must be for the author, if sides have to be taken.

6.42 There are cases where publishers and even Government organisations such as NCERT use material without acknowledgement or payment to authors. We feel that the Language Advisory Boards should begin to play an active role on behalf of authors. This need not be restricted to authors published or awarded by the Akademi.

Programmatic Issues

6.43 The availability of funds for the Akademi is insufficient. There are certain activities which require strengthening. While the publications scheme receives 25% of the total funds, the percentage of the total expenditure of the Akademi for publicity and promotional effort is about 7%. Given the relatively insufficient sales of its books, the SA has to increase funds for this activity. The other concern is about the lack of any effort for the translation of Indian books into foreign languages. There is no budget for this. We feel that our own literature must find a place abroad and a special effort for this is required.

Staffing Issues

6.44 The ratio of staff cost to activities in the Akademi was 0.45 in 2005-06 and came down to 0.37 in 2010-11, which is a good trend (*Annexure XXVIII*). But the organisation chart of the Akademi indicates a certain lack of direction. The strength of the SA lies in that, as a language based Akademi, it has a fair all-India character. But the work allocation and responsibilities of senior officers, does not seem to have been logically worked out. There are 4 officers of the level of Deputy Secretary in the headquarters (*Annexure XXIX*). There is also, at that level, an Officer on Special Duty for 3 languages, Maithili, Nepali and Santali. We do not need to elaborate, but it seems that there is a skewed distribution of work among the senior officers which is baffling. The Akademi must reorganise its senior staff according to a better work allocation.

6.45 Our Committee would like the Akademi to redraw the work allocation of all officers in a more systematic manner. Where we have suggested new areas of work, and if the Akademi deems it so necessary, they may create appropriate positions. Some of this expertise may be on contract basis.

7. LALIT KALA AKADEMI

Art, like morality, consists in drawing the line somewhere. : G K. Chesterton.

Set up of the Akademi

- 7.1 The Lalit Kala Akademi was set up by a Resolution of the Ministry of Education, No. F. 16-8/53- H2 dated 7 October, 1953, and was formally inaugurated on 5 August 1954. This National Academy of Art was created, according to the Resolution, to “foster and co-ordinate activities in the sphere of visual and plastic art and to improve thereby the cultural unity of the country.” Unfortunately, the Akademi has degenerated to such an extent that it has actually led to total disharmony within the Akademi; the artists’ community feels alienated today from the institution which should have nurtured them.
- 7.2 Our Committee has had to grapple with a special problem as far as the Lalit Kala Akademi is concerned. The Akademi has been dragged to the court in a series of cases. According to information provided by the Akademi, there are 28 cases presently pending in different courts of the country. A list of these cases as obtained from the Akademi is at *Annexure XXX*. We place this list in our Report because this is one major area of concern for the MOC and the Akademi, in the effort to improve the latter’s functioning.
- 7.3 It is unfortunate that the officials of an institution of this importance have to spend so much time in fighting lawsuits rather than study and promote art. We realise that the GC of the LKA is riddled with factionalism; apparently the use or abuse of office has resulted in groupism, cronyism, internal bickering and turmoil in the Akademi’s functioning. The manner in which the Constitution of the LKA has been formulated over time has only added to the convoluted system. When an organisation’s environment is deeply vitiated, very elemental changes are necessary for that environment. We feel that fundamental modifications are required in the system that has developed over time in the LKA.

General Council

- 7.4 The Haksar Committee had very explicitly said of the “internal conflicts” of the LKA in 1990:

In recent years the affairs of the Lalit Kala Akademi have been clouded not only by the external controversies the whole community of artists in the context of the electoral process, but also by certain conflicts within the organisation. Actually these tend to overlap, and it is difficult to demarcate

the borderline between them. Allegations and counter-allegations have been made by functionaries of the Akademi against one another, involving the Chairman and the Vice-Chairman themselves, sometimes reducing the meetings of the General Council and the Executive Board to a farce. (paragraphs 5.70 and 5.71).

7.5 It is unfortunate that after nearly a quarter of a century these could well have been the words of our Committee. In January 2014, there was the spectacle of the Chairman LKA having to inform the public through a press advertisement of the censure of the Vice Chairman and 22 others, for various acts of indiscretion, and irregularities. There is no other way out than to recommend the surgeon's scalpel for a fundamental change in the set up of the Akademi. Apart from the removal of one centre of power, there are changes in the constituents of the GC that we propose. We need to consider the process at the LKA in some detail.

7.6 There have been a number of Committees in the last few years that have gone into matters relating to the GC and the entire Constitution itself. An independent Committee of persons of eminence and experience to look into the grievances of Petitioners in WP No. 11341/2009 (the Subramanian Committee) was set up in 2010 in pursuance of an Order of the Hon'ble High Court of Delhi. The Committee recommended, inter alia, that the Constitution of the LKA be revisited to make its processes simple, transparent and effective and the MOC endorsed this view. The Chairman, LKA, consequently set up the Krishen Khanna Committee which recommended the abolition of the election system, except for the dissenting voice of two members who had been added to the original Committee by the GC. The Committee's recommendation to abolish elections was not approved by the GC, which instead increased the number of artists to be elected to 25. This has fortunately not yet been approved by Government.

7.7 Our intention in proposing changes to the Constitution and the composition of the membership to the GC is to remove any political manoeuvring to control the institute, and the presence of undesirable constituents. We need to bring back a semblance of correct behaviour into the LKA. The complex composition of the GC must be changed and the intricate structure and language of the Constitution has to be simplified.

Elections to the General Council

7.8 The LKA has a rather unusual system of electing 15 members to the General Council from a constituency of artists. The rule itself is complex. The clause 10.ix of the Memorandum provides for:

Fifteen persons to be elected by constituencies, described as the constituencies of artist, comprised of

- a) Recognised artists in India who shall be entitled to stand for election and have the power to vote,
- b) Eligible artists in India who shall be entitled to stand for election but shall not have the power to vote,
- c) The Fellows of the Akademi in India who shall be entitled to stand for election and have the power to vote, and
- d) Eminent artists in India who shall be entitled to stand for election and have the power to vote.

7.9 On the face of it, this is absurd. Rule 10. ix. (b) allows for a category that can stand for elections but cannot vote. This is contrary to the principle of democratic representation that one must be a voter if one wishes to be a candidate.

7.10 The Haksar Committee noted, so many years ago, that “the criticism that the fifteen members of the General Council who are drawn from the artists’ constituency tend to acquire undue powers does not appear to be unjustified”. It noted that a large number of those elected thus to the GC were also subsequently elected to the Executive Board. The Haksar Committee proposed that the number of persons to be elected to the GC from this category should be limited. Today we feel that the change must be deeper than that.

7.11 The rule that requires elections has led to a strange and unedifying spectacle of an electorate spread across India for whom election booths are set up every 5 years. In 2008, the LKA had, for its elections, 1794 “eligible artists” out of a total number of 3547 artists. There were 1753 “voters” of whom 851 actually voted. Among the polling centres set up, at least one had no votes cast. For the 2013 elections, which have not been held, the total number of artists rose to 3838, with 1980 “eligible” and 1858 “voters”. The process of election is very complex and expensive. In many of the States there is only a single voter. Polling booths are setup for 2 voters in a State or 4 voters covering 4 States. Our Committee finds it difficult to appreciate that such an exercise should be done every five years, and at a cost of about Rs 2 crores. We do not understand how such an election process helps the Akademi in its functioning.

7.12 There was no provision originally in the LKA’s Constitution for elections. There is no similar concept in the other two Akademies. The process of elections was introduced in 1976. The process takes more than six months to complete and the formation of the full General Council in LKA takes many more months. Thus, much time is lost without any activity by the GC.

- 7.13 We need to recognise that the world of the visual arts has gone far ahead of what the founding fathers of the LKA could have foreseen sixty years ago. A global market has emerged for Indian art. Just 25 years ago, the situation was rather grim, when the Haksar Committee even had this to recommend – “Steps might be devised to improve the status of artists in society” (paragraph 9.167).
- 7.14 Those difficult days, happily, are over. We do not believe that all artists are well off today. But certainly the art market seems to indicate that all recognised/eminant artists whom the LKA might wish to bring into the fold would not need support from the Akademi. If the intention behind setting up the LKA was to support and promote the visual arts, very few of the best artists would need support from the Akademi; they may not even need its recognition. We understand that some of our best artists have stopped participating in the processes of the LKA because of its present state of affairs.
- 7.15 We recommend, therefore, that elections must be removed as a means of membership of the Akademi’s GC. The entire system of elections must be scrapped. How is this to be ensured?
- 7.16 Under Clause 11 which relates to the functions of the GC, there is a note which states – “In the discharge of its functions the General Council shall be guided by such directions on questions of policy as may be issued to it by the Central Government. The decision of the Central Government as to whether a question is or is not one of policy shall be final. Such directions shall be given in writing by the Government to the Chairman.” Therefore the power of the Government to change the rules through a directive is definite and final.
- 7.17 Is the General Council still alive? Was its term of 5 years over sometime in 2013? Rule 10, which pertains to the constitution of the General Council begins with the following statement – “The Governing Council shall be a continuing authority....” Therefore the GC continues to exist. What about the elected members? Rule 10 ix is clear – “The term of the fifteen elected members will be five years.” Therefore the GC can presently meet without the elected members, the MOC can give it a directive, or a series of directives and begin the process of cleansing the LKA of its politics. We expect this to be done urgently.

Other Changes in the Composition of the GC

- 7.18 If the elected membership of 15 under Clause 10.ix is removed, who will take their place? Under Rule 10.vii, the LKA has an unusual system of breaking up the States into three groups, A, B and C, which are represented by rotation. This means that for a period of 10 years, by turn, each State has no say in the national body. If all were to be represented at a time, we would have 23-24 additional

members. Even though the number gets enlarged, for the sake of a well spread out representation, we recommend that all the States should be on the GC at any given time. There were only 22 State Akademis in 2009 (*Annexure XXXI*), and in any case we do not wish to have nominations from the Akademis. For these nominations under Rule 10.vii, as we have proposed in Chapter 4, three names would be sent by each State in alphabetical order, from which a selection would be made. The States should be encouraged to propose sculptors, cartoonists, art historians, curators, restorers, art critics, graphic artists, photographers and animators. Some of these are new areas of art and cannot be brushed aside in today's technological age.

7.19 The five nominees of Government under Clause 10.iv are the Director NGMA, DG National Museum, the JS (Akademis), another representative of the MOC and the FA. The rule is neither felicitous in its wording nor lucid in its intention. It reads – “Five nominees of the Government of India, namely Director, National Gallery of Modern Art; Director General, National Museum; Director; Joint Secretary in charge of matters relating to the Akademi and holder of one more office in the Department of Culture identified from time to time by the Department of Culture and the Financial Adviser to the Government of India in the Department of Culture. If the last mentioned nominee is appointed by the Government of India as the Financial Adviser of the Akademi then the number of nominees shall be four.” But since the FA finds place separately at 10.iii in the list, we do not understand the intention behind this nomination. There is also no need for another person from the MOC when the JS himself is included. In their place, the Directors of NGMA Mumbai and NGMA Bangalore should be included. This group will then have 5 persons and the FA would come in under Rule 10.iii.

7.20 The next set of members, 8 of them under Rule 10.v, is meant to be of “nominees of GOI holding offices under its control”. It covers the Chairman SNA, the President SA, the DG ICCR, the MS IGNCA, the DGs Akashwani and Doordarshan and Chairman UGC. Of these, the last three of the group need to be removed; their role is so negligible that they do not warrant a place in the Akademi. The DG ASI and the Director, Indian Museum, Kolkata, may be added in their place, the total number being reduced from 8 to 7.

7.21 Under Clause 10.vi, three Fellows are nominated by the Chairperson. The SNA and the Sahitya Akademi also have Fellows but they are not on the GC. Fellows are recognised for their eminence, not as participants in a process of governance. The selection of three is itself awkward. In fact, they should all be elders who can be consulted by the Chairperson and the GC if required. We are of the view that it is best to remove this category.

- 7.22 There are also, under 10.viii 10 persons of “high integrity and record of management and service in the promotion of the arts” nominated by the MOC to represent art organisations in the GC. Under 10.x, there are 7 experts covering various areas of art, but the clause is written in an extremely confusing manner. Thus under 10.viii and x, there are 17 members in all.
- 7.23 In their place we suggest as follows. Under a revised Rule 10.viii, there should be 4 representatives of Universities or Schools of Art of high repute, such as Kala Bhavan of Vishva Bharati, Shantiniketan, the Sir JJ School of Applied Art, Mumbai, the Faculty of Fine Arts, M.S. University, Baroda, College of Art, Delhi, the School of Arts and Aesthetics, JNU, Chitrakala Parishat, Bangalore, the Government College of Art, Kolkata, the Government College of Art, Chennai, the Government College of Art, Thiruvananthapuram, the Government College of Art, Lucknow, and any other academic institution which the LKA feels to be of importance. A roster should be made of such institutions. From these, 4 would be chosen for each GC. These should be selected on a rotational basis by the Chairperson.
- 7.24 As regards individual experts under Rule 10.x, we would propose that this should be increased to 12, but include among them at least 4 who are sculptors, and 6 at least from the fields of photography, graphic design, cartooning, animation and folk art. There should be no specific categorisation, and it would depend on the excellence of the person and the need for expertise of the Akademi. We would recommend that from these 12, at least one third should be women and one third should be persons below the age of 45. Some might come under both these requirements. These persons shall be selected by the members of the GC under Rules 10.i, iii, v & vii, in a manner similar to the process in Sangeet Natak Akademi.
- 7.25 With this, the Government’s role in the GC would be of 12 Government nominees or ex-officio members, apart from the FA who would be the Financial Advisor. The rest would add up to 51, bringing up the total, including the Chairperson and the FA to 65. We believe that the number of positions to be filled up after the rest of the GC is convened would now be manageable.
- 7.26 A strange aspect of the written rules for membership of the GC is the requirement of integrity in the person. This applies to the Chairperson, the Vice Chairperson, nominees of State Akademis, persons nominated by the GOI to represent organisations and associations and the nine eminent artists mentioned earlier. This presupposes that all others, that is Government officials and ex-officio representatives are highly moral and that those needing that certificate would wear their honesty on their sleeves. The Secretary himself does not have to meet this requirement. Despite this exhortation to incorruptibility, there have been

accusations of corrupt practices in the Akademi. Our Committee believes that references to moral character may be removed in the rules for membership of the GC, even though the reference is well intentioned.

7.27 The composition of the GC of the LKA is as complex as its Constitution itself. We hope that the composition we have now proposed will simplify the membership. But the verbiage that is the hallmark of the Constitution must be completely removed. We suggest that the entire terminology of the Constitution has to be revisited by a small group to be set up for rewriting the Constitution.

The Chairperson

7.28 The present rules permit a person to be Chairperson for two consecutive terms (rule 5.ii). This implies that there may not be enough men and women of eminence to hold that position or that it helps the Akademi to have someone for 10 long years at the helm of affairs. Instead, this can lead to the undesirable entrenchment of one person at the very apex of the organisation. Our Committee reiterates its recommendation from Chapter 4 that the term of the Chairperson shall be only three years and that a second term would not be a consecutive one.

7.29 Ideally, when the Government makes its choice of Chairperson, it should look at placing in the chair eminent persons from different specialisations in the field of visual art. We must not fall into the trap of suggesting a rotation policy here. But it should not be that the Chairperson is repeatedly an artist, and not, say, a sculptor, a photographer, an art historian and so on.

The Vice Chairperson

7.30 It is very largely because of the role of the Vice Chairman at the LKA that we had to consider in great depth, in Chapter 4, the advantages and disadvantages of retaining that position for all the three Akademis. The Vice Chairperson of the Akademi has in recent times, become the focus of such controversy that only deep surgical treatment can get the Akademi back to some shape. We repeat here that the Vice Chairman's position be abolished.

Quorum

7.31 The quorum fixed by the Akademi for various meetings is one sixth of the total for the Executive Board, Finance Committee and only 10, which is less than one sixth, for General Council meetings. At times, the venue of the Executive Board meetings has been fixed at remote places, away from Headquarters, disabling Government of India representatives from attending it. This has, we understand, allowed a very small number of General Council members, to take

‘incorrect’ decisions. This has further led to a lack of interest shown by members in participating in the working of the Akademi.

7.32 As we have mentioned earlier in Chapter V, the usual procedure at meetings is that, if there is a lack of quorum at the convening of the meeting, the meeting is adjourned for a while and the adjourned meeting is held with the members assembled. The fixing of a quorum of one-sixth is untenable and needs to be changed. We would recommend that the quorum should be fixed at 40% for meetings of the Committees and 25% for meetings of the GC.

Other Clauses of the Constitution

7.33 The Constitution of the LKA has four unexpected Clauses, 17.11 to 17.14. Clause 17.11 pertains to disciplinary matters, while 17.14 is about Appellate Authority. The two in between, which is 17.12 and 17.13, pertain to the takeover of management by the Government and the handing back of management. They are part of the main clause 17, which covers “General” matters.

7.34 The original Clause 17 had only two sub-clauses. Over the years, Clause 17 has been expanded to include 16 sub clauses. In that process the rules have been made extremely complex, and prolix. They are presently numbered as 17.1, 17.2 etc. but often the sub clause tends to be treated as a main clause. The LKA, in its rewriting of the Constitution, should renumber it suitably as 17(i), 17 (ii) and so on, as it was in 1954 (depending upon the renumbering of 17 itself). The two sub clauses that pertain to disciplinary matters and take over by Government, 17.12 and 17.13 require careful consideration. The takeover of management does not figure in the Constitutions of the other two Akademis. We believe that whatever the provocation, an Akademi must not be run by Government, and these provisions should be removed.

