A meeting of the National Appraisal Committee (NAC) was held under the Chairpersonship of Shri Yogendra Tripathi, Secretary (Culture) on 28th Feb, 2020 at New Delhi. The list of participants is annexed.

2. At the outset Chairman welcomed the participants of the meeting and Member Secretary, NAC briefly explained the salient features of the Tagore Cultural Complexes Scheme to all the participants.

3. The committee thereafter deliberated upon the Agenda Items and took the following decisions:

1. **ITEM No. 1**: Confirmation of minutes of the NAC meeting held on 16.04.2019.

   The Minutes of the earlier meeting of NAC held on 16th April, 2019 were confirmed.

2. **ITEM No. 2**: Project recommended by the Sub-Committee and due for final recommendations of the NAC:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No.</th>
<th>Project Authority and brief of the Project.</th>
<th>Recommendations of Sub-Committee</th>
<th>Recommendations/Decision of NAC</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Construction of New Tagore Cultural Complex at Nago Puttu, Dree Ground, Ziro Division, Lower Subhansiri Distt., Arunachal Pradesh.</td>
<td>Certain technical shortcomings were found in the DPR which was further rectified by the project authority. Thereafter, Committee finds the project fit &amp; hereby recommends to release ₹5.40 crores [out of the total Central share of ₹10.80 crores (90% of the 12.00 crores which is total cost of the project)] as an amount of 1st installment in favour of the project</td>
<td>NAC after thorough evaluation/discussion with the Project Authority/Architect who made a presentation about the project and taking into account the recommendations of Sub-Committee has recommended the project with the total cost of the project as ₹12.00 crores and directed to release ₹5.40 crores as an amount of 1st installment out of the total Central Share of ₹10.80 crores which is 90% of the total cost of the project i.e ₹12.00 crores. In addition, NAC has suggested following technical modifications to be mentioned invariably in the...</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Matching share of the project authority: ₹1.20 crores.

Total Area of the Project: 19,660 Sqm.

Project Components: Open Stage for performance, Cafeteria, viewing Gallery and Auditorium with Seating capacity of 350 seats along with Display area, Rehearsal Rooms, Green Rooms etc.

authority and the project proposal may be placed before the National Appraisal Committee (NAC) for the final recommendations.

sanction letter to be implemented by the project authority within three months post which review will be done by the Ministry:
(i) Back of the stage design to be modified in order to provide more wing space which can be done by removing the walls of the stores on either side.

(ii) The width of seating area could be reduced and one more row of seats at the back could be added in order to improve viewing/sight angle.

(iii) Acoustics & stage machinery treatment to be kept in mind while designing with latest technology.

(iv) The guidelines of National Building Code (NBC), 2016 has to be followed in the construction work.

---

3. ITEM No. 3: Status of the projects recommended by the NAC in its last meeting held on 16.04.2019.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Sl. No.</th>
<th>Project Title, Project Authority and brief of the Project.</th>
<th>Recommendations of the NAC meeting held on 16.4.2019</th>
<th>Recommendations of the NAC meeting held on 28.02.2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>CHENNAI</strong></td>
<td>Construction of new Tagore Cultural Complex at Mypore, Chennai.</td>
<td>NAC after thorough discussion recommends the project for total cost of ₹5,82,34,967/- [as per the recommendation of inspection report submitted by AS&amp;FA(C)] out of which 60% i.e ₹3,49,40,980.20/- will be the Central Share and rest of the amount will be organisation’s matching share in the instant project subject to the condition that the shortcomings pointed out by the inspection team in their report should be corrected by the organisation (from their own resources/funds)</td>
<td>(i) NAC after thorough evaluation/discussion in consonance with earlier recommendations of PAC &amp; erstwhile NAC and after considering the representations and Audited Annual Accounts submitted by RR Sabha has recommended an increase in the total cost of the project to ₹9,94,05,067/- from ₹5,82,34,967/- earlier.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(i)</td>
<td>Project Authority: Rasika Ranjani Sabha.</td>
<td></td>
<td>(i) NAC has accepted RR Sabha’s representation regarding earlier deduction of donation amount taking it as their internal</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Member of the R.R Sabha) along with a certificate that necessary changes suggested by the inspection committee has been complied with. Funds will be released to RR Sabha only after compliance to this effect and prior approval of Deptt. of Expenditure, Ministry of Finance.

resources and has added ₹4,07,00,000/- (donation received by RR Sabha) & ₹4,70,100/- (expenditure incurred on Miscellaneous expenses) to the earlier recommended project cost. 