7.35 Clause 17.11 of the Constitution on disciplinary matters and Clause 17.14 on appeals are not appropriate for being part of the Constitution. They should form part of the service rules and the conduct and discipline rules. The provision of the disciplinary action being taken on the complaint of 50 artists is improper as it prevents the genuine complaint of a smaller number being considered and encourages petition gathering and groupism. This provision has been subject to serious misuse. We appreciate that the removal of the rule may also lead to increased allegations. But, on the other hand, in the present system, a genuine complaint can be brushed aside. The rule regarding the removal of the Chairman or the Vice-Chairman is unnecessary and the wording infelicitous; in any case, as for the Chairperson, the President of India being the appointing authority, has the authority to remove him.

Garhi Studios

7.36 The studios at Garhi, started in 1976 and expanded in 1995, have been mired in controversy for a long time. Some of the occupants who have simultaneously held positions in the Akademi, have occupied the studios for decades. The Garhi Studio admission rules were framed by the GC based on an order of the High Court of Delhi in WP 22562-65/2005 but we understand that these have been violated by many artists. We believe that only when the legal issues are sorted out and final decisions of the courts are available, can any policy action be taken. In the meanwhile, the LKA has been trying to get back the premises for repair and renovation which we feel is certainly necessary.

7.37 We feel that, as a matter of policy, the Akademi should not be a landlord renting out space to support individual artists. The demand today for urban space is so high and urban property so expensive, that “squatting” is not unexpected. Many artists today are reasonably well off. The support that artists might require could be provided in other ways; at best the common studio system could continue but not for any long term use.

7.38 It is imperative that no person who is a member of the GC or of any of the committees shall accept any commercial/ pecuniary benefit from the Akademi including the use of any tangible assets of the LKA.

7.39 The land at Garhi is about 4 acres. A major centre for cultural activities including tribal and folk arts should be developed there, which would cover traditional art forms from all over India. This would involve the contribution of all other relevant institutions of the MOC, especially the other two Akademis. Some of the space could be used for inter-disciplinary academic work of the three Akademis. The LKA should prepare a plan of action to proceed in this direction.

Collection and Exhibitions

7.40 There is a dispute regarding the collection of art at the LKA. We have been told that the actual number does not tally with the number indicated as the total collection. The matter we understand is part of criminal investigation. Government should set up a Committee of eminent persons, who would be experts in various disciplines. The group should (a) ensure the authenticity of the collection, (b) segregate the work of the highest quality (as compared, say, to most of the work at camps, (c) ensure proper management of the works. The experts should complete their work in a time bound manner.

7.41 The LKA also suffers from a lack of space to store its treasures. Elsewhere in our Report, we have recommended that new space be created for the storage and display of the Akademi’s collection.

7.42 One other area of potential responsibility of the LKA must be mentioned here. There is no law in India to protect works of art in public spaces. The LKA must set up a group to study this matter and work towards the enactment of a suitable law. It should also examine the present state of public art in the country and take steps to popularise its best practices.

Staffing Issues

7.43 The staffing of the LKA defies understanding. The positions in the Akademi are given in *Annexure XXXII*. The expertise in the visual arts in LKA is negligible, indeed pathetic. There are two posts of DS, but only one person in place; a post of editor is vacant; of four contractual posts of Regional Secretaries, one is vacant. There is a post of Editor, Ancient Art that has not been filled for many years. We understand that an editor of the Hindi publications was sent to Shillong to manage the centre there. We do not understand why this was done. One or two young people with expertise have left the organisation in frustration. There is no one to manage exhibitions, no one to look after the large collection that the Akademi boasts of. The Akademi has appointed two senior Consultants for administrative and financial matters. This is no doubt a good thing, but we need Consultants in the programmatic aspects of the Akademi, an area where expertise is woefully lacking.

7.44 There are, to our understanding, eight main areas of activity for the Akademi. These are research, exhibitions, publications, programmes, management of the Regional Centres, management of the Permanent Collection, scholarships and grants, administration, and accounts. If staff positions are anything to go by, there seems to have been a deliberate neglect of some of the activities.

7.45 The additional positions at the level of DS to handle each area of activity need to be created and filled by contractual appointment of competent people. We would also recommend that the MOC set up a small group of experts to work out the recruitment norms for these senior positions. The LKA must have an expert to look after each significant area of activity of the Akademi. The first task of the LKA should be to appoint a Registrar for its collection. The Akademi must reorganise its manpower within six months and find contractual expertise from outside.

7.46 A related aspect of the staffing is that it is extremely “bottom heavy”. There are 9 posts of Group A officers, and 12 of Group B. The sanctioned strength of Group C and D is 149. Out of the total cost of salaries in 2012-13, Rs 1.27 crores was spent on senior staff, and Rs 5.23 crores on junior employees. We wonder how many members of the Akademi’s staff have heard of Madhubani or Worli or Chittara art, how many of artists like Souza and Gaitonde and Nandalal Bose. This

1:4 ratio in the cost of wages for senior and junior staff is indicative of a lack of balance in the staffing of the LKA. The existing staff needs to be and given a short course in rudimentary aspects of art appreciation, art management and art history. We hope some good might come of such a learning process. We also recommend that the staffing pattern of the Akademi is given a total overhaul.

7.47 We recommend that the MOC has a performance audit urgently done by a team of outside experts and take further corrective steps. This is irrespective of court matters or criminal investigations which are underway. Such an audit must be done every two years starting 2014-15.

8. NATIONAL SCHOOL OF DRAMA

All the world's a stage and most of us are desperately unrehearsed. : Seán O'Casey

8.1 The Asian Theatre Institute which had been established independently in January, 1958 was taken over by the SNA in July, the same year. The NSD was formed in 1959 as a unit of the Sangeet Natak Akademi; it was at first the National School of Drama and the Asian Theatre Institute. On 11 December 1975, the National School of Drama was registered as a Society and since then has grown to have the standing of a premier institute in the teaching of dramatic arts. In 2005, it was granted the status of a deemed university, which we understand was withdrawn at the behest of the institution itself. The NSD is now hoping to be recognised as an institution of national importance.

A Teaching Institution

8.2 The NSD which is a teaching institution with 78 students at a time has a budget which is larger than that of the entire SNA. The principal objective of the School, according to its Memorandum of Association (*Annexure XXXIII*), is "...To establish the National School of Drama and maintain and develop the said school for studies and training in dramatics in the fields of acting, direction, stage techniques, and management, radio, television, children's theatre and script writing."

8.3 NSD does not seem to take teaching as its mission. It has an intake of 26 students per year, making a total of 78 at any time. The direct costs of teaching, including orientation courses, classes with experts/teachers, workshops, special workshops by foreign experts, examination and related costs, and scholarships/fellowships total only Rs. 2.42 crores. This does not include the salaries of the academic staff, and other wages. In 2011-12, the total expenditure on administrative functions was Rs 9.07 crores. Some of the other expenses, such as on the Regional Centres, could be included as teaching expenses. Therefore, even if all administrative expenses are added to the direct teaching costs, it totals about Rs. 11.50 crores. Thus, out of a total expenditure of the NSD in 2011-12 of Rs 36.50 crores, the teaching costs do not go beyond a third of the School's expenditure.

8.4 NSD's own understanding is that about Rs 3 lakhs per student is the annual expenditure on training and study activities. The other view is that, given that the main function of the NSD is teaching the craft of theatre to its students, an expenditure of Rs.36.50 crores in 2011-12 on 78 students was about Rs 47 lakhs, nearly half a crore, per student per year. This should help the NSD to put its role and working in perspective. Our Committee believes that a fresh look at the

mandate of the NSD would enable it to rediscover its original intention. As with other institutions that we have considered, the NSD too should contemplate forming a vision statement and then a mission statement to bring focus to its role as India's premier teaching institution in theatre.

The Society

8.5 This vision must be articulated by the Society, the governing council of the NSD. Much of the agenda for the Society is limited to administrative matters which seem to get the same importance as scattered issues of policy. The Society has no role in assessing the quality of work produced by the School, or in critiquing the academic systems. The Society does not meet the Academic Council. We believe it must also interact with the Academic Council at least once a year to understand relevant academic issues. The Society, the Academic Council and outside experts must work together to improve the standards of the institution.

8.6 The Chairperson, who is appointed by the Government, may under the present rules get an extension. We believe that there should be no extension of the term of the Chairperson. A very long term of 8 years, or more, can lead to entrenched vested interests developing. As with the three Akademies the term of the Chairperson should be 3 years should be made co-terminus with the other non-official members of the Society. The bylaws should be amended to ensure this limit is set. We also feel that to avoid insularity, at least a third of the non-official members should be from outside the NSD alumni fold.

The Academic Construct

8.7 An eminent theatre practitioner has written to our Committee, "If the primary focus of this institution was or is on educating theatre activists for the future of Indian theatre, then some rethinking is an urgent necessity." There is a view that much of the time of the students is spent on non-academic activities.

8.8 The course of study at NSD is for three years, and that too after a student has already done a three year graduate programme. Not even a medical or technology degree requires six years of study. But at NSD, instead of higher level academic work, the programme does not build upon the previous degree. The student spends much time at festivals, in productions and such other activities where theoretical, analytical study is lost sight of. While practical training is welcome, it actually entails about 4 to 5 productions in each of the second and third years of the course. These are not small productions, and are at times expensive.

8.9 What is it that the nation expects from its National School? What do and what should the students expect, when they join? These are difficult questions, but

need an examination. In a country where film has become synonymous with fame and stardom, theatre has been left far behind in the race. On the other hand, many Universities do not have Departments of Theatre, and even among those that do, academic standards in many are not of the highest quality. We do not have data on the number of NSD alumni who are academicians teaching in Universities. But the numbers are few. Is NSD meant to produce film and television stars?

- 8.10 What should be the system of teaching at NSD? In its present format, there are two difficulties caused by the syllabus and the structure of the course. One is that the common language and style of theatre removes the cultural uniqueness and versatility in style. The other is that the students seem to be more trained for production than for academic study and research. We have considered these issues a little later in this chapter.

A Process of “Progress”: Two Steps Back

- 8.11 Some detailing is required to indicate the lack of vision of the NSD and its incapacity to follow up on decisions. Three examples may be given. One is the manner in which the decision on the setting up of Regional Centres has been circumvented. The second is the reversal of its decision to be a deemed University. The third is the delay of 25 years in setting up the National Academy of Dramatic Arts.

Bangalore Chapter of NSD

- 8.12 A somewhat detailed note on the setting up of the regional centres, especially in the context of Bangalore is at *Annexure XXXIV*. Based on a decision of a broad based committee, the NSD had decided on setting up 5 regional centres. Of these, one at Bangalore was started in 2009, but with hesitation, and the NSD has now decided that it does not have the wherewithal to run any regional centre. It has proposed in the 12th Plan that the MOC sets up centres in each State, an extremely impractical step. Once again, the NSD seems to have come up with a proposal without examining its pros and cons. It should continue with the regional centres and at least get the one for the South functioning immediately.

- 8.13 In view of the circumstances narrated in the Annexure, we strongly urge that the MOC should not go ahead with such a policy of Centres in each State. The MOC must not go ahead with a scheme that seems to be insufficiently thought out. Only Rs 10 crores has been proposed annually for this purpose in the 12th Plan. It should use the funds available to set up the 5 Centres as originally proposed and not more till their success is established. Since the NSD is not willing or not in a position to set them up, the MOC might locate eminent theatre persons in the different locations earlier chosen to help set up these Centres. They may be either

called the NSD of that city, such as NSD, Bangalore, for example, or a School of Theatre to consciously remove them from the shadow of NSD, such as the Bangalore School of Theatre. A Society should be formed in the city concerned with a Chairperson and Director, and perhaps other theatre experts, administrators, academics. This Society should be asked to set up the centre.

- 8.14 A second example of indecision on the part of the NSD has been with regard to its position as a deemed-to-be-University. This status was sought and granted in 2005. The intention behind this was that better pay scales would be available to the academic staff. The pay given to the Professors in 2000 was slightly lower than that for Professors in the UGC scales, and the deemed status would allow them that extra pay. But the NSD, on the grounds that the UGC would intervene in its working, preferred the lower salaries rather than come under external scrutiny, and reversed its own decision. The NSD should avoid the tendency of taking a decision and then spending years before discarding it.

National Academy of Dramatic Arts

- 8.15 The Haksar Committee had proposed that the NSD should reorient itself into the National Academy of Dramatic Arts (paragraph 9.147). This important recommendation has not been acted upon by the NSD. It has informed our Committee as follows:

“About renaming the NSD as National Academy of Dramatic Arts, the NSD Society has welcomed the recommendation. However, the Society is of the view that much thought needs to be given in formulating the objectives and structure of the NADA to avoid duplication in the context of other institutions like the SNA and IGNCA.”

- 8.16 The difficulty is with NSD’s understanding of the matter. The Haksar Committee did not make a recommendation only with regard to nomenclature; it expected a more academically specialized institution. Instead, the NSD has veered around to asking for the status of an Institution of National Importance. Our Committee believes that a mere nomenclature does not create importance; it has to be a search for excellence from within.

- 8.17 The NSD has said that the ‘renaming’ would require much thought as the objectives and structure of the NADA should avoid duplication “in the context of other institutions like the SNA and IGNCA.” If the NSD were to be worried about having the same objectives as the SNA, or the IGNCA, then it would clearly not be a specialized school. The NSD has not strictly addressed this issue for the last 25 years.

- 8.18 The Royal Academy of Dramatic Arts in the UK has a multi-tiered programme. There are diploma courses, degree level courses, such as the BA Acting Course and post graduate courses such as MA in Theatre Directing (being stopped from the current year), MA in Text and Performance and MA in Theatre Lab. There are many other courses that RADA offers, some in collaboration with other Universities. To join the BA course, one need not be a graduate. It is not our intention to get into the details of course structures. But we must recommend that there has to be a complete revamp of the teaching programme of the NSD.
- 8.19 We offer two suggestions in this regard. These are only suggestions and not definitive, as experts would have to consider these in detail. There could be two streams of study. First, since a new student already has a three years' basic degree and proficiency in the theatre, the next step should be a two year programme at a Masters level. A third year would be at an MPhil level, and of strong academic content. The second would be of students who would join after schooling, and either leave after a diploma in one year or go on to get a three year degree in theatre. In this case, the end of the second year and much of the third year could be given over to practical work through productions. These students could be offered experience through the Repertory.
- 8.20 The suggestion we are making allows for two types of alumni, one with high academic skills and the other with more stage oriented capacity. The regional centres could act as feeders for the MA level programme in Delhi. Whatever be the final outcome, the MOC must set up, once and for all, a Committee to finalise the structure of academic work at the NSD to truly make it a Centre for higher drama and theatre studies of international quality. And a new programme should begin from the academic year 2015-16.

Regional Activities

- 8.21 The regional activities of the NSD have to be seen in the context of the school's history. When the Asian Theatre School was started in 1958, regional theatre was one of the areas of emphasis. Therefore, when the National School of Drama and the Asian Theatre Institute was started in 1959, there were two areas of emphasis, teaching and regional theatre. But, over time, Delhi centric Hindi language theatre took centre stage at the NSD, and less attention has been paid to regional theatre.
- 8.22 The regional activities of the NSD are through the RRC at Bangalore and the Regional Chapter there, the Sikkim Theatre Centre at Gangtok and the Theatre in Education wing of the NSD at Agartala. The funds for the Centres at Sikkim and Tripura come out of the earmarked funds for the North East, which in 2012-13 was of the level of Rs 2 crores. But out of its general funds, NSD spent only Rs 51.28

lakhs in the Bangalore Chapter and Rs 40.02 lakhs for the Regional Resource Centre that year. Indeed, it is bizarre and administratively incorrect that two units of the NSD should be continued in the same city as parallel offices. Our Committee is of the view that, having come so far, the Regional Centre should continue and be fully set up. We recommend that the RRC should be merged into the Regional Centre/Bangalore Chapter immediately, from 2014-15, and the former RRC disbanded.

- 8.23 We would recommend that, utilising the funds provided for the North-East, the students at Sikkim should be enabled to perform in other parts of the country, so that there is a process of theatre enthusiasts learning from each other. In fact a festival of plays from the North East annually in another part of the country should be encouraged.

A Matter of Language

- 8.24 Another issue relevant to any regional activity is that of language. The NSD functions in Delhi with Hindi and English as the languages of teaching, but its productions are only in Hindi. One of the issues that has been a matter of debate is the language of teaching and performance in any regional centre. Since a Regional Centre, even if set up in a Zone, cannot restrict admissions from across the nation, the language of teaching could continue to be in Hindi and English. Productions could also largely be in Hindi, but could include English, and at times, the language of the State in which the Centre is situated or which is represented by a large majority of the students. There is no studied benefit to a single language.

- 8.25 The Haksar Committee had remarked on the variety of languages that could be used at the NSD. "The very diversity of languages can be a means of enriching the students with the cultural wealth of India as a whole.... The NSD had once devised an expanding syllabus of such material (for voice training) not only in Hindi but in many regional languages which were the mother tongue of the students. While every student has to know Hindi, because it is the working language of the NSD, he or she was encouraged to acquire even greater mastery of his or her mother tongue, and was free to perform passages in it for the examinations. And since each of several members of the staff knew at least two languages, there was no difficulty in covering the major languages of India. If there were a sufficient number of students in any language to make a viable cast for a play, performances in those languages were encouraged. We would suggest that this sort of approach should be systematized and enlarged upon." We endorse this view of the Haksar Committee.