(iii) Out of the new enhanced project cost of ₹9,94,05,067/-, 60% i.e ₹5,96,43,040.20/- will be the Central share and rest of the amount will be organization’s matching share in the project.

(iv) However, NAC did not find merit with the rest of the financial demands claimed by RR Sabha.

PUNJAB

(ii) Upgradation of open Air Theatre to a Tagore Cultural Complex at NZCC, Kalamgram, Manimajra, Chandigarh, Punjab.

Project Authority: NZCC, an autonomous organization under Ministry of Culture.

Total Project cost : ₹10,33,40,475/-

Amount of Assistance Sought: ₹6,20,04,285/-

Area of the Project: 1750 Sq mtrs.

Project Components – an Auditorium of 700 Seating Capacity, Art Gallery, Exhibition area, Rehearsal Rooms, Green Rooms etc.

NAC after having through discussion approves the project with a total cost of ₹10,33,40,475/-, out of which ₹6,20,04,285/- (60% of the total cost) will be the Central Share subject to the condition that NZCC, Patiala will provide all the requisite documents/mandatory clearances from local civic bodies (approval of building plans etc). After receipt of all requisite documents/ clearances, first installment amounting to ₹3.10 crores (approx.) may be released to NZCC, Patiala, Punjab.

This Ministry vide letter 04.06.2019 had communicated NZCC to submit the requisite documents/clearances. However, no response has been received from them so far. Thereafter couple of NAC after thorough evaluation/discussion has opined that last reminder letter to the project authority may be issued requesting to submit all the requisite documents/clearances within 90 days time failing which recommendations of NAC in its meeting held on 16.04.2019 will stand “Cancelled”, case will be closed and no communication from the project authority side shall be entertained thereafter.
(iii) Construction of New Tagore Cultural Complex at Deoghar, Jharkhand

Project Authority: Baba Baidyanath Dham Basukinath Shrine Area Development Authority, Govt. of Jharkhand.

Total Project cost : ₹19.79 crores (approx).

Amount of Assistance Sought: ₹9.00 crores.

Area of the Project: 4.33 acres.

Project Components – an Auditorium & OAT of 500 Seating Capacity, Exhibition Area, Training rooms, Guest house, Rehearsal Hall etc.

NAC after detailed discussions with the project authority/Architect is of the view that project can be recommended with a total cost of ₹19,72,16,835/- [excluding the cost of play equipments in Children Park/ Play Area amounting to ₹6,95,765/-] out of which ₹11,83,30,101/- will be the Central Share subject to the condition that project authority may carry out the suggested modifications in the existing proposal and also furnish the requisite documents [may refer minutes of NAC meeting for suggested modifications & asked requisite documents].

This Ministry vide letter 30.05.2019, 24.06.2019 & 08.07.2019 had communicated the project authority to submit the requisite documents/compliance report of suggested modifications. In this regard two D.O letters dt 09.07.2019 & 10.07.2019 has also been issued from HCM to Shri Nishikant Dubey, Hon’ble M.P (Lok Sabha) & HCM, Govt. of Jharkhand respectively stating the approval of their project and to submit requisite documents and compliance report on suggestions made by the NAC. However no response has been received from them so far.

NAC after thorough evaluation/discussion has opined that last reminder letter to the project authority may be issued requesting to submit all the requisite documents/clearances within 90 days time failing which recommendations of NAC in its meeting held on 16.04.2019 will stand "Cancelled", case will be closed and no communication from the project authority side shall be entertained thereafter.
4. **Agenda Item NO. 4**: Status of the 22 ongoing Projects under TCC scheme wherein intervention of NAC is required.