- 8.26 In place of this, NSD has stayed with only Hindi theatre. We note that many of the most celebrated alumni of the NSD do not perform in Hindi. Their own

work is in Assamese, Bengali, Kannada, Malayalam, Manipuri, Marathi, Punjabi and so on. Language is not a barrier to good theatre. In fact, language is only one aspect of the production. It is the quality of the dramaturgy, the acting, the direction, the sets, lights, sound effects and other technical inputs that create theatres of excellence. We believe that any regional centre to be set up would have experts who speak different languages, including no doubt Hindi and English to teach in. The Regional Centres, whether set up by the MOC directly or through the NSD, should encourage language theatre though, as we have said, the main language of teaching would remain Hindi and English.

Repertory and Performance

8.27 NSD has a special position and responsibility. It performs for the public, no other institution of MOC does that. The NSD Repertory Company, which was set up in 1964, became a full-fledged repertory in 1976. Presently there are 20 full time artistes, who are complemented by casual artists when required. Over the past 50 years, the Repertory has performed about 150 plays by about 90 playwrights and directed by about 70 directors.

8.28 The rather low level of enthusiasm that its productions nowadays generate indicates that the NSD is unable to create the magic that it could boast of in earlier times. The list of plays produced by NSD in the last 5 years is at *Annexure XXXV*. The average cost of each production is about Rs 12 – 15 lakhs, and one play a little earlier had a budget of Rs 60 lakhs, the final cost unknown. This is without taking into consideration other indirect advantages of the support system that the repertory enjoys. Quality is an intangible assessment, but it may not be entirely incorrect to suggest that amateur theatre groups with a ‘professional’ attitude and standards would be able to match many of the NSD productions with such funding. The MOC should have the costing of the productions of the NSD checked by outside experts as part of a performance audit.

8.29 The Repertory holds a Summer Theatre Festival in Delhi, with about 9 or 10 productions. The festival of 2013 had 9 plays, all presented by eminent Directors. But in that list, not one was from the South or the East of India. This is possibly because Hindi theatre does not exist outside North and Western India. Three out of 9 productions were from the same Director. This is a bias that NSD seems to be inattentive to and must rectify.

8.30 The Repertory needs to consider what should be done to improve its image. It needs to publicise its performances adequately. It needs to seek out good scripts and not from abroad. The NSD needs to improve its pay structure because only then would better actors perform with the Repertory. It would be good if NSD were to do an in depth study of its own production efforts. For a start, it must film

and document all productions of the NSD. This must be placed on the website of NSD. There must thereafter be an in depth assessment of the performance of the Repertory. The website should be open to the public to review these productions and this should be taken as feedback by the NSD.

Children's Theatre

8.31 The children's theatre wing, the TIE Co., of the NSD is a part of its Theatre-in-Education programme. It has performed 32 plays with over 1000 shows, somewhat of an achievement. It holds summer workshops and further Sunday Club activities where children devise their own performances. This is no doubt a laudable intention. But children's theatre is not only a matter of improvisation leading to production. Since the productions are ticketed public performances, there cannot be any semblance of amateurism, especially not from the National School. Secondly, the difference between theatre for grownups and for children is in the content and the script. The other facets remain the same. If so, it is necessary that, for its ticketed performances, the TIE should locate good scripts, be professional in production and not be self-indulgent.

Bharat Rang Mahotsav

8.32 One of the areas of concern that many have expressed about the NSD is its festival, the Bharat Rang Mahotsav. From a modest start in 1999, it has grown to be perhaps the largest theatre festival in Asia. It is held over three weeks in Delhi and a part of the festival is taken to another city by turn. A fifth of NSD's total budget is expended for this purpose. From Rs 157 lakhs in 2004-5 and Rs 286 lakhs in 2008-09, the expenditure shot up to Rs 746 lakhs in 2012-13, till it was brought down in 2013-14. Interestingly the Memorandum of Association of the NSD does not directly have theatre festivals in its aims and objects. However, that is not to say that a festival should be closed down since it has been built up so assiduously over the years. Indeed there is much that the NSD should be proud of in this respect. But there are issues that have been expressed by eminent persons and the public.

8.33 The festival had offered, in 2012, as many as 96 productions including 16 from abroad. To manage such a huge programme, a large army of NSD alumni and others are roped in with fairly large contractual payments. While NSD's own productions cost many lakhs, the payment for productions staged at the BRM is only Rs 40,000, and the actors are expected to travel by train, even if they travel from the far corners of the country. The foreign plays that are invited are often unknown and sometimes poorly produced; we do not have clarity on the manner in which these plays are selected. We also do not understand what the NSD achieves by one, or at best two, performances of these plays.

8.34 Our Committee is of the view that the entire approach to festivals needs review by the NSD. The trend of increased spending on the BRM needs to be curbed. The BRM must be limited in the number of plays performed and curated to showcase the very best plays. The payments then to the performing troupes could be enhanced. The NSD should also not be in the business of financially supporting other institutions to hold festivals. We would only propose that it does not dilute its primary role as an academic institution. On a thumb rule, the cost of the expenditure on the BRM and other festivals should not be more than approximately 10% of the total budget of NSD.

A Certain Insularity

8.35 About 1025 students have passed out of NSD between 1959 and 2013, a small but very significant group. There is a view that NSD is a closed body of past and present alumni. We do not agree with this view as indeed many of our best theatre persons are graduates of the School and they have a rightful place in the theatre world. But perceptions of insularity and closing of ranks must not be allowed to be formed. The students must know that there are other theatre practices outside, and not only in the NSD tradition. Excellent work is done in some language theatres and now on the English stage. We would recommend that as short term visiting faculty, some of these experts should be invited to the NSD to interact with the students.

Role of Playwrights and the Text

8.36 One of the main aims of the NSD in terms of its intended teaching programme is playwriting. Any good production begins with a good text, and understanding and appreciation of the text is essential to good theatre. In an academic context, the difference between drama and theatre requires the function of the text to be appreciated. In production, the modern practice of improvised performance has its limitations. Many theatre companies abroad have a resident playwright. But NSD has never paid heed to this important aspect of theatre. It does not have a playwriting course since its inception, and falls back very frequently upon classics of Western drama in translation. We would recommend that a course in playwriting must be introduced. Otherwise it would remain a major gap in the syllabus of the institution.

8.37 We further recommend that the NSD should invite eminent playwrights to be part of the school on a regular basis. They need not be from Hindi theatre only, but include Marathi, Bengali, English and other languages. These may be short term workshop assignments or a longer term association.

Administrative Weaknesses

8.38 The cost of administering the NSD, as a percentage of its total expenditure, is significantly rising. This trend has to be reversed. The MOC must examine the reasons for such a rise in administrative costs.

8.39 The larger problem is the quality of administrative staff. The Head of the administration is the Registrar, a designation more sophisticated than his work entails. The School does not have a Registrar presently and has appointed on contract an official who had retired many years ago. Clearly, the pay scales and the expertise sought in the recruitment rules are not conducive to finding a suitable person. One of the requirements is expertise in the rules of Government. But this limits the search to low level bureaucrats who have no capacity to positively contribute to the well being and the progress of the School. We feel that it would be easier for the NSD to offer the job of Registrar to a suitable young person with skills in management. The recruitment rules need to be changed urgently.

9. NATIONAL GALLERIES OF MODERN ART

You can understand nothing about art, particularly modern art if you do not understand that imagination is a value in itself: Milan Kundera

- 9.1 There are three National Galleries of Modern Art under the Ministry of Culture. When the Haksar Committee gave its report, there was only one. Even today, in the Ministry, a mention of NGMA implies the NGMA in Delhi. (When the Chairperson of our HPC, based in Bangalore, required temporary space to work from, at the NGMA Bangalore, the MOC wrote to the NGMA Delhi). These are subordinate offices of the Ministry, an important factor in our consideration.
- 9.2 The first NGMA was inaugurated by Dr. Sarvepalli Radhakrishnan on 29 March, 1954 at Jaipur House in New Delhi. Its principal aim is to acquire and preserve works of modern art from 1850s onward. The total space at Jaipur House of the NGMA is about 4620 square metres of which about half is used for storage presently and about 2300 square metres is said to be available for displays. In 2009, 27000 square metres of space was added through new buildings, of which 12000 square metres are the display areas. Its total collection is about 16480 paintings, sculptures, photographs and graphics, some of it the best in the country.
- 9.3 The NGMA Mumbai was started in 1996 at the renovated Sir Cowasji Jehangir Hall with 5 galleries. The total space for display is 1279.97 square metres while the support space is about 97 square metres. It has a collection of 1457 works, largely of one artist.
- 9.4 The NGMA Bangalore was opened in February, 2009 at the nearly 100 years old Manickyavelu Mansion, where an additional modern gallery has been constructed. The total display area is 2811 square metres; of this 1551 square metres is in the original building and 1260 was added in the new wing. The area for support activities is approximately 660 square metres. It has no collection yet of its own, but has been given from Delhi about 500 works to display.

The Relationship Between the Three NGMAs and the MOC

- 9.5 The three NGMAs have an uneasy relationship. Delhi tends to dwarf the other two, exemplifying a Delhi centric approach of the MOC. Three examples may be given of this attitude. It exemplifies the rather indifferent attitude that the Ministry displays towards those institutions that are away from Delhi and not under their direct scrutiny. That there is critical public scrutiny in these two cities does not seem to affect the MOC very much.

- 9.6 The NGMAs in Mumbai and Bangalore do not have regular Directors and little has been done by the Ministry to resolve the problem. This requires some detailing. Most incomprehensibly, there has never been a regular Director appointed for the NGMA Mumbai since its inception. An eminent art historian was full time Director, but in an honorary capacity, at NGMA Mumbai from 1996 to 2005. The Director NGMA Delhi looked after NGMA Mumbai from 2005 to October 2013, in additional charge but from another city. Then the Ministry dipped into the Nehru Science Centre, Mumbai, for support; the Director NSC has held additional charge of Director NGMA since then.
- 9.7 The NGMA Bangalore has a similar record. The first full time Director was a retired IAS officer who set up the gallery's early systems. When she left after two years' pioneering work, the Director NGMA, Delhi, held additional charge for a long time. Finally the Director NSC Bangalore was asked to hold charge. Initially, because this Director was not a 'government servant', he was not allowed to exercise financial powers. In the meanwhile, the MOC had set up a committee for the selection of Director; its recommendations for the deputation of an officer of the Indian Postal Service were rejected by the DOPT for 'technical' reasons. We believe that the MOC has not made sufficient efforts to find Directors for the NGMAs at Bangalore and Mumbai.
- 9.8 If there are rules that the DOPT found impossible to revisit, even for the better administration of a Government institution, its own fundamental rules are being flouted by the continuous, long term additional charge arrangements. Besides, since officers from an autonomous body are looking after Government institutions, they have had difficulties in handling certain administrative and financial responsibilities.
- 9.9 The awkward structure is patently unbalanced. For a long time the same officer, Director NGMA Delhi, headed all three NGMAs. Normally additional charge is given within the same city; here he held positions in three faraway places. Presently the two in-charge Directors who are Scientists, are senior to the Director NGMA Delhi, the coordinating pointsman.
- 9.10 Our Committee is firmly of the opinion that it is essential to appoint full time Directors at the two NGMAs in Mumbai and Bangalore urgently. Not only are these important institutions of visual art, they represent, in some way, the working of the Central Government in two important cities. The value of the artwork they hold is also very high. We believe that the MOC must leave no stone unturned to place two full time Directors at NGMA Bangalore and Mumbai in the next six months.

9.11 The second issue is that of financial and administrative powers. In July, 2013, the Directors of NGMA Bangalore and Mumbai have been declared Heads of Office and therefore have received certain financial powers. But, till then, over the years, they have had to send virtually every proposal to Delhi for approval. In many small administrative and financial matters which are not clearly laid down in writing, the NGMA Mumbai and Bangalore have had no discretion. They have had to approach the Ministry who then seek advice from NGMA Delhi and use Delhi norms to approve, question or disapprove the proposal. The MOC's approach to processes in the administration of its institutions is indicated by the fact that though the Bangalore NGMA was inaugurated in 2009, it took two years before that institution could even have its own funds and book expenditure under its own accounts.

9.12 What then should be the relationship between Delhi, Mumbai and Bangalore? What should the affiliation be of the three NGMAs with Government? We believe that it is the duty of the MOC to open as many art spaces across the country, in as many cities as possible, but only as a catalyst. Each space becomes the possession of the people of the city. There has to be a sense of pride, of ownership, of nurturing by the people of their own space. That seems to have been lost, after the initial enthusiasm, in Bangalore. We believe that would be true also of Mumbai. We do not understand, on the other hand, why the MOC should run galleries so far away from Delhi. Or run any anywhere, for that matter. The fact that the NGMAs are subordinate offices implies that the Ministry administers them directly, as it were. The greatest galleries of the world are not run by the Governments of those countries. We feel that the three NGMAs should be given autonomy. But in what manner?

9.13 The MOC has recently created a post of DG, NGMA and has advertised for applications. The role of the DG and that of the three Directors as envisaged by the MOC is at *Annexure XXXVI*. Despite the need for independence in functioning of the three galleries, there is need for cooperation, coordination and collaboration. The art treasures that the three Centres have, or are expected to collect in future, must be shared for public viewing. The exhibitions that are mounted should as far as possible travel to all the centres. More Galleries must be set up and a network of activities across the country must be planned. The DG's position requires that such coordination is carried out. There should be clarity in lines of control and supervision.

9.14 At the same time, it is necessary that the NGMAs are no longer treated as 'subordinate' offices. There has to be autonomous functioning. One suggestion that we received in discussion was that 'functional autonomy' could be given and not full autonomy as the concept of 'National' would be lost, if the Galleries were not Government offices. This is not a correct view. There are autonomous bodies

which are 'National'. What then should be the structure of connectivity? The answer may lie, to our understanding, in a system that already exists in the Ministry.

- 9.15 The National Council of Science Museums (NCSM), a premiere institution in the field of science communication, gives us a precedent. It is an autonomous organization under the Ministry of Culture, Govt. of India. Primarily engaged in popularizing science and technology through a network of science centres, mobile science exhibitions units and a variety of activities for the public and students in particular, the NCSM, with its Headquarters in Kolkata, administers and manages 25 science museums/centres spread across the country. NCSM is the world's largest network of science centres and museums that functions under a single administrative umbrella.
- 9.16 The NGMAs may be placed in an autonomous institution called the National Council of Galleries of Modern Art, the NCGMA for short. The DG would head the Council, which would set up more and more galleries across India. The advisory bodies for each Gallery would remain and actually provide technical and creative support to each institution. The coordination between the Galleries would, in our opinion, improve. The DG would be a person of eminence and be able to command the respect of his own Directors and of his peers in the art world outside. The autonomy that the NCSM enjoys would be available to the NCGMA.

Art Acquisition

- 9.17 The last acquisition of an art object by NGMA, Delhi, was in 2006. While there is no doubt that art acquisition must be started again, the consolidation of existing work is important. The NGMA, Delhi, is the repository of Indian art from the time of the Indian War of Independence, 1857, from when modern times are taken for this purpose, to begin. The Gallery has a collection of nearly 16,500 works of art. We understand that the works have not been verified since 2000. We would urge that the process of verification must be started and completed in the current year without fail.
- 9.18 There is also the need to value the art objects with the Galleries. This has to be done on a regular basis, which has not happened. The Ministry must ensure that this process is started urgently. A Committee needs to be set up for advice on the valuation. There has also to be a Registrar who would be in charge of the collection and be responsible for all records of each object.
- 9.19 Bangalore has only just begun the process of acquisition through donations. Its collection, received from Delhi, must also be checked and recorded. Mumbai must do the same for its collection. The stocks of gift articles for the sales counter

must be accounted for in all the three. The entire verification exercise, from art objects to gift articles, must be completed within a year.

9.20 The NGMA Bangalore, when opened, was sent about 500 works of art from the national collection in Delhi. Over the past 5 years, this has neither been replenished nor replaced. We have been told by eminent Bangaloreans that, after the initial enthusiasm, the permanent collection has become 'boring'. We suggest that on an annual basis, at least 500 works of art should be rotated between Delhi and the other two galleries. Even then it would take decades for a particular work to return to the same gallery's display. It is essential that there is a rotation of the art collection. This itself will ensure the retrieval of art objects from cellars and their restoration for the gallery visitor.

9.21 We understand that since about 2003 there has been no systematic addition to the NGMAs' collection through purchases. There has been a not unexpected hesitation to buy art; there can never be total satisfaction in the artists' community and much finger pointing can take place. But the process must go on, as the public collection of Indian art should not be stopped. We are happy that after many years Government has set up an art acquisition committee comprising eminent artists. While we believe that choice and selection is a matter of subjective appreciation, we would suggest that, as far as possible the selection process and the list of acquisitions is informed to the public through the website of the three NGMAs.

9.22 But even in the setting up of the Art Acquisition Committees, the primacy of Delhi can be observed (*Annexure XXXVII*). The Ministry's order of 6 March 2014, constituting the Art Acquisition Committee has three components. It has, apart from 4 persons nominated by virtue of their office, including the Director NGMA New Delhi as the Secretary, 6 eminent artists including the Chairperson. For Mumbai and Bangalore, the Directors concerned and two artists each are to be co-opted. Thus, the artists for the Delhi NGMA have a role in purchases for Mumbai and Bangalore, but not vice versa. We do not understand this. Is it that the artists in other parts of the country are inferior in some way or should not have a say in the functioning of Delhi? We recommend that the Committee for art purchase must be one, and that all members are treated as equals.

Staffing Issues

9.23 Data on staff in the three NGMAs is at *Annexure XXXVIII*. The staff position, especially in Mumbai and Bangalore, requires immediate strengthening. A number of posts were created in 2011, but obviously were not filled up. There is no accounts person in Mumbai and there is simply no clarity about the accounts of the organisation. In Bangalore the position is filled up only temporarily. The

administrative positions must all be filled up as also positions on the programmatic side. If any posts need formal renewal the MOC must get that done urgently. The MOC must make a special effort to find people to take up these positions. One way is to seek the assistance of the State Governments for getting persons on deputation.

10. ZONAL CULTURAL CENTRES

Perhaps life is a mystery, not a muddle; they could not tell. Perhaps the hundred Indias which fuss and squabble so tiresomely are one, and the universe they mirror is one.: E. M. Forster in A Passage to India

- 10.1 The ZCCs were set up in 1980s, first 5 of them in 1985-86 and then two more in 1986-87 (*Annexure XXXIX*). The objectives of the Centres, according to their Memoranda of Association, are to preserve, innovate and promote the projection and dissemination of the arts in the concerned zones; to develop and promote their cultural diversity; to encourage folk and tribal arts and aid the preservation of vanishing arts; to involve youth in creative cultural communication and lay special emphasis on the linkages among different areas and their contribution to Indian culture. The intention was to take cultural action nearer to the people across the country. After 25 years of their working, the MOC set up the Mani Shankar Aiyar Committee in 2010 to study the functioning of these Centres.
- 10.2 We have been asked by the Ministry to look into the working of the Zonal Cultural Centres when the report of the Mani Shankar Aiyar Committee is with it and many of the recommendations of that Committee are being acted upon. The recommendations of that Committee are at *Annexure XL*. Since Shri Aiyar has only recently gone into the working of the Centres in great detail, we do not wish to do another dissection of these organisations. We wish to limit our recommendations to only a few issues, mainly to do with the synergising of their work with the national level bodies, in the context of their structure.
- 10.3 The significance of the ZCCs lies in their intention and potential to encourage cultural activity at the grassroots levels, to link modern cultural expressions with traditional creative processes and elevate local art forms to higher national levels. This is a two way process and must receive concentrated support from the MOC and national institutions like the Akademis.
- 10.4 To our understanding, the ZCCs have largely been left to their own devices, and have often not attracted officers to work as Directors of the ZCCs. There are also limits to deputation of willing officers placed by the general rules of the DOPT. We note that the MOC has accepted the recommendation of the Aiyar Committee to bring in outside experts as Directors.
- 10.5 We are informed that the ZCCs have nodal officers for every participating State, who use the internet for networking. Student volunteers are associated for major programmes. But we feel that a strengthening of coordination is required, especially with the national institutions. In the Chapter on the working of the MOC, we have recommended the creation of a pool of young persons to assist in

the management of its various institutions. We recommend that one person from the proposed culture pool should be placed in each ZCC for coordination with the Akademis and the MOC. This person should be the nodal point for interaction between the ZCCs and the three Akademis, though she/he would be under the administrative jurisdiction of the Director of the ZCC.

10.6 We agree entirely with the Aiyar report on its proposal that the Governor of the host State should not be the Chairperson of the Centre. The Governor, as a Constitutional functionary, has many other tasks and important affairs of the State which would keep him/her busy. Therefore, an eminent artiste should be the Chairperson. But it is also possible to place an eminent administrator in that position because of the administrative coordination which is required.

10.7 We have proposed in Chapter 3 that the Ministry should compulsorily hold an annual meeting, spread over two days, of the various cultural institutions under the Ministry. We feel that at least half a day should be spent in coordinating the work of the ZCCs with the national bodies. This would also be a kind of recognition of the ZCCs, and bring them centre stage.

10.8 We have noted a major recommendation of the Aiyar Committee which need to be referred to here. It pertains to the proposal for setting up an Akademi for tribal and folk arts. The report recommends – “In addition to the existing three National Akademis of Sangeet Natak, Lalit Kala and Sahitya, set up a fourth Akademi, to be known as the Folk & Tribal Akademi with whom ICZCC could interact for using the ZCCs as a vehicle for the propagation of folk and tribal art forms.” (Recommendation No.13.20). The Department Related Parliamentary Committee in its 201st Report has also felt the need for such a Centre. The MOC has informed us that in view of a reduced approved outlay in the 12th Plan of the Ministry, the proposal to establish such an Akademi has been shelved for the present. We have considered this matter in detail.

10.9 The proposal for the creation of a new Akademi is clearly because tribal and folk art forms have not received sufficient encouragement from the three Akademis, more importantly here the SNA and the LKA. Work in rural and oral literary traditions have also not found much space in the SA. But we believe that our task is to propose synergy between institutions, and not create silos. We believe that the creation of another Akademi will not resolve the problem of insufficient emphasis of tribal and folk forms by the existing Akademis. Instead, it will create another stream and never the twain shall meet.

11. INDIRA GANDHI NATIONAL CENTRE FOR THE ARTS

You may look up for inspiration or look down in desperation but do not look sideways for information. : Indian proverb

Trusteeship

- 11.1 The Indira Gandhi National Centre for the Arts was set up as a Trust in 1987. Its Trustees, a minimum of 7 and a maximum of 21, are appointed in terms of Clause 7.1 of the Trust Deed (*Annexure XLI*). Since there is a system of rotational retirement, the Government from time to time appoints fresh Trustees. The list of Trustees indicates that some Members have a long standing position in the IGNCA while some others have had very short tenures, having resigned before their time. We believe that there should be a maximum time limit for any person to be a Trustee. As with the maximum period proposed by us for the Akademis, the Trusteeship at the IGNCA should be a maximum of two terms, not consecutive. This will require an amendment to the Trust Deed.

Aims and Objectives

- 11.2 The aims and objectives of the IGNCA are indeed lofty, somewhat esoteric and very wide ranging in their mandate (*Annexure XLII*). Some of these objectives have not been close to realisation even after 25 years of its active working. To take one example, one of the aims is “to foster dialogue between arts and current ideas in philosophy, science and technology, with a view toward bridging the gap in intellectual understanding between modern sciences and arts and culture.” This can only be covered by a broad area of activity, with the requirement of co-operation across institutions and disciplines. We are not sure that the IGNCA presently has the capacity to foster this objective. We would recommend that the IGNCA studies its own aims very closely to see whether the direction it is taking matches the objectives set out by the founders.

Activities of the IGNCA

- 11.3 The IGNCA has 8 centres of activity, according to its Programme Advisory Committee’s action plans – the Cultural Informatics Lab (CIL) which uses technology for cultural preservation and propagation, Kalakosa for the study and publication of fundamental texts, Janapada-Sampada for lifestyle studies, Kaladarsana to transcreate IGNCA’s research work into visible exhibitions, Kalanidhi for library and cultural archives, Rock-art, Conservation and Media (documentation). However, there are only 6 ‘functional units’, which includes Sutradhara, the administrative support wing. The other 5 functional units are the first 5 out of the 8 centres of activity mentioned earlier. We believe that the

IGNCA should study its own structure of academic work as it has developed and place its activities and systems in a correct organisation structure.

Areas of Concern

- 11.4 There are three main areas of concern. These cover academics, outreach and administration. In spite of it having been established as a premier centre of research and with over 25 years of existence, it does not have a well known position as a centre of excellence. There is no formal academic structure at the IGNCA and contractual appointments have often been for short durations. There has therefore been a lack of assured career progression. At the same time, there appears to have been a want of mentoring of juniors because of an insufficiency of senior experts. The IGNCA does not have fellowships for young academics. The IGNCA should examine the prospect of creating a system of career progression for its scholars so as to avoid stagnation. It is also necessary to bring in young scholars, on contractual appointments of not less than five years to provide stability in the academic system. At the same time, the IGNCA should also create a scheme of short term fellowships for young people.
- 11.5 The IGNCA gives to the outsider an impression of not being people friendly. We understand that valuable academic work is being done at the IGNCA. We are also given to understand that the website of the IGNCA receives a very large number of hits every month. An academic institution is not expected to prioritise public relations ahead of introspective analytical work. And yet, public perception is an important factor in the functioning of any institution, especially in the area of culture; it does not and should not function in a vacuum.
- 11.6 There is also a limitation of openness in that the fund of information and cultural resources existing at the IGNCA is not easily made available to the public. Outreach activity on the net is improving and yet more needs to be done. The library is one of the largest in the country, certainly in the field of culture, and has some rare collections. But the number of users is not many. The IGNCA should improve its public relations effort. It must catalogue its output of research work and place it on its website.
- 11.7 In matters of administration, there are two areas which need the urgent attention of the management. For one, the IGNCA Delhi seems to have been filled at some point of time with very junior staff whose contribution to an academic institution is, to say the least, doubtful. This does not behove an academic institution of its stature. There has to be an attempt to reduce the number of Group D staff and at the same time retrain and redeploy them for better contribution to the Centre. The second is the need to manage its real estate better. There has to be

a policy decision on the use of the very expensive prime property that the IGNCA owns but does not put to sufficient use.

The Regional Centres

11.8 The distancing from the public that affects the IGNCA is also what exists with its other Centres. Our understanding of the functioning of the IGNCA is partly based on the relationship of the main Centre with the Centre in Bangalore. We were unable to study in detail, for lack of time, the working of its Varanasi Centre, or the one at Guwahati. The Eastern Regional Centre began as a project under the Central Institute of Higher Tibetan Studies, Sarnath, in 1987, and became a Centre in 1988, working in linkage with the Kalakosa Division of the IGNCA. Its main area of work is the research on and publication of 250 terms pertaining to fundamental ancient Indian arts. The North East Centre at Guwahati began on an experimental basis in 2007. But our interaction with the authorities of the IGNCA at Delhi did not include any reference by them to these regional centres. Our interaction with the Centre in Bangalore, which our Committee visited, gave us the impression that in this institution too, the hiatus in communication between Bangalore and Delhi is enormous.

Southern Regional Centre, Bangalore

11.9 The Southern Regional Centre of the IGNCA at Bangalore was started in 2001. It has an Honorary Director and very recently an Executive Director (on consultation basis) has been appointed. There are no other senior experts with the Centre. There are 4 junior officials and 10 contractual employees. The Southern Centre specialises in matters of art and culture across South India, and for that it is understaffed. With a small budget of Rs 1.40 crores under Plan and only Rs 19.72 lakhs under non Plan, the administrative and financial powers of the SRC are extremely limited.

11.10 The building at the SRC, which occupies only about 3 acres out of 10 acres originally allotted to it, has inadequate facilities. Though dissemination through concerts, performances, exhibitions, lectures and conferences is an integral part of the IGNCA charter, facilities for such activities virtually do not exist. We understand that the National Buildings Construction Corporation (NBCC) which was in charge of the building plan initially has refused to share the original plan drawings. The building is also extremely unfriendly to the differently abled. We recommend that the IGNCA, Delhi make a special plan to augment and renovate the facilities at the Southern Regional Centre urgently.

11.11 For improvements, plans have shuttled between Bangalore and Delhi. A comprehensive plan for renovation was submitted to the Head Office in March

2013, but there has been no decision. A simple matter of constructing rooms for the security staff has taken nearly two years and after much correspondence, Bangalore has now been asked to submit proposals for 'porta-cabins' instead of permanent structures. A proposal for minor renovations to protect microfilms from rainwater and humidity has no response even after 10 months. The Reprography division has about 13,860 microfilms that have been sent by the Head office but there is no microfilm reader. There is no photocopier in the library. The IGNCA must provide more funds to the SRC, and delegate higher financial and administrative powers to it. It must appoint immediately an Administrative Officer and an Accounts Officer. This cannot brook any delay.

11.12 The desolation that we found at the SRC is matched by its lack of synergy with other institutions. The institution is located within the larger Bangalore University area but has no collaborative work programme with the University. There are no academicians who are working at the SRC other than the Honorary Director, a respected academician, but one not associated on a full time basis. The new Executive Director, we understand, is on a 'consultation basis', a term we fail to understand in the context of the institution.

11.13 In programmatic and academic work there is no senior staff. Collaborative effort, as mentioned, is limited, even though, in 2013-14, the SRC has worked out 19 collaborative ventures in areas of research and in the visual and performing arts. Academic work at Bangalore must be strengthened. At least two Research Officers must be appointed. Specific areas of work, in other words, streams of research activity must be sited and action to set up groups of researchers initiated. In addition, for programme management, a Programmes officer must be appointed, if necessary on a contract basis.

11.14 Most importantly, there is no supervisory or advisory body to oversee the functioning of the SRC. While the Trust itself meets in Delhi, there is presently no Trustee who is from Bangalore to understand the problems of the SRC. We strongly feel that the SRC must have a local advisory body comprising eminent academicians, persons from the visual and performing arts and administrators, somewhat on the lines of the NGMA.

Collaborations

11.15 The IGNCA has collaborated with 77 institutions, including some abroad (*Annexure XLIII*). But with its own Regional Centres we perceive a lack of cooperative effort. Just as one example, we would cite the media centre's work on the songs of women seers and saints. The work in the entire South could be done by the SRC or under the auspices of the SRC; we find no mention of the SRC in the programme being done by Delhi. We believe there should be much greater

cooperation between IGNCA and the SRC, as also the other two regional centres. It will help set the regional centres on a more sound footing.

The Unused Spaces at IGNCA

11.16 The most immediate contribution that the IGNCA can make to the creation of synergy between institutions is to provide real estate. The IGNCA is located on about 24 acres of prime land in the heart of Lutyen's Bungalow Zone. There are vast spaces which are not being used at present, and there are no immediate plans that we notice to use the space. Instead outside agencies are given a part of the premises on rent for their own activities. We recommend that some land from the IGNCA be used for the purpose of creating a new cultural space which would include facilities for the three Akademis. One would be a library run by the SA, another an exhibition-cum-storage area for the LKA and the third a performance space for the SNA.

12. CENTRE FOR CULTURAL RESOURCES AND TRAINING

*Culture is the widening of the mind and of the spirit. : Jawaharlal
Nehru*

The Structure of CCRT

- 12.1 The Centre for Cultural Resources and Training (CCRT), an autonomous organization of the Ministry of Culture, was set up in 1979. CCRT's main thrust is to make students aware of the importance of culture in all development programmes by conducting a variety of training programmes for in-service teachers, teacher educators, educational administrators and students throughout the country.
- 12.2 The CCRT is a Society. Its membership is given in *Annexure XLIV*. The Chairman is appointed by the Government. We note that there have been fairly long periods when there has been no Chairman. At times, there has been no effort to fill the position, at other times the process started far too late. Sometimes the Secretary of the Ministry has been the Chairperson, an approach we would like to discourage. The CCRT requires a full time Chairperson who should have access to the Secretary MOC for policy decision making. We mention this because we understand that at least one Chairperson found it difficult to get an appointment with the authorities in the Ministry. In 2012-13 there have been 3 Chairpersons, two of them Joint Secretaries of MOC and then a regular Chairperson who had years earlier been Chairperson as Secretary MOC. There is no consistency in the policy for the appointment of the Chairperson. The Vice Chairman's post has not been filled for many years. The institution seems to be a neglected child of the MOC. It does low level work, keeps a low profile and produces low quality results. We recommend that the Chairperson be a person of high academic calibre and an expert in cultural research. Further, the position of Vice-Chairperson should be filled up immediately as per the procedure laid down.
- 12.3 The CCRT has on its Board the representatives of four State Governments. The level of nomination presently ranges from Secretary Culture of one State to the Deputy Secretary of another, from the Deputy Director, Cultural Affairs of a third State to the Principal, State Institute of Education from a Union Territory. We note that according to Rule 4 ix of the Rules and Regulations, there ought to be representatives from 4 states and 1 UT, but the MOC has erroneously read the rule to have 4 in all. The CCRT must be administered by persons of considerable merit and stature. We recommend that the level of representation in the Board be raised and only the Secretary to the State Government or the State's Commissioner Education should be the State's representative.

The Activities of CCRT

- 12.4 The intention behind the setting up of the CCRT was to carry forward a pilot project of the Ministry of Education which had been started in 1979, a scheme for the “Propagation of Culture among College and School Students”. The aims and objectives of the CCRT are many (*Annexure XLV*) of which the first 13 are the actual tasks. We have the impression that the main focus has been on objective (vi) which is “to organize training courses for various sections of the community on the different facets of Indian Culture”.
- 12.5 Since its inception in 1979, the CCRT has trained 5,16,216 students till date and 1,32,580 teachers. The training of teachers is the core programme of the CCRT as one teacher can create an impact on many students. These are usually 10-15 day courses with course names like “Role of Schools in Conservation of the Natural and Cultural Heritage” and the much heralded “Socially Useful Productive Work”. The teacher is taught a few skills like the use of basic musical instruments or art work, and is expected to return to school with the capacity to create a sense of wonder and the creative urge in his/her students. But are our young men and women any the more cultured for that?
- 12.6 The CCRT, to its credit, has had impact assessments done of some of its programmes, such as the Teachers’ Training Programme and the Cultural Talent Search Scheme. But these were done in 2002, and certainly need to be done again.
- 12.7 The system of school education has changed since 1979. The entry into the education sector by a number of corporate entities and not-for-profit agencies is changing the way school education is administered. The approach to the appreciation of culture is changing and new areas of cultural expression are being created. Training can no longer be restricted to simplistic use of songs and instruments. There has to be a detailed understanding of modern cultural concepts as well as our folk and tribal art forms. The courses of the CCRT must be revisited and a fresh curriculum drawn up. The CCRT should work in partnership with specialists from the NGO sector to improve the entire system especially the syllabus and teaching programme.