NAC after thorough evaluation/discussion has opined the following:-

(i) Projects wherein no construction work has been started yet i.e. (i) Case of Jadavpur University, West Bengal & (ii) Rashtriya Kathak Sansthan (RKS), Lucknow, Uttar Pradesh, a letter may be issued to both the project authorities stating to refund the entire Central Financial Assistance with 10% penal interest.

(ii) Projects which have become (i) Time-Barred, (ii) wherein balance amount of 2\textsuperscript{nd} installment is still left to be released, (iii) wherein requisite documents are pending for release of 2\textsuperscript{nd} installment/closure of the case, a reminder letter to all the project authorities may be issued stating to submit all the requisite documents/clearances/information within 90 days time. NAC also strictly directed the nominated officer(s)/ inspection team(s) to carry out the physical inspection of all such projects immediately wherein the task of the nominated team(s) are to check/ascertain the ground reality of the project, assist the project authorities to make accurate requisite documents in line with this Ministry's direction, ensure timely submission of such documents to this Ministry and to submit final comprehensive inspection/observation report about the project so as to enable this Ministry to take an appropriate decision in each case/projects.

(iii) Projects wherein 1\textsuperscript{st} installment of Central Financial Assistance has been released, construction work is under way and project is not become time barred yet then also physical inspection of such projects should be carried out by nominating appropriate team(s) every six months to check the progress of the work and optimal utilization of Central funds.

5. **Agenda Item NO. 5**: Other issues related to the TCC Scheme.

While reviewing the present composition of Sub-Committee under TCC scheme which comprises of (i) One Architect (ii) One Artist (iii) One Under Secretary level Officer, the NAC felt a need for a representation from CPWD in the Sub-Committee. While re-constituting the Sub-Committee this matter may kindly be taken into consideration by HCM. Meanwhile, the representative from CPWD may be co-opted in the existing Sub Committees.

The meeting ended with vote of thanks to the Chair.

\[\text{(Amita Prasad Sarbhai)}\]
\[\text{Joint Secretary & Member Secretary, NAC}\]

******

MINUTES OF NATIONAL APPRAISAL COMMITTEE MEETING
# ANNEXURE

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

1. **NATIONAL APPRAISAL COMMITTEE MEMBERS**

   1. Shri Yogendra Tripathi, Secretary (Culture) - Chairperson, NAC
   2. Shri Amita Prasad Sarbhai, Joint Secretary - Member Secretary, NAC
   3. Mrs. Neeta Tahiliani, Deputy Secretary, MoHUA (On behalf of Addl. Secy, MoUD) - Member
   4. Mr. Manika Negi, General Manager(P) HUDCO, (On behalf of CMD, HUDCO) - Member
   5. Mr. Nirmal Batra, AGM (P), HUDCO (On behalf of CMD, HUDCO) - Member
   6. Mr. Manoj Kumar, Director (P&WA), CPWD (On behalf of DG (Works), CPWD) - Member
   7. Mr. Abhilash Pillai, (On behalf of Dir, NSD) - Member
   8. Shri Gautam Bhattacharya - Member
   9. Shri Raghav Prakash Mishra - Member
   10. Shri Kamal Bhasin - Member
   11. Mr. Bansi Kaul - Member

2. **LEAVE OF ABSENCE WAS GRANTED TO:**

   1. Principal, School of Planning & Architecture, New Delhi. - Member
   2. Prof. Dr. Jaya Kumar - Member
   3. Shri Ashok Dhawan - Member
   4. Shri Randhir Kumar - Member
   5. Prof. Mohan Maharishi - Member
   6. CMD, NBCC - Member
   7. Shri Avtar Sahni - Member

3. **PARTICIPANTS FROM PROJECT AUTHORITIES:**

   1. Shri Tania Raji, Executive Engineer, PWD Deptt. Ziro Division, Govt. of Arunachal Pradesh.
   2. Shri Kuru Tada, Assistant Engineer, PWD Deptt. Ziro Division, Govt. of Arunachal Pradesh.

4. **OTHER PARTICIPANTS FROM MOC TO ASSIST NAC:**

   1. Shri Deepika Pokharna, Director, P.Arts.
   2. Shri Rajesh Saha, Under Secretary, P.Arts.


MINUTES OF NATIONAL APPRAISAL COMMITTEE MEETING