Regional Centres

- 12.8 The CCRT has 3 Regional Centres, one each at Hyderabad, Udaipur and Guwahati. The emphasis on the existing programmes may be given over, with enhanced support, to the regional offices. But these Centres face the problem of poor oversight. The headquarters itself is inadequately staffed, with a total of 1

Director, 7 Deputy Directors and 67 other staff. But the Regional Centres have almost no staff at all - Hyderabad has 3, Udaipur 2 and Guwahati 2 regular employees. We recommend that the staffing of the entire CCRT especially the regional offices be studied and improved.

- 12.9 At the same time, a very strong local Advisory Committee should be set up for each of the three regional centres. One had been set up for Hyderabad, comprising 2 retired IAS officers and the State Secretary, Culture. It needs strengthening, with academic members who would be able to guide the Centre forward in programmatic matters. The other two centres must have similar Advisory bodies.

Staffing Issues

- 12.10 The problem of staffing in the CCRT begins at the top. The post of Director General has been vacant and an in-charge arrangement has been in place for many years. There seems to have been unnecessary delay in creating the recruitment rules for the post. The MOC must complete this process immediately.

- 12.11 The breakup of expenditure of the expenditure of the CCRT over 5 years, 2008-09 to 2012-13 indicates an increase of establishment and administrative costs, while the expenditure on training has come down (*Annexure XLVI*). In absolute terms, the expenditure on salaries and such administrative expenses have gone up excessively. This is a matter of concern.

- 12.12 The present academic staff of CCRT is totally inadequate to take a leap forward. It has been a status quo situation, comfortable with some low level, repetitive work. But the higher levels of academic work that we can expect from the CCRT needs a total revamp of its expertise.

New Activities

- 12.13 We believe that there are two kinds of change that the CCRT needs to bring about in its responsibilities. One is as a repository of large amounts of data on cultural matters, work other than what the existing institutions are doing. The other is as a centre for high quality academic work into all aspects of culture.

- 12.14 There is no organisation under the MOC which specialises in certain areas of research. The IGNCA tends to work in areas such as heritage, art history, museology. The CCRT should collate data on cultural matters, and take up baseline data surveys on all matters relating to the culture of India.

12.15 Secondly, the CCRT can become a centre for major academic work in all aspects of cultural theory, international cultural relationships, cultural industries and so on. The first step towards this was the starting of the Kamala Devi Chattopadhyay Memorial Lecture series where very eminent personalities and academicians have been invited to speak. We would hope that a lecture and talks programme becomes a regular, perhaps monthly, feature and not just an annual one.

Centre for Cultural Research

12.16 The CCRT can play a significant role in the work of the MOC. But that requires a total change in the approach of the Ministry and a major revamp in the functioning of the CCRT. While the basic programme of training teachers and students may continue at one level, there has to be an upward shift into cultural research and seminal academic work.

12.17 The Ministry should set up an expert group to study the feasibility of modifying the role of CCRT approximately on the lines that we have proposed. It will require a strong administrator and academic experts working in tandem to bring about the change. We believe that the Centre for Cultural Resources and Training should become the Centre for Cultural Research and Training.

13. CONCLUSIONS: THE LARGER CANVAS

Culture inculcates in us values which cannot be bought and sold in the market-place: Report of the Haksar Committee.

- 13.1 We return to where we began. India's culture, at one level, is our way of life, our way of daily living. At the more esoteric level, it is aspirational, a search for excellence. How we inculcate a sense of values is a responsibility largely cast on the Ministry of Culture.

Changing Role of MOC

- 13.2 In the 21st Century, the role of the Ministry of Culture will have to be dynamic and conducive to change. A whole new language of culture, new theories, new terminology, new challenges of cutting edge application of technology in the creative process, new energies of a self-confident young, emerging India – these are challenges and opportunities that the Ministry must not only acknowledge but equip itself to handle. It is the Ministry of Culture, which will ultimately decide the direction of the highest echelons of thinking in our nation. Our Committee is only one catalyst for change; the desire must come from within.

- 13.3 The world is shrinking and our place in the comity of nations will require our cultural identity to be respected across the world. The MOC must be one of the first among Government Ministries to recognise this and shift into modern systems of administration. If the Government of India wishes to bring about change in the structure, systems and overall functioning of its Ministries, it could begin its experimentation with the Ministry of Culture.

- 13.4 It is in this spirit that we return to the Department-related Parliamentary Committee and reiterate here what it said:

Major recommendations made by the earlier Committees remain as relevant as these would have been when made decades ago. The Committee reiterates its anguish on those major recommendations not acted upon till date. That the proposed HPC does not meet the fate of earlier Committees, this Committee recommends that it may be kept informed about the decision/action taken in this regard at every step including the final outcome. (paragraph 58 of the 201st Report).

- 13.5 We believe that the Parliamentary Committee will be able to ensure the implementation of our report. In that hope we reiterate here our recommendations. But, we also wish to lay down a maximum time period for the implementation of

the recommendations. Some may take a few years, some require a “clearance” of the Ministry of Finance. But we trust that Parliamentary oversight will help in removing obstacles to a transformation of the administration of culture. We therefore make our final recommendations in this concluding chapter.

13.6 Through our Report, we have tried to retain our focus on the basic issues that need to be addressed: 1. the structure of the institution that needs to change; 2. the processes that need to be improved; 3. the scope of collaborative synergy between institutions; 4. The need for transparency; 5. the intention to break out of mediocrity; and 6. the essential prerequisite that our institutions acknowledge the ongoing transformation in our social and cultural milieu. There are other, related areas of concern, such as dishonesty and self-aggrandisement, cronyism and indifference to public need. These are part of our present day social attitudes and we seem to be losing our sense of values. We have addressed these issues only as part of our proposals for structural and procedural change. Accountability is today’s buzzword, but how does one legally hold someone accountable for a lapse? Our committee is not an audit party; we expect the MOC itself to be strict in enforcing performance and ethical standards of behaviour.

The ‘Supremacy’ of Delhi

13.7 We need to revisit the conflict we have noticed in the control of institutions from a distance. Should institutions base their identity on community involvement and participation or on a larger affiliation with the parent body in Delhi? To us the former is natural and preferable, even though there will always be some association with the apex body. The ideal way is for the MOC to create institutions and hand them over to the best in the community to run. In any case, the indifference we see of the MOC and the parent organisations to institutions outside Delhi makes us certain that clear autonomy must be given to such institutions. Most important, the institutions in far off corners of the country must not be judged by the environment of Delhi or its attitudes. The MOC must begin its change process with the axiom that our culture celebrates our diversity; there must not be a false feeling of the superiority or supremacy of Delhi. We are all equal partners in the journey of our nation.

Managing the Change

13.8 Management of change requires special effort. Our Report will not bring change if the Ministry treats it with indifference. Any perception that a formality has been observed by setting up a Committee to satisfy a Parliamentary directive would be unfortunate. Therefore the MOC must dirty its feet by wading into the muddy waters of reform.

- 13.9 And so we make our final recommendations. A Committee to implement these recommendations should be set up under the Additional Secretary. The Committee should include some officials, especially from the Akademis, but at least two external experts to ensure that an outside perspective is available. For each institution covered by our Report, a small group must be set up to study the changes required in detail and set about bringing them, into effect. We say this because our recommendations do not cover every minute detail of the changes required. There may be other related necessary changes which we have not proposed. A holistic approach to each institution will have to be taken. But we believe that all the changes we have proposed can be brought about in approximately two years.
- 13.10 There are many institutions of the MOC other than those that we have examined. Many of them require close scrutiny. We feel that similar exercises may be done with each one of them. Most essentially, performance audit of each institute must be done, and on a regular basis.
- 13.11 The officer to be appointed as the public relations officer of the Ministry must also be given the responsibility of following up on the progress of implementation of our Report. Even before the post is created, one of the present Deputy Secretaries should be given this task. The report should be placed on the website of the Ministry for wide public discourse. And, unless otherwise directed by the Departmental Related Parliamentary Committee, the MOC should send a report once every three months of the progress of implementation to that Committee.
- 13.12 Change must begin with the MOC. There is never enough emphasis to this. We need the probity of intention and the boldness of action to carve out a new path. Our administrators must realise that lethargy, indifference and dishonesty must have no role to play in the administration of culture. Otherwise, in today's world, it will lose its relevance. Individuals come and go, the institution must remain. To be of relevance, our cultural institutions must transform themselves. That can happen only if there is honesty of purpose in the MOC that spreads to the management of all these institutions.

14. RECOMMENDATIONS

In my beginning is my end....In my end is my beginning:

T.S.Eliot, Four Quartets, East Coker

Our recommendations are reproduced below. We had wished at first to suggest timelines. But we then felt that it might be somewhat unfair to the MOC as the officers may require time to take secondary and parallel steps to complete action on some of the recommendations, which we may not have taken into consideration. Besides, the action to be taken in conjunction with the Department of Expenditure or the Department of Personnel may not lend itself to specific time limits. For such issues, though, we do not believe that unending time is available. We feel that in all matters the change process could be completed in two years.

All in all, as long as our recommendations do not gather dust, and, instead, are a catalyst in bringing about much needed reform in India's cultural administration, we shall be happy in the thought that we have contributed our mite to that effort.

We end with an expression of our thanks to all who have shared with us their views and to all who have assisted us in our effort. Our special thanks to all the officers and staff of the MOC and the institutions covered by us for their effort in providing us large quantities of data, We owe a deep debt of gratitude to Mr. Rama Datt, Consultant in Delhi and Ms. Lekha Naidu, Consultant in Bangalore, who have helped us to put it all together.

Recommendations:

Introduction

14.1 The Ministry must be assisted in, not dissuaded from, bringing about change by the Department of Personnel and the Department of Expenditure, without whom nothing significant can be achieved in this regard. (Chapter 2.6)

14.2 We have had just three months to write this Report. The Ministry would do well to appreciate the time it takes to prepare a considered Report of this nature and provide the assistance it requires right from the start, without the Committee having to repeatedly ask for that support. (Chapter 2. 13)

14.3 The Ministry should not set up High Powered Committees without understanding the administrative responsibilities involved, and before working out the modalities of its functioning. (Chapter 2.14)

The Ministry of Culture

14.4 As long as the average Indian is unable to spare household income for cultural activities, Government has to provide the facilities for cultural activity; it has to both encourage the creative effort and provide the infrastructure for the purpose. (Chapter 3.5)

14.5 There is a lack of flexibility in financial and administrative matters in the functioning of many institutions under the Ministry of Culture. Since the “value” of cultural expression cannot be judged in Governmental financial terms, there is a need to find a certain flexibility in their functioning, without compromising the basic norms of financial propriety. (Chapter 3.9.3)

14.6 Significant support was available to the Ministry in the past from Advisors who aided the very process of setting up institutions. We need expertise today in the Ministry.(Chapter 3.12)

14.7 A pool of 50 positions should be created in the Ministry of Culture, of young people, of whom some could work in the Ministry itself and some in the various institutions under the Ministry. This culture administration pool would be filled by contract appointments of up to 5 years, extendable by another 5. During this period, many might leave, but new persons would join, and those who prefer to stay on for the entire period, might find place in regular or further contractual positions in the institutions under the Ministry. (Chapter 3.14)

14.8 Many of these positions should be outside Delhi, to be placed in the seven ZCCs, the NGMA Bangalore and Mumbai, the NSDs outside Delhi as and when set up (to help with managerial work and programmatic support if qualified), IGNA Bangalore, the Museums outside Delhi and such organisations. (Chapter 3.15)

14.9 As and when the Ministry requires specialised, external advice on any matter, there should be a panel of experts from whom on payment of a fee, such advice could be sought. This could be in the nature of a sitting fee paid for a meeting or a fee for written advice. The MOC may work out details of such a panel. (Chapter 3.16)

14.10 All the staff of the Ministry should undergo at least a one week programme at the CCRT to make them alive to our cultural milieu. The programme should

- include a brief introduction to art and aesthetics, to the performing arts, to the variety in our cultural ethos, and to the requirements of cultural administration. The trainees must understand the expectations that creative artistes would have of the Ministry, appreciate our own tangible and intangible heritage, and be introduced to global cultural trends. Such a course every two years should cover all officials of the MOC, including officers. (Chapter 3.17)
- 14.11 For any newcomer to the Ministry, a brief should be made available about the work of the Ministry, including the fundamentals of cultural theory and appreciation of the arts. What is expected of a catalyst and not a controller must be explained to the newcomer. (Chapter 3.18)
- 14.12 The MOC should set up a group of experts to assess the grants programme and help the MOC in positioning the programme correctly. It would have to remove inefficiencies in the procedure and the release of funds. It should also ensure that the experts' panels truly reflect the best experts in the country, especially in new proficiencies. Age should not be the criterion here, but expertise. We must emphasise that all grantees lists for fellowships should be finalised before the year of the grant begins. (Chapter 3.21)
- 14.13 We also recommend that the Ministry sets up an enquiry as to how grantees for 2011-12 were finalised more than two years late. If this is not done, there would be no accountability in the Ministry. (Chapter 3.21)
- 14.14 When the Akademis concerned take over grant making, they must publicly announce details of disbursement. All the necessary information should be available on the net, and the websites of the Akademis should be strengthened for this purpose. (Chapter 3.22)
- 14.15 The entire range of attached and subordinate offices of the Ministry will need to be reviewed to decide on the optimum and appropriate form of delegation and autonomy. (Chapter 3.24)
- 14.16 The very purpose of an attached office, which is only an extension of the Ministry for all practical purposes, is lost if a junior official in the Ministry were to scrutinise the proposals of the attached offices and sit in judgement over senior officers. This practice must be stopped as it only delays decision making and adds to the work of the Ministry. Obviously, a major issue may require clarity, and greater examination, but a meeting to clear doubts would be better than a duplicate file movement. (Chapter 3.25)
- 14.17 The Ministry should set out an MOU with each institution before the start of the new financial year, for the forthcoming year, and give it all relevant

administrative powers. We recommend that a group of outside experts and officials from the relevant institution should finalise the delegation of administrative powers for all institutions of the Ministry by end 2014, and begin a system of MOUs from 2015-16. Needless to say, these MOUs must be ready before the end of 2014-15. (Chapter 3.26)

14.18 The OM no. 1(37)/2010-EII (A) dated 2nd November, 2010, of the Ministry of Finance, Department of Expenditure (*Annexure XII*), should be used for creating separate, independent financial rules for all the 35 autonomous institutions, including many directly of relevance to our Report. The bylaws of each autonomous body should be examined to enable the creation of a set of Financial Rules for each body relevant to its purpose, and its work. (Chapter 3.27)

14.19 We would strongly recommend that the number of officers at the level of Deputy Secretary in the Internal Financial Division of the MOC should be raised from 1 to at least 3. (Chapter 3.28)

14.20 The direction the Ministry would take over the coming year should be discussed amongst all the agencies which are responsible for the administration of culture. A special effort must be made by the MOC towards fostering a sense of purpose and camaraderie amongst all the institutions. (Chapter 3.29)

14.21 The Ministry should hold an annual meeting, spread over two days, to be chaired by the Secretary before the finalisation of the budget for any financial year to (a) finalise a national calendar of major programmes for the forthcoming year, (b) ensure appropriate funding in the coming year, and (c) foster coordination and cooperation among all its institutions (Chapter 3.30)

14.22 The best way to pick the best person for the job is to keep the required area of expertise very wide. If we can expect in our present system for generalist bureaucrats to ease into the role of cultural administrators, we can also have managers to head strategic positions in the institutions. We need to do a complete overhaul of our recruitment rules. (Chapter 3.32)

14.23 Rigidity in the system can be overcome if there is the will to do so. Between the Department of Personnel and the Department of Expenditure, there has to be the foresight to see the vision of the future. (Chapter 3.33)

14.24 A small group, under a senior officer, should be set up to study closely all the recruitment rules and propose easing of restrictive requirements. This should be taken up as a special drive. In a year's time, these posts should be filled, either from within the organisation or from the market, possibly on contract. The MOC

should try to obtain the services of suitable State Civil Officers on deputation, especially where the institutions are located in a particular State. (Chapter 3.34)

- 14.25 The Ministry would do well to have a “pointsperson” to whom the public could turn to for assistance. The Ministry should create a post at the level of Deputy Secretary and designate that officer as the public relations and information officer. The new officer would be the link between the public and the Ministry, and indeed some manner of ombudsman covering all the institutions under the Ministry of Culture. He/she will not be a vigilance officer, but a facilitator. Placing this officer in the office of the Secretary MOC will vest him/her with a certain authority and enable him/her direct access to the Secretary if required. (Chapter 3.35)
- 14.26 The Ministry should have another officer of the rank of Deputy Secretary to be Research Officer in the Ministry, who would be the focal point of data management of the Ministry. (Chapter 3.36)
- 14.27 For the better management of the institutions under the Ministry it is essential to have a constant review of the activities of those institutions. The Research Officer should also be a point of coordination in the Ministry and work in cooperation with the other officers to ensure continuity of the review process. (Chapter 3.37)
- 14.28 It is necessary to set up institutes of excellence in the field of the performing and visual arts, and allied areas of study. Just as there are IIMs and IITs for management and technology studies, there could be Indian Institutes of Arts and Culture. (Chapter 3.41)
- 14.29 The IIACs should have two components. First it must have an academic stream for the management of art and culture, including art administration, and the management of cultural institutions. Second they should have all major art forms in one campus. There could be specialization in each IIAC depending on the region covered and the expertise at the Centre. The IIACs should be headed by eminent persons in the field of cultural and art administration, and in the performing and visual arts. (Chapter 3.42)
- 14.30 All beneficiary oriented projects must have the awardees finalised by all institutions six months before the new financial year, so that they can be budgeted for. (Chapter 3.44)
- 14.31 The budget is a way to indicate the direction a Ministry takes and the emphasis it provides to its different areas of work. Some organisations under the MOC have higher growth in funding than others, while some are in relative

stagnation. The MOC must take stock of the growth rates and funding pattern and analyse whether that pattern is appropriate or not. (Chapter 3.45)

14.32 Adequate funds must be provided for the maintenance of cultural institutions. (Chapter 3.46)

14.33 To strengthen the capacities of our institutions we will need to obtain outside expertise, and the MOC will have to offer decent salaries and wages to the experts. The best experts need to be respected, and paid remuneration at least at the level of Joint Secretaries. We should not be miserly with their travel and stay arrangements or with other reasonable charges. For reasons given in the Report, it is essential to entrust even contractual appointees with financial powers. (Chapter 3.47)

The Three Akademis: Common Issues

14.34 For the sake of research and academic interest, a set of all the changes made from time to time and the papers related to those actions should be located and archived in each Akademi. (Chapter 4.9)

14.35 In modern management terms, a vision statement followed by a mission statement would be useful to bring clarity to the role of each Akademi and to the activities which may be listed afresh in today's context. (Chapter 4.10)

14.36 There is a certain loss of focus in the functioning of the Akademis. The Lalit Kala Akademi does no research, the Sangeet Natak only a little, and the Sahitya Akademi, despite the presence of Universities in the GC, does not do much research work. The list of activities of each Akademi should be reviewed, prioritised and reoriented. (Chapter 4.11,4.12)

14.37 The term of the GC should be reduced from 5 years to 3 years. Thus the term of office of all non-official office bearers would also be 3 years. (Chapter 4.14)

14.38 Further, no person should be member of the GC or any internal Committee/Board in any of the three Akademis for more than 2 terms, that is, beyond 6 years. This would be the limit for membership of all the Akademis together. (Chapter 4.15)

14.39 The Centre offers a degree of capacity which the States do not exhibit and which the States, by participating in the Central processes, may absorb. We believe that the States must actively participate in rebuilding our national bodies into institutions of excellence and in that process be touched themselves by that excellence. (Chapter 4.18)

- 14.40 Each State and UT should send a recommendation of three names in alphabetical order for nomination to each Central Akademi. These should be persons of eminence in their respective areas of academic or creative work, and not bureaucrats or political personages. Of these three, one would be selected by a Committee of three which would comprise the Chairperson of the Akademi, the Joint Secretary (Akademis) and an expert nominated by the Chairperson. (Chapter 4.19)
- 14.41 At least one out of three names proposed by the States should be of age lower than 45 years and at least one of those three should be a woman. As the final selection is made by the Committee, it should select judiciously to ensure that at least 25% of the members are below the age of 45 years, and of the total, at least 33% are women. (Chapter 4.20)
- 14.42 This list of members of each Akademi should be finalised before the new term begins for the Akademi. Indeed all names, including that of other members, as per the individual Constitutions, should be in place before the new term and not during the term. (Chapter 4.21)
- 14.43 It is necessary that the selection of the Chairperson receives wide, public acclaim. That selection, therefore, must be through a transparent selection process, as objective as is possible. (Chapter 4.22)
- 14.44 The selection of the Chairman of an Akademi must be from a panel proposed by a search committee. This committee of three eminent persons should be constituted in the following manner. One member of the search committee should be nominated by the Government. One should be a person nominated by the outgoing Chairperson. The third should be an eminent person, not necessarily an artist himself/herself, but one associated with the arts, to be nominated by the GC. The Government must ensure that at least one out the three in the search committee is a woman. This search committee must be set up one year ahead of the date of retirement of the incumbent Chairperson/President. The search committee should propose three names in alphabetical order, from whom the President of India may make a final selection. The Chairperson/President would take charge co-terminus with the new General Council every three years. (Chapter 4.26)
- 14.45 The Ministry, in the need for simplification of procedures, must insist on the change in the selection procedure of the Chairpersons. (Chapter 4.27)
- 14.46 The Chairperson's term has to coincide with that of the GC. The term of any President/Chairperson should ordinarily be limited to one term. However, a Chairperson of exceptional merit, may be given a second term if felt appropriate. This should not be a continuous term but part of a fresh selection. The maximum

- number of years a person can be Chairperson shall be restricted to six years, comprising two terms of three years each. (Chapter 4.29)
- 14.47 The Chairperson and all office bearers, all Heads of Committees of any Akademi should not be above the age of 70 years. (Chapter 4.30)
- 14.48 There are difficulties in the use of the term President for the Sahitya Akademi and Chairman of the other two. All the three Akademis be headed by Chairpersons, and that term be adopted for all three of them. (Chapter 4.31)
- 14.49 The position of Vice Chairman/Vice President should be abolished in the three Akademis. Where the Vice Chairperson heads any internal committee of an Akademi, that should now be headed by one or the other elected member of the Executive Board, depending on his/her area of expertise. (Chapter 4.33)
- 14.50 It would be required of the Chairperson, if he/she is not from Delhi, to spend more time in the headquarters. Housing and other suitable facilities should therefore be provided to the Chairperson. (Chapter 4.34)
- 14.51 The Secretary of an Akademi should be a person of eminence. He should be given a status of a full Professor of a University, with a fixed salary at the higher end of the Professor's grade, covering all entitlement of a Professor in the UGC system. A special allowance in the nature of an increase in emoluments may be considered at the end of each year. The equation of the Secretary with the Ministry may change, but we believe that would be for the better. (Chapter 4.38)
- 14.52 The Secretary must not be entrenched in the Akademi as he/she should not build a personal stake in the organisation. Therefore the Secretary must be appointed on contract basis for a period of three years, extendable by one term of three years each. (Chapter 4.38)
- 14.53 The selection of the Secretary must be made from a list of eight to ten persons prepared through an advertisement-cum-search-cum-interview process where the selection committee must consist of the Chairperson of the Akademi, the Secretary of the MOC and three eminent experts of whom two would be nominated by the Chairperson and one by the MOC. (Chapter 4.39)
- 14.54 The Secretary could be selected on deputation, if a suitable candidate is available. The advantage of having a person on deputation from academia would be the emphasis that could be placed on academic work in the institution. (Chapter 4.39)
- 14.55 The tenure of the Secretary would be subject to a review of his/her performance after the second year, by an external Committee to be set up by the Chairperson of the Akademi in consultation with the MOC. After the review, if the Committee finds, for reasons to be recorded in writing, that the work of the

Secretary has been outstanding, the Akademi may extend the term of the Secretary by up to another term of 3 years, which would also be subject to review. (Chapter 4.40)

- 14.56 The MOC must formulate fresh rules of recruitment and should go through the process of appointing a Secretary in each Akademi in the next one year. The present incumbents should be permitted to apply in case they otherwise fulfill the revised rules. (Chapter 4.41)
- 14.57 To bridge any gap between outside eminence and internal management, one of the Deputy Secretaries of the Akademi should be made, by a process of selection from among the Deputy Secretaries of the Akademi, a Joint Secretary, at a pay scale of a Director in Government. The Joint Secretary would be entitled to aspire to be the Secretary provided he/she attains eminence distinction through academic, professional or creative work and is otherwise eligible. Besides, he/she must give up the service benefits in his/her existing capacity to become the Secretary on contract and will not be entitled to return to any position in the Akademi. (Chapter 4.42)
- 14.58 With the abolition of the post of Vice chairperson, if any occasion arises when the Chairperson is not able to perform his/her functions temporarily, the Executive Board may select a temporary Chairperson for a period up to one month on their own, or in consultation with Government, if for a longer period. For a few days, the concerned Advisory Board may take appropriate decisions. (Chapter 4.46)
- 14.59 The Financial Advisor should be the Chairperson of all the three Akademis. In any case, since we have recommended the abolition of the posts of Vice-Chairperson, who is the Chairperson in the SA, the FA has to be the Chairperson of the Committee.(Chapter 4.47)
- 14.60 The Rule regarding the Finance Committee is the same for all the 3 Akademis - "The Finance Committee shall consider the budget estimates of the Akademi, make recommendations thereon to the Executive Board and prescribe the total limits of expenditure within a financial year." This is a budget side activity, not an expenditure side responsibility. The Finance Committee does not have the powers to examine new expenditure or give advice in the course of the year on any financial matters that may be brought before it for consideration. A better turn of phrase is required to give the Committee its true and complete role. (Chapter 4.48)
- 14.61 There may be a genuine time lag between the release of funds and its spending, especially for new schemes. We are of the view that the amount could be allowed to be retained for up to one year from the date of release, after which it would have to be returned if not spent. (Chapter 4.50)

- 14.62 The funds provided to the Akademis over the years have not increased to the extent desired of their activities. Since the Akademis should be the moving force behind the efforts of Government to encourage the arts, the amount is minuscule in comparison to the cultural aspirations and the creative needs of the people. (Chapter 4.51)
- 14.63 The Akademis could seek to raise funds from PSUs under their CSR commitments. Each Akademi should set up a fund into which CSR funds of PSUs are placed. (Chapter 4.53)
- 14.64 Every two years a performance audit should be done by reputed institutions of the activities of the Akademi. For maintaining quality in academic work, a peer review system may be appropriate. The Akademis will need to display their capacity for self-introspection, if they are to remain truly independent. (Chapter 4.54)
- 14.65 The time has come for a renewed thrust in the activities of the Akademis and there is a need for more space for each Akademi. We believe that out of the vast empty spaces in the land held by the IGNCA a part could be offered for a joint development of facilities by the three Akademis. One would be a library run by the SA, one an exhibition-cum-storage area managed by the LKA and the third a performance space for the SNA. (Chapter 4.56)
- 14.66 The day to day maintenance of Rabindra Bhavan must be handed over to a specialised housekeeping organisation. who would be paid from a common fund to be created for this purpose (Chapter 4.57)
- 14.67 At the programmatic level, synergy must be in academic collaboration. The three Akademis could jointly support inter-disciplinary studies. They should hold joint workshops and discussions in areas of common theoretical importance.(Chapter 4.58)
- 14.68 The Akademis must reach out to the grassroots level by closely working with the ZCCs. It is necessary for the Akademis to shed their metropolitan outlook and reach out to smaller towns and even rural areas. (Chapter 4.59)
- 14.69 From the culture pool of young persons to be appointed by the MOC contractually, one should be placed in each ZCC to liaise with the Akademis. (Chapter 4.60)
- 14.70 A common Library of Culture should be set up covering all the three Akademis and the National School of Drama. This could be housed in the space proposed to be provided at the IGNCA. It should become a library second only to the National Library. Each institution should retain a small segment of its collection in its own premises. (Chapter 4.62)

- 14.71 The MOC should set up a group to supervise the creation of this new library and have it set up over the next three years. The group should meet under the Chairmanship of the JS in charge of libraries and comprise eminent librarians to advise and assist in the process.(Chapter 4.63)
- 14.72 A working group should be set up, chaired by a senior officer of the MOC, with the three Secretaries of the Akademis, experts in the arts and at least one legal expert to draw up the new Constitutions of the Akademis. Thereafter the Government will have to use its overarching powers to direct the Akademis to adopt these changes. (Chapter 4.64)

Sangeet Natak Akademi

- 14.73 It would be useful for the Akademi to review its aims and objects. A vision statement be prepared to provide afresh the raison d'être for the existence of the Akademi. That statement must be followed by a mission statement, which would indicate the activities it would involve itself. (Chapter 5.2, 5.3)
- 14.74 The SNA's GC includes a membership of 5 persons nominated by the Government of India (Clause 4. iii). These are not officials, for there is a separate set of nominations which covers Government officers. We believe this category should be for eminent men and women, with preference for academic stature because they must represent the intellectual and academic scholarship that an Akademi must encourage. There is need for clarity in this regard. (Chapter 5.4)
- 14.75 The SNA has four significant wings to its activities, music, dance, theatre and folk forms. We would not like to compartmentalise the selection of the Chairperson according to any category, but we would hope that eminence in all these spheres is recognised. (Chapter 5.5)
- 14.76 We have expressed our dissatisfaction with the centre of power and power mongering that the position of Vice Chairperson can create in an Akademi. We recommend that the position of Vice Chairperson be abolished. (Chapter 5.6)
- 14.77 The SNA should obtain a list of three names as indicated in Chapter 4 from each State, without formally insisting on consultation with the State Akademis. The final selection should be made as proposed in Chapter 4. (Chapter 5.7)
- 14.78 In the Executive Board, over and above the official nominees, not more than 3 to 4 persons shall be from Delhi. We also believe that conscious effort must be made to bring on board eminent persons from States which are rarely, if ever, represented. (Chapter 5.9)

- 14.79 The quorum for the SNA's GC is only 10. This is about 15% of the membership and a very low number. We would recommend that the quorum should be fixed at 40% for the Committees and 25% for the GC. (Chapter 5.11)
- 14.80 In the re-written Constitution, the location of the Registered Office should not be restricted to Rabindra Bhavan but to the National Capital Region. (Chapter 5.12)
- 14.81 For the Advisory Committees, greater representation must be given eminent persons outside Delhi. The Akademi must be alert to this requirement. (Chapter 5.14)
- 14.82 Using modern management techniques, the SNA should undertake a discipline-wise impact assessment to ensure balance between its 4 main areas of activity and its equitable geographical spread. (Chapter 5.15)
- 14.83 The expenditure on academic work as a percentage of the total expenditure is coming down. The academic aspect of the mandate of SNA must not be lost sight of. Instead, it must be strengthened. (Chapter 5.16)
- 14.84 Our interaction with artistes both young and not so young has repeatedly brought up the view that academic and research activity does not seem to be of importance to the SNA. Performance Studies and Dance Studies are new academic disciplines in some of our Universities. The SNA must be aware of an increasing gap between practitioners of the performing arts and the theoreticians, and must set up a platform for debate, discussion and analysis. (Chapter 5.17)
- 14.85 SNA must hold regular workshops on theoretical aspects of the performing arts. It must begin a regular programme on performing arts appreciation for the public. At a more serious academic level, courses on critical writing on dance, music and theatre must be started. And it must be a vehicle for seeking a larger space in the media for cultural activities. (Chapter 5.18)
- 14.86 The SNA must work out a long term academic programme at the university level for providing scholarships to students. Overall, the SNA's relationship with academia must be strengthened. (Chapter 5.19)
- 14.87 Delays in the release of funds cause hardship for young scholars and performers. It removes very financial security that the grant was supposed to provide. The list of individual grantees and their funding for a particular year should be finalised the previous financial year and that under no circumstances should there be any delay in the release of grants. (Chapter 5.20)

- 14.88 Lists of all grantees must be placed on the website of the SNA with all relevant details to enable the public to judge the transparency of the process. This will also enable better management of funds. (Chapter 5.21)
- 14.89 The Akademi must find a way towards greater coordination with the seven Zonal Cultural Centres. The Akademi should have performances not only in Delhi or important urban centres, but also in smaller towns using the ZCCs in each region. On its part, it can assist the ZCCs with training support, academic enrichment and quality programming. (Chapter 5.22)
- 14.90 The SNA must scout for talent through the ZCCs and raise that talent to the national level. (Chapter 5.23)
- 14.91 If the SNA and the other institutions were to leave all work pertaining to the encouragement of the folk arts to a new Akademi for Tribal and Folk Art, the mainstreaming of our rich heritage might receive a setback. If the SNA, for example, gave up its awards for traditional forms, it would become an elitist institution, something we ought to discourage (Chapter 5.24)
- 14.92 There is a need to bring into the limelight our traditional forms of dance and music. At the same time music and dance is moving into new areas, into experimentation and new creative expressions. Equitable emphasis should be provided by the SNA to all forms of dance, music and theatre. (Chapter 5.25)
- 14.93 The funding programme of the SNA should carry a small component for western music and carefully selected academies may be financially supported. (Chapter 5.27)
- 14.94 The SNA awards are given in five areas of the performing arts – music, dance, theatre, other traditional /folk/ tribal/ dance/ music/ theatre and puppetry, and contribution / scholarship in the performing arts. There are 8 awards each in the first four categories and 1 in the last one. There are some potential imbalances and awkwardness in the categorisation. These may require redefinition. (Chapter 5.28)
- 14.95 A small group should be set up by the SNA to recommend a complete overhaul of the awards process and a simplification of the regulations. (Chapter 5.30)
- 14.96 The SNA award is a one- time recognition and does not seem to lead to any sustained improvement in the performance schedule of an artist. In the case of its young awardees, the SNA would do well to provide a series of performances for them at the ZCC level over a year after their award. It would be a boost for fledgling careers. (Chapter 5.31)

- 14.97 It is unfortunate that the premier institution of music and dance in India has no significant performance space of its own. The Siri Fort auditorium complex should come under the charge of the SNA. Apart from the main large auditorium, there are two smaller performing spaces in the complex which can be used effectively for lecture-demonstrations of dance and music. (Chapter 5.32)
- 14.98 The Akademi must create a National Centre for the Performing Arts under its auspices, which would include its National Museum of Performing Arts. (Chapter 5.33)
- 14.99 The SNA must be an activist for cultural spaces that are friendly to the differently abled. (Chapter 5.33)
- 14.100 The Akademi must have regular in-service training programmes for its staff in the appreciation of the performing arts. (Chapter 5.34)
- 14.101 The DS for coordination should be placed in charge of academic coordination and be re-designated suitably. (Chapter 5.35)

Sahitya Akademi

- 14.102 We recommend that each State and UT should send a recommendation of three names in alphabetical order for the GC, of which one would be selected by a Committee as laid down in Chapter 4. (Chapter 6.5)
- 14.103 In 2012-13, there were around 180 Universities in India with Post Graduate Departments in Humanities of whom 20 are selected to the GC. To have 20 Universities selected out of 180 is itself a Herculean task and does not stand to reason today. There is no clarity on the reasons for choosing one University and not another. Clearly there would be an element of bias in this category of selection. Universities have a role in only one Akademi and not the other two. Their contribution to the Akademi seems nebulous. In today's world, it is best to remove this category of membership altogether from the GC of the Sahitya Akademi. (Chapter 6.7)
- 14.104 The dual terminology of Chairperson and President when referring to the three Heads of the Akademis together is awkward. In Hindi, the term used is 'Adhyaksha' which translates to Chairperson. We recommend that the term President should be substituted by Chairperson. (Chapter 6.8)
- 14.105 The position of the Vice President should be abolished. The Vice President is presently the Chairperson of the Finance Committee. In the other two Akademis, the Finance Advisor is the Chairperson of the Finance Committee; that should be

the system in the SA too. In the absence of the Chairperson, the procedures proposed for a substitute in Chapter 4 of this Report shall stand. (Chapter 6.9)

- 14.106 The Constitution of the Akademi allows it to shift its headquarters out of Delhi, if supported by three-fourths of the whole number of members of the General Council. For reasons of better coordination with Government and with the other two Akademis, it would be best if the headquarters of the Akademi is located in the National Capital Region. (Chapter 6.10)
- 14.107 The quorum for meetings should be fixed at 40% for the Committees and 25% for the GC. (Chapter 6.11)
- 14.108 A vision statement should be prepared to bring clarity to the reasons for the existence of the Akademi. That must be followed by a mission statement, which would enable the Akademi to adequately define its activities. (Chapter 6.13)
- 14.109 The Akademi should set up an external assessment of the contribution of the Language Advisory Boards over the years in the functioning of the Akademi and their contribution towards the development of the language. (Chapter 6.16)
- 14.110 The role of the Language Advisory Boards in the selection process of the Akademi awards needs to be reviewed. The very direct role of the Advisory Board members in the awards judging process must be changed to one where it is truly only advisory. They must not be party to any perceived predilection towards an author or his/her books. (Chapter 6.17)
- 14.111 The book awards process needs to be simplified. The modern practice of receiving books for selection from publishers should be followed by the SA with a limit of 6 books to be submitted by a publishing house. From this, a Panel of 10 expert referees to be nominated by the Chairperson on the advice of the Advisory Board may prepare a long list of up to 50 books. Books not submitted but felt to be significant by the Panel may be added, a maximum of one book per expert. The same Panel of 10 referees must then share the reading of the books and recommend one book each. Any book recommended for the long list by a member of the Panel shall not be read by him/her at this stage, but by someone else. Out of the 10 books now in a shortlist, the referees must each read all the books, and use a grading system to recommend a final short list of 6 books in confidence to a group of 3 judges whose names should be decided by the Chairperson, from a panel of six names proposed by the Advisory Board. (Chapter 6.22)
- 14.112 The names of the judges should remain confidential till the announcement is made of the winner. It is quite possible that the judges would know one or more of the shortlisted writers personally. They must make a declaration of that equation and if anyone is related to a candidate, he/she should be asked to withdraw. A

- mere acquaintanceship should not disqualify the judge, but the fact should be recorded by the Secretary of the Akademi internally. (Chapter 6.23)
- 14.113 The names of the Panel of experts should be made known, because there they can do little to influence the final decision. Once the award is announced, the short list of 6 books must also be announced. At this stage, the original long list must also be made known. The names of the judges must also be announced and their brief reasons for selecting the winner. (Chapter 6.24)
- 14.114 For the Bal Sahitya Puraskar and the Yuva Puraskar, nominations from publishers should be the starting point of the selection process. The process proposed for the main awards should be followed here too. (Chapter 6.25)
- 14.115 An additional award should be instituted in all the languages for the best work of literary criticism. The work must not be for the editor of a set of articles by a motley group of academicians, but for a single work of criticism by a single author. This single work may include a collection of essays by the same author. A work of non-fiction, such as a study of any subject written in a literary style, could also be considered for the same award. (Chapter 6.26)
- 14.116 The process of awards and the ultimate winners indicates a strong bias towards fiction. A balance is required between all genres of writing and the Sahitya Akademi should be a catalyst for neglected genres like poetry and drama. (Chapter 6.27)
- 14.117 The work of the Language Advisory Boards should be judged not so much by their contribution to the secretive award selection process, but by their effort to popularise the literature of that language. Poets, novelists and short fiction writers must be offered readings from their own works and play readings should be held. Young authors, particularly, should be encouraged to read from their work. Tier II and Tier III towns must be covered in a special effort to popularise literature. (Chapter 6.28)
- 14.118 A draft list of books should be prepared for the medium term, which would be a list of books to be translated and the languages into which they would be translated. This list should be made public, asking for suggestions. (Chapter 6.29)
- 14.119 The officer who looks after translations does so along with his main work of looking after publications and other items of work. A person may be appointed on contract and placed solely in charge of coordinating all translation work. (Chapter 6.30)
- 14.120 The website of the SA, which is managed inhouse, is so constructed that sufficient emphasis has not been placed on providing easy access to relevant information. The SA should give the management its website to a professional agency. (Chapter 6.31,6.32,)

- 14.121 Every two years a performance audit should be done by reputed institutions of the activities of the Akademi. (Chapter 6.33)
- 14.122 The Library of Culture, common to all three Akademis, must be set up urgently, and the MOC must take a leading role in coordinating this. Even before the Library of Culture is set up, the SA should find space to temporarily expand its library. (Chapter 6.34)
- 14.123 It is essential for the library to go online. To begin with, a list of all the books in the library must be placed online. Renewal of books could also be brought online in due course. A separate section on that register of books, must list all the books published by the Akademi. (Chapter 6.35)
- 14.124 The regional libraries of the SA must also go online to enable searches and renewals without the member having to come to the library. (Chapter 6.36)
- 14.125 The Akademi's publications must be more easily and widely available. The pricing policy should be such that there are adequate returns for the author, distributor and the bookseller. The expenditure of the Akademi on publicity, which could include higher subsidies for sales, should be increased. (Chapter 6.38)
- 14.126 Another sales effort must be through online sales. There are important online booksellers today and there should be a special effort to have them sell the Akademi's books. Besides, the Akademi itself must sell its books online. (Chapter 6.39)
- 14.127 We would hope that using modern sales techniques, the Akademi's publication and sales programme is brought to such a position that we notice books with the famous SA logo in every bookstore. (Chapter 6.40)
- 14.128 Our Committee notes that there is no special capacity in the Akademi with regard to intellectual property matters. In the new age of copyright issues, it is essential that the Akademi has either inhouse expertise or has access to legal expertise in copyright matters. Facilitation should be provided to access such advice, at a small cost, to any author who wishes to avail of the facility. (Chapter 6.41)
- 14.129 Given the relatively insufficient sales of its books, the SA has to increase funds for publicity and promotional activities. (Chapter 6.43)
- 14.130 There is a lack of effort for the translation of Indian books into foreign languages. There is no budget for this. We feel that our own literature must find a place abroad and a special effort for this is required.(Chapter 6.43)
- 14.131 The Akademi should redraw the work allocation of all officers in a more systematic manner. Where we have suggested new areas of work, and if the

Akademi deems it so necessary, they may create appropriate positions. Some of this expertise may be on contract basis. (Chapter 6.45)

Lalit Kala Akademi

- 14.132 Fundamental modifications are required in the system that has developed over time in the LKA. We need to bring back a semblance of correct behaviour into the LKA. The complex composition of the GC must be changed and the intricate structure and language of the Constitution has to be simplified. (Chapter 7.3, 7.7)
- 14.133 Elections must be removed as a means of membership of the Akademi's GC. The entire system of elections must be scrapped. (Chapter 7.15)
- 14.134 Under Clause 11 which relates to the functions of the GC, the power of the Government to change the rules through a directive is definite and final. According to the LKA's Constitution, the GC can presently meet without the elected members, the MOC can give it a directive, or a series of directives and begin the process of cleansing the LKA of its politics. We expect this to be done urgently. (Chapter 7.16, 7.17)
- 14.135 All the States should be on the GC at any given time. (Chapter 7.18)
- 14.136 For these nominations under Rule 10.vii, as we have proposed in Chapter 4, three names should be sent by each State in alphabetical order, from which a selection would be made. The States should be encouraged to propose sculptors, cartoonists, art historians, curators, restorers, art critics, graphic artists, photographers and animators. (Chapter 7.18)
- 14.137 The five nominees of Government under Rule 10.iv are the Director NGMA, DG National Museum, the JS (Akademi), another representative of the MOC and the FA. The rule is neither felicitous in its wording nor lucid in its intention. Since the FA finds place separately at 10.iii in the list, we do not understand the intention behind this duplication. There is also no need for another person from the MOC when the JS himself is included. In their place, the Directors of NGMA Mumbai and NGMA Bangalore should be included. This group will then have 5 persons and the FA would come in under Rule 10.iii. (Chapter 7.19)
- 14.138 Rule 10.v covers "nominees of GOI holding offices under its control". It covers the Chairman SNA, the President SA, the DG ICCR, the MS IGNCA, the DGs Akashwani and Doordarshan and Chairman UGC. Of these, the last three of the group need to be removed; their role is so negligible that they do not warrant a place in the Akademi. The DG ASI and the Director, Indian Museum, Kolkata,

may be added in their place, the total number being reduced from 8 to 7. (Chapter 7.20)

14.139 Under Rule 10.vi, three Fellows are nominated by the Chairperson. Fellows are recognised for their eminence, not as participants in a process of governance. The selection of three is itself awkward. In fact, all Fellows should be elders who can be consulted by the Chairperson and the GC if required. We are of the view that it is best to remove this category. (Chapter 7.21)

14.140 There are, under 10.viii, 10 persons of “high integrity and record of management and service in the promotion of the arts” nominated by the MOC to represent art organisations in the GC. Under 10.x, there are 7 experts covering various areas of art, but the clause is written in an extremely confusing manner. Thus under 10.viii and x, there are 17 members in all. In their place we suggest as follows. Under a revised Rule 10.viii, there should be 4 representatives of Universities or Schools of Art of high repute. A roster should be made of such institutions. From these, 4 would be chosen for each GC. These should be selected on a rotational basis by the Chairperson. (Chapter 7.22, 7.23)

14.141 As regards individual experts under Rule 10.x, we would propose that this should be increased to 12, but include among them at least 4 who are sculptors, and 6 at least from the fields of photography, graphic design, cartooning, animation and folk art. There should be no specific categorisation, and it would depend on the excellence of the person and the need for expertise of the Akademi. We would recommend that from these 12, at least one third should be women and one third should be persons below the age of 45. Some might come under both these requirements. These persons shall be selected by the members of the GC under Rules 10.i, iii, v & vii, in a manner similar to the process in Sangeet Natak Akademi. (Chapter 7.24)

14.142 A strange aspect of the written rules for membership of the GC is the requirement of integrity in the person. This applies certain categories only. The Secretary himself does not have to meet this requirement. Despite this exhortation to incorruptibility, there have been accusations of corrupt practices in the Akademi. References to moral character may be removed in the rules for membership of the GC, even though the reference is well intentioned. (Chapter 7.26)

14.143 The verbiage that is the hallmark of the Constitution must be completely removed. We suggest that the entire terminology of the Constitution has to be revisited by a small group to be set up for rewriting the Constitution. (Chapter 7.27)

- 14.144 Our Committee reiterates its recommendation from Chapter 4 that the term of the Chairperson shall be only three years and that a second term would not be a consecutive one. (Chapter 7.28)
- 14.145 Ideally, when the Government makes its choice of Chairperson, it should look at placing in the chair eminent persons from different specialisations in the field of visual art. We must not fall into the trap of suggesting a rotation policy here. But it should not be that the Chairperson is repeatedly an artist, and not, say, a sculptor, a photographer, an art historian and so on. (Chapter 7.29)
- 14.146 The Vice Chairperson of the Akademi has in recent times, become the focus of such controversy that only deep surgical treatment can get the Akademi back to some shape. We reiterate that the Vice Chairman's position be abolished. (Chapter 6.30)
- 14.147 The fixing of a quorum of one-sixth is untenable and needs to be changed. The quorum should be fixed at 40% for meetings of the Committees and 25% for meetings of the GC. (Chapter 7.32)
- 14.148 Two sub clauses in Rule 17 that pertain to disciplinary matters and take over by Government, 17.12 and 17.13 require careful consideration. The takeover of management does not figure in the Constitutions of the other two Akademis. We believe that whatever the provocation, an Akademi must not be run by Government, and these provisions should be removed. (Chapter 7.34)
- 14.149 Clause 17.11 of the Constitution on disciplinary matters and Clause 17.14 on appeals are not appropriate for being part of the Constitution. They should form part of the service rules and the conduct and discipline rules. The provision of the disciplinary action being taken on the complaint of 50 artists is improper as it prevents the genuine complaint of a smaller number being considered and encourages petition gathering and groupism. The rule regarding the removal of the Chairman or the Vice-Chairman is unnecessary and the wording infelicitous; in any case, as for the Chairperson, the President of India being the appointing authority, has the authority to remove him. (Chapter 7.35)
- 14.150 As a matter of policy, the Akademi should not be a landlord renting out space to support individual artists. The demand today for urban space is so high and urban property so expensive, that "squatting" is not unexpected. The common studio system could continue but not for any long term use. (Chapter 7.37)
- 14.151 No person who is a member of the GC or of any of the committees shall accept any commercial/ pecuniary benefit from the Akademi including the use of any tangible assets of the LKA. (Chapter 7.38)

- 14.152 A major centre for cultural activities including tribal and folk arts should be developed at Garhi, which would cover traditional art forms from all over India. This would involve the contribution of all other relevant institutions of the MOC, especially the other two Akademis. Some of the space could be used for interdisciplinary academic work of the three Akademis. The LKA should prepare a plan of action to proceed in this direction. (Chapter 7.39)
- 14.153 Government should set up a Committee of eminent persons, who would be experts in various disciplines, to take stock of the Akademi's collection. The group should (a) ensure the authenticity of the collection, (b) segregate the work of the highest quality (as compared, say, to most of the work at camps), (c) ensure proper management of the works. The experts should complete their work in a time bound manner. (Chapter 7.40)
- 14.154 The LKA also suffers from a lack of space to store its treasures. Elsewhere in our Report, we have recommended that new space be created for the storage and display of the Akademi's collection. (Chapter 7.41)
- 14.155 There is no law in India to protect works of art in public spaces. The LKA must set up a group to study this matter and work towards the enactment of a suitable law. It should examine the present state for public art in the country and take steps to popularise its best practices.(Chapter 7.42)
- 14.156 The staffing of the LKA defies understanding. The expertise in the visual arts in LKA is negligible, indeed pathetic. The Akademi has appointed two senior Consultants for administrative and financial matters, but Consultants are also required in the programmatic aspects of the Akademi, an area where expertise is woefully lacking. (Chapter 7.43)
- 14.157 There are eight main areas of activity for the Akademi. These are research, exhibitions, publications, programmes, management of the Regional Centres, management of the Permanent Collection, scholarships and grants, administration, and accounts. Additional positions at the level of DS to handle each area of activity need to be created and filled by contractual appointment of competent people. The MOC set up a small group of experts to work out the recruitment norms for these senior positions. The LKA must have an expert to look after each significant area of activity of the Akademi. The first task of the LKA should be to appoint a Registrar for its collection. The Akademi must reorganise its manpower within six months and find contractual expertise from outside. (Chapter 7.44, 7.45)
- 14.158 The staff is extremely "bottom heavy". The 1:4 ratio in cost of wages for senior and junior staff is indicative of a lack of balance in the staffing of the LKA.

The existing staff needs to be and given a short course in rudimentary aspects of art appreciation, art management and art history. We also recommend that the staffing pattern of the Akademi is given a total overhaul. (Chapter 7.46)

- 14.159 The MOC should do a performance audit urgently by a team of outside experts and take further corrective steps. Such an audit must be done every two years starting 2014-15. (Chapter 7.47)

National School of Drama

- 14.160 A fresh look at the mandate of the NSD would enable it to rediscover its original intention. As with other institutions that we have considered, the NSD too should contemplate forming a vision statement and then a mission statement to bring focus to its role as India's premier teaching institution in theatre. (Chapter 8.4)
- 14.161 This vision must be articulated by the Society, the governing council of the NSD. The Society has no role in assessing the quality of work produced by the School, or in critiquing the academic systems. The Society does not meet the Academic Council. We believe it must also interact with the Academic Council at least once a year to understand relevant academic issues. The Society, the Academic Council and outside experts must work together to improve the standards of the institution. (Chapter 8.5)
- 14.162 The Chairperson, who is appointed by the Government, may under the present rules get an extension. There should be no extension of the term of the Chairperson. A very long term of 8 years, or more, can lead to entrenched vested interests developing. As with the three Akademies the term of the Chairperson should be 3 years should be made co-terminus with the other non-official members of the Society. The bylaws should be amended to ensure this limit is set. To avoid insularity, at least a third of the non-official members should be from outside the NSD alumni fold. (Chapter 8.6)
- 14.163 The NSD has now decided that it does not have the wherewithal to run any regional centre. It has proposed in the 12th Plan that the MOC sets up centres in each State, an extremely impractical step. Once again, the NSD seems to have come up with a proposal without examining its pros and cons. It should continue with the regional centres and at least get the one for the South functioning immediately. (Chapter 8.12)

- 14.164 In view of the circumstances narrated in the Annexure, we strongly urge that the MOC should not go ahead with such a policy of Centres in each State, a scheme that seems to be insufficiently thought out. Only Rs 10 crores has been proposed annually for this purpose in the 12th Plan. It should use the funds available to set up the 5 Centres as originally proposed and not more till their success is established. Since the NSD is not willing or not in a position to set them up, the MOC might locate eminent theatre persons in the different locations earlier chosen to help set up these Centres. They may be either called the NSD of that city, such as NSD, Bangalore, for example, or a School of Theatre to consciously remove them from the shadow of NSD, such as the Bangalore School of Theatre. A Society should be formed in the city concerned with a Chairperson and Director, and perhaps other theatre experts, administrators, academics. This Society should be asked to set up the centre. (Chapter 8.13)
- 14.165 The NSD should avoid the tendency of taking a decision and then spending years before discarding it. (Chapter 8.14)
- 14.166 But we must recommend that there has to be a complete revamp of the teaching programme of the NSD. We offer two suggestions in this regard. There could be two streams of study. First, since a new student already has a three years' basic degree and proficiency in the theatre, the next step should be a two year programme at a Masters level. A third year would be at an MPhil level, and of strong academic content. The second would be of students who would join after schooling, and either leave after a diploma in one year or go on to get a three year degree in theatre. In this case, the end of the second year and much of the third year could be given over to practical work through productions. These students could be offered experience through the Repertory. (Chapter 8.18, 8.19)
- 14.167 The suggestion we are making allows for two types of alumni, one with high academic skills and the other with more stage oriented capacity. The regional centres could act as feeders for the MA level programme in Delhi. Whatever be the final outcome, the MOC must set up, once and for all, a Committee to finalise the structure of academic work at the NSD. And a new programme should begin from the academic year 2015-16. (Chapter 8.20)
- 14.168 It is bizarre and administratively incorrect that two units of the NSD should be continued in the same city as parallel offices. Our Committee is of the view that, having come so far, the Regional Centre should continue and be fully set up. We recommend that the RRC should be merged into the Regional Centre/Bangalore Chapter immediately, from 2014-15, and the former RRC disbanded. (Chapter 8.22)

- 14.169 We would recommend that, utilising the funds provided for the North-East, the students at Sikkim should be enabled to perform in other parts of the country, so that there is a process of theatre enthusiasts learning from each other. In fact a festival of plays from the North East annually in another part of the country should be encouraged. (Chapter 8.23)
- 14.170 Another issue relevant to any regional activity is that of language. The NSD functions in Delhi with Hindi and English as the languages of teaching, but its productions are only in Hindi. One of the issues that has been a matter of debate is the language of teaching and performance in any regional centre. Since a Regional Centre, even if set up in a Zone, cannot restrict admissions from across the nation, the language of teaching could continue to be in Hindi and English. Productions could also largely be in Hindi, but could include English, and at times, the language of the State in which the Centre is situated or which is represented by a large majority of the students. There is no studied benefit to a single language. (Chapter 8.24)
- 14.171 Language is not a barrier to good theatre. In fact, language is only one aspect of the production. It is the quality of the dramaturgy, the acting, the direction, the sets, lights, sound effects and other technical inputs that create theatres of excellence. We believe that any regional centre to be set up would have experts who speak different languages, including no doubt Hindi and English to teach in. The Regional Centres, whether set up by the MOC directly or through the NSD, should encourage language theatre though the main language of teaching would remain Hindi and English. (Chapter 8.26)
- 14.172 The average cost of each production of the NSD is about Rs 12 – 15 lakhs, or even more. This is without taking into consideration other indirect advantages of the support system that the repertory enjoys. Quality is an intangible assessment, but it may not be entirely incorrect to suggest that other groups The MOC should have the costing of the productions of the NSD checked by outside experts as part of a performance audit. (Chapter 8.28)
- 14.173 The Repertory holds a Summer Theatre Festival in Delhi, with about 9 or 10 productions. There is a skewed geographical distribution and uneven inclusion of plays for the festival. This is a bias that NSD seems to be inattentive to and must rectify. (Chapter 8.29)
- 14.174 The Repertory needs to consider what should be done to improve its image. It needs publicise its performances adequately. It needs to seek out good scripts and not from abroad. The NSD needs to improve its pay structure because only then would better actors perform with the Repertory. It would be good if NSD were to do an in depth study of its own production efforts. For a start, it must film

and document all productions of the NSD. This must be placed on the website of NSD. There must thereafter be an in depth assessment of the performance of the Repertory. The website should be open to the public to review these productions and this should be taken as feedback by the NSD. (Chapter 8.30)

- 14.175 The children's theatre wing, the TIE Co., of the NSD is a part of its Theatre-in-Education programme. It has performed 32 plays with over 1000 shows, somewhat of an achievement. It holds summer workshops and further Sunday Club activities where children devise their own performances. This is no doubt a laudable intention. But children's theatre is not only a matter of improvisation leading to production. Since the productions are ticketed public performances, there cannot be any semblance of amateurism, especially not from the National School. Secondly, the difference between theatre for grownups and for children is in the content and the script. The other facets remain the same. If so, it is necessary that, for its ticketed performances, the TIE should locate good scripts, be professional in production and not be self-indulgent. (Chapter 8.31)
- 14.176 Our Committee is of the view that the entire approach to festivals needs review by the NSD. The trend of increased spending on the BRM needs to be curbed. The BRM must be limited in the number of plays performed. The payments then to the performing troupes could be enhanced. The NSD should also not be in the business of financially supporting other institutions to hold festivals. We would only propose that it does not dilute its primary role as an academic institution. On a thumb rule, the cost of the expenditure on the BRM and other festivals should not be more than approximately 10% of the total budget of NSD. (Chapter 8.34)
- 14.177 There are other theatre practices outside, and not only in the NSD tradition. Excellent work is done in some language theatres and now on the English stage. As short term visiting faculty, some of these experts should be invited to the NSD to interact with the students. (Chapter 8.35)
- 14.178 The NSD does not have a playwriting course since its inception, and often falls back upon classics of Western drama in translation. A course in playwriting must be introduced. Otherwise it would remain a major gap in the syllabus of the institution. (Chapter 8.36)
- 14.179 The NSD should invite eminent playwrights of all languages to be part of the school on a regular basis. These may be short term workshop assignments or a longer term association. (Chapter 8.37)

- 14.180 The cost of administering the NSD is significantly rising. This trend has to be reversed. The MOC must examine the reasons for such a rise in administrative costs. (Chapter 8.38)
- 14.181 The NSD has not been able to find a suitable registrar. It would be easier for the NSD to offer the job of Registrar to a suitable young person with skills in management. The recruitment rules need to be changed urgently. (Chapter 8.39)

National Galleries of Modern Art

- 14.182 The MOC has not made sufficient efforts to find Directors for the NGMA at Bangalore and Mumbai. If there are rules, in filling up posts, that the DOPT found impossible to revisit, even for the better administration of a Government institution, its own fundamental rules are being flouted by the continuous, long term additional charge arrangements. Besides, since officers from an autonomous body are looking after Government institutions, they have had difficulties in handling certain administrative and financial responsibilities. (Chapter 9.8)
- 14.183 It is essential to appoint full time Directors at the two NGMAs in Mumbai and Bangalore urgently. Not only are these important institutions of visual art, they represent, in some way, the working of the Central Government in two important cities. The value of the artwork they hold is also very high. We believe that the MOC must leave no stone unturned to place two full time Directors at NGMA Bangalore and Mumbai in the next six months. (Chapter 9.10)
- 14.184 The NGMAs may be placed in an autonomous institution called the National Council of Galleries of Modern Art, the NCGMA for short. The DG, a position recently created, would head the Council, which would set up more and more galleries across India. The advisory bodies for each Gallery would remain and actually provide technical and creative support to each institution. The coordination between the Galleries would improve. The DG would be a person of eminence and be able to command the respect of his own Directors and of his peers in the art world outside. The autonomy that the NCSM enjoys would be available to the NCGMA. (Chapter 9.16)
- 14.185 We are happy that after many years Government has set up an art acquisition committee comprising eminent artists. As far as possible the selection process and the list of acquisitions should be informed to the public through the website of the three NGMAs. (Chapter 9.21)
- 14.186 In the setting up of the Art Acquisition Committees, the primacy of Delhi can be observed. The artists for the Delhi NGMA have a role in purchases for

Mumbai and Bangalore, but not vice versa. The Committee for art purchase must be one, and that all members are treated as equals. (Chapter 9.22)

14.187 The staff position, especially in Mumbai and Bangalore, requires immediate strengthening. The administrative positions must all be filled up as also positions on the programmatic side. If any posts need formal renewal the MOC must get that done urgently. The MOC must make a special effort to find people to take up these positions. (Chapter 9.23)

Zonal Cultural Centres

14.188 One person from the proposed culture pool should be placed in each ZCC for coordination with the Akademis and the MOC. This person should be the nodal point for interaction between the ZCCs and the three Akademis, though she/he would be under the administrative jurisdiction of the Director of the ZCC. (Chapter 10.5)

14.189 We agree entirely with the Aiyar report that the Governor of the host State should not be the Chairperson of the Centre. The Governor, as a Constitutional functionary, has many other tasks and important affairs of the State which would keep him/her busy. Therefore, an eminent artiste should be the Chairperson. But it is also possible to place an eminent administrator in that position because of the administrative coordination which is required. (Chapter 10.6.)

14.190 At the annual meeting which the Ministry should hold, spread over two days, of the various cultural institutions, at least half a day should be spent in coordinating the work of the ZCCs with the national bodies. This would also be a kind of recognition of the ZCCs, and bring them centre stage. (Chapter 10.7)

14.191 The proposal for the creation of a new Akademi is clearly because tribal and folk art forms have not received sufficient encouragement from the three Akademis, more importantly here the SNA and the LKA. Work in rural and oral literary traditions have also not found much space in the SA. But we believe that our task is to propose synergy between institutions, and not create silos. We believe that the creation of another Akademi will not resolve the problem of insufficient emphasis of tribal and folk forms by the existing Akademis. Instead, it will create another stream and never the twain shall meet. (Chapter 10.9)

Indira Gandhi National Centre for the Arts

14.192 We believe that there should be a maximum time limit for any person to be a Trustee. As with the maximum period proposed by us for the Akademis, the

Trusteeship at the IGNCA should be a maximum of two terms, not consecutive. This will require an amendment to the Trust Deed. (Chapter 11.1)

- 14.193 The aims and objectives of the IGNCA are indeed lofty, somewhat esoteric and very wide ranging in their mandate. The IGNCA should study its own aims very closely to see whether the direction it is taking matches the objectives set out by the founders. (Chapter 11.2)
- 14.194 The IGNCA has 8 centres of activity, according to its Programme Advisory Committee's action plans. However, there are only 6 'functional units', which includes the administrative support wing. The other 5 functional units are the first 5 out of the 8 centres of activity mentioned earlier. The IGNCA should study its own structure of academic work as it has developed and place its activities and systems in a correct organisation structure. (Chapter 11.3)
- 14.195 The IGNCA should examine the prospect of creating a system of career progression for its scholars so as to avoid stagnation. It is also necessary to bring in young scholars, on contractual appointments of not less than five years to provide stability in the academic system. At the same time, the IGNCA should also create a scheme of short term fellowships for young people. (Chapter 11.4)
- 14.196 The IGNCA should improve its public relations effort. It must catalogue its output of research work and place it on its website. (Chapter 11.6)
- 14.197 In matters of administration, there are two areas which need the urgent attention of the management. There has to be an attempt to reduce the number of Group D staff and at the same time retrain and redeploy them for better contribution to the Centre. The second is the need to manage its real estate better. There has to be a policy decision on the use of the very expensive prime property that the IGNCA owns but does not put to sufficient use. (Chapter 11.7)
- 14.198 The IGNCA should make a special plan to augment and renovate the facilities at the Southern Regional Centre urgently. (Chapter 11.10)
- 14.199 The IGNCA must provide more funds to the SRC, and delegate higher financial and administrative powers to it. It must appoint immediately an Administrative Officer and an Accounts Officer. This cannot brook any delay. (Chapter 11.11)
- 14.200 Academic work at Bangalore must be strengthened. At least two Research Officers must be appointed. Specific areas of work, in other words, streams of research activity must be sited and action to set up groups of researchers initiated.

In addition, for programme management, a Programmes officer must be appointed, if necessary on a contract basis. (Chapter 11.13)

- 14.201 The SRC must have a local advisory body comprising eminent academicians, persons from the visual and performing arts and administrators, somewhat on the lines of the NGMA (Chapter 11.14)
- 14.202 We recommend that some land from the IGNCA be used for the purpose of creating a new cultural space which would include facilities for the three Akademis. One would be a library run by the SA, another an exhibition-cum-storage area for the LKA and the third a performance space for the SNA. (Chapter 11.16)

Centre for Cultural Resources and Training

- 14.203 We recommend that the Chairperson be a person of high academic calibre and an expert in cultural research. Further, the position of Vice-Chairperson should be filled up immediately as per the procedure laid down. (Chapter 12.2)
- 14.204 The CCRT must be administered by persons of considerable merit and stature. We recommend that the level of representation in the Board be raised and only the Secretary to the State Government or the State's Commissioner Education should be the State's representative. (Chapter 12.3)
- 14.205 The CCRT has had impact assessments done of some of its programmes, such as the Teachers' Training Programme and the Cultural Talent Search Scheme. But these were done in 2002, and certainly need to be done again. (Chapter 12.6)
- 14.206 The courses of the CCRT must be revisited and a fresh curriculum drawn up. The CCRT should work in partnership with specialists from the NGO sector to improve the entire system especially the syllabus and teaching programme.(Chapter 12.7)
- 14.207 The staffing of the entire CCRT especially the regional offices be studied and improved. (Chapter 12.8)
- 14.208 A very strong local Advisory Committee should be set up for each of the three regional centres. One had been set up for Hyderabad. It needs strengthening, with academic members who would be able to guide the Centre forward in

programmatic matters. The other two centres must have similar Advisory bodies. (Chapter 12.9)

14.209 The post of Director General has been vacant and an in-charge arrangement has been in place for many years. There seems to have been unnecessary delay in creating the recruitment rules for the post. The MOC must complete this process immediately. (Chapter 12.10)

14.210 In absolute terms, the expenditure on salaries and such administrative expenses have gone up by excessively. This is a matter of concern. (Chapter 12.11)

14.211 The present academic staff of CCRT is totally inadequate to take a leap forward. It has been a status quo situation, comfortable with some low level, repetitive work. But the higher levels of academic work that we can expect from the CCRT needs a total revamp of its expertise. (Chapter 12.12)

14.212 There is no organisation under the MOC which specialises in certain areas of research. The IGNCA tends to work in certain areas. The CCRT should collate data on cultural matters, and take up baseline data surveys on all matters relating to the culture of India. (Chapter 12.14)

14.213 The CCRT can become a centre for major academic work in all aspects of cultural theory, international cultural relationships, cultural industries and so on. The first step towards this was the starting of the Kamala Devi Chattopadhyay Memorial Lecture series where very eminent personalities and academicians have been invited to speak. A lecture and talks programme becomes a regular, perhaps monthly, feature and not just an annual one. (Chapter 12.15)

14.214 The CCRT can play a significant role in the work of the MOC. But that requires a total change in the approach of the Ministry and a major revamp in the functioning of the CCRT. While the basic programme of training teachers and students may continue at one level, there has to be an upward shift into cultural research and seminal academic work. (Chapter 12.16)

14.215 The Ministry should set up an expert group to study the feasibility of modifying the role of CCRT approximately on the lines that we have proposed. It will require a strong administrator and academic experts working in tandem to bring about the change. The Centre for Cultural Resources and Training should become the Centre for Cultural Research and Training (Chapter 12.17)

Conclusions: The Larger Canvas

- 14.216 The MOC must begin its change process with the axiom that our culture celebrates our diversity; there must not be a false feeling of the superiority or supremacy of Delhi. We are all equal partners in the journey of our nation. (Chapter 13.7)
- 14.217 Management of change requires special effort. Our Report will not bring change if the Ministry treats it with indifference. Any perception that a formality has been observed by setting up a Committee to satisfy a Parliamentary directive would be unfortunate. Therefore the MOC must dirty its feet by wading into the muddy waters of reform. And so we make our final recommendations. A Committee to implement the recommendations we have made should be set up under the Additional Secretary. The Committee should include some officials, especially from the Akademis, but at least two external experts to ensure that an outside perspective is available. For each institution covered by our Report, a small group must be set up to study the changes required in detail and set about bringing them, into effect. We believe that all the changes we have proposed can be brought about in approximately two years. (Chapter 13.8, 13.9)
- 14.218 There are many institutions of the MOC other than those that we have examined. Many of them require close scrutiny. Similar exercises may be done with each one of them. Most essentially, performance audit of each institute must be done, and on a regular basis. (Chapter 13.10)
- 14.219 The officer to be appointed as the public relations officer of the Ministry must also be given the responsibility of following up on the progress of implementation of our Report. Even before the post is created, one of the present Deputy Secretaries should be given this task. The report should be placed on the website of the Ministry for wide public discourse. And, unless otherwise directed by the Departmental Related Parliamentary Committee, the MOC should send a report once every three months of the progress of implementation to that Committee. (Chapter 13.11)

14.220 Change must begin with the MOC. There is never enough emphasis to this. We need the probity of intention and the boldness of action to carve out a new path. Our administrators must realise that lethargy, indifference and dishonesty must have no role to play in the administration of culture. Otherwise, in today's world, it will lose its relevance. Individuals come and go, the institution must remain. To be of relevance, our cultural institutions must transform themselves. That can happen only if there is honesty of purpose in the MOC that spreads to the management of all these institutions. (Chapter 13.12)

Sd (O P Jain) Member	Sd (Ratan Thiyam) Member
Sd (Namwar Singh) Member	Sd (Sushma Yadav) Member
Sd (Sanjeev Bhargava) Member	Sd (K K Mittal) Member-Secretary
Sd (Abhijit Sengupta) Chairman